

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

NASSAU COUNTY LEGISLATURE

FULL LEGISLATIVE COMMITTEE

NORMA GONSALVES,  
Presiding Officer

1550 Franklin Avenue  
Mineola, New York

Monday September 23, 2013  
10:09 A.M.

1

2 A P P E A R A N C E S :

3

4 NORMA GONSALVES,  
Presiding Officer

5

6 RICHARD NICOLELLO,  
Deputy Presiding Officer

6

7 HOWARD KOPEL,  
Alternate Deputy Presiding Officer

8

MICHAEL VENDITTO

9

DENISE FORD

10

JOSEPH SCANNELL

11

FRANCIS X. BECKER

12

VINCENT MUSCARELLA

13

JUDI BOSWORTH

14

WAYNE WINK

15

ROBERT TROIANO

16

17 KEVAN ABRAHAMS,  
Minority Leader

17

18 ROSE MARIE WALKER

18

19 JOSEPH BELESI

19

20 DENNIS DUNNE

20

21 JUDITH JACOBS

21

22 DAVID DENENBERG

22

23 DELIA DERIGGI-WHITTON

23

24 CARRIE SOLAGES

24

25 WILLIAM J. MULLER, III  
Clerk of the Legislature

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

LIST OF SPEAKERS

JOHN WOLHAM, Regional Director, Office of Real Property Tax Services.....	8
KAREN MONTALBANO, public comment.....	40
JOANNE BORDEN, public comment.....	41
PAT BOYLE, public comment,.....	44
BEVERLY VISCONTE, public comment.....	47
PATRICIA KEARNEY, public comment.....	50
PETER SHIELDS, public comment.....	51
GREG MAY, County Executive Office.....	70
BRUCE RATNER, Forest City Ratner.....	76
ROB WALKER, Chief Deputy County Executive.....	103
ED BLUMENFELD, Blumenfeld Development Company.....	83
BRETT YORMARK, CEO for Nets/Barclays Center (Partner/Forest City Ratner).....	93
JOSH MEYER, Pannone, Lopes, Devereaux & West.....	181
LINDA CHIARELLI, Forest City Ratner.....	193
JIM LESTER, senior vice president, Forest City Ratner.....	198
DENNIS JONES, public comment.....	220
LARRY SKLAR, public comment.....	222
DICK O'KANE, public comment.....	225

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

LIST OF SPEAKERS

CARNELL FOSKEY, Commissioner,  
 Nassau County Department of Parks,  
 Recreation and Museums.....239

MARTIN KATZ,  
 Nassau County, Division of Planning  
 Department of Public Works.....243

DOMINIC MINERVA, Minerva & D'Agostino....245

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: We have a  
3 very full calendar today so I'm asking you  
4 to please take your seats. I would ask  
5 Legislator Dennis Dunne to please lead us in  
6 the Pledge of Allegiance.

7 (Whereupon, the Pledge of  
8 Allegiance was recited.)

9 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator  
10 Rose Walker has a request.

11 LEGISLATOR WALKER: If we could  
12 all just have a moment of silence. This  
13 morning we lost one of our Town of Oyster  
14 Bay Sanitation employees. He,  
15 unfortunately, got off the garbage truck and  
16 was hit by a car. He leaves behind three  
17 little girls. He lives in my district. If  
18 everyone can all keep he and his family in  
19 your thoughts and prayers.

20 (Whereupon, a moment of silence  
21 was observed.)

22 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you,  
23 Legislator Walker.

24 We're going to deviate a little  
25 bit this afternoon. Usually we have public

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 comment first, but we have a gentleman from  
3 the Office of Real Property Tax Services,  
4 Southern Region, for the State of New York,  
5 Department of Taxation and Finance who wants  
6 to brief us very, very briefly on the new  
7 Basic STAR Registry Program. It impacts all  
8 of us whether we receive Basic STAR or not.

9 His name is Mr. John Wolham.  
10 John Wolham will you please join us and make  
11 your presentation? I believe we all have  
12 the program in writing here and, Mr. Wolham,  
13 please proceed.

14 CLERK MULLER: Can I just do a  
15 quick roll call?

16 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: I'm sorry.  
17 Yes. That's what happens when you're in a  
18 hurry.

19 CLERK MULLER: Deputy Presiding  
20 Officer Nicoletto?

21 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: Here.

22 CLERK MULLER: Alternate Deputy  
23 Presiding Officer Kopel?

24 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Here.

25 CLERK MULLER: Legislator

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 Troiano?

3 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: Here.

4 CLERK MULLER: Legislator

5 Solages?

6 LEGISLATOR SOLAGES: Here.

7 CLERK MULLER: Legislator Ford?

8 LEGISLATOR FORD: Here.

9 CLERK MULLER: Legislator

10 Scannell?

11 LEGISLATOR SCANNELL: Here.

12 CLERK MULLER: Legislator Becker?

13 LEGISLATOR BECKER: Here.

14 CLERK MULLER: Legislator

15 Muscarella?

16 LEGISLATOR MUSCARELLA: Here.

17 CLERK MULLER: Legislator

18 Bosworth?

19 LEGISLATOR BOSWORTH: Here.

20 CLERK MULLER: Legislator Wink?

21 LEGISLATOR WINK: Here.

22 CLERK MULLER: Legislator

23 Venditto?

24 LEGISLATOR VENDITTO: Here.

25 CLERK MULLER: Legislator Belesi?

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 LEGISLATOR BELESI: Here.

3 CLERK MULLER: Legislator Dunne?

4 He's here. Legislator Jacobs?

5 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Here.

6 CLERK MULLER: Legislator Walker?

7 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Here.

8 CLERK MULLER: Legislator

9 DeRiggi-Whitton?

10 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON:

11 Here.

12 CLERK MULLER: Legislator

13 Denenberg?

14 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Here.

15 CLERK MULLER: Minority Leader

16 Abrahams?

17 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Here.

18 CLERK MULLER: Presiding Officer

19 Gonsalves?

20 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Present.

21 CLERK MULLER: We have a quorum.

22 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Okay, Mr.

23 Wolham.

24 MR. WOLHAM: Thank you very much,

25 Presiding Officer Gonsalves. And thank you



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 to the members of the Legislature for  
3 allowing this presentation today. I promise  
4 I will be brief.

5 A very quick review: The STAR  
6 exemption is the only state funded property  
7 tax exemption and it provides a tax benefit  
8 against recipient school tax.

9 There are two versions; the Basic  
10 STAR which is available to all owners of  
11 property who are primary residents, and then  
12 there is an Enhanced STAR exemption for  
13 seniors.

14 This registration program that I  
15 am here to speak about today only applies to  
16 recipients of the Basic STAR, specifically,  
17 those folks that have been receiving Basic  
18 STAR for 2013.

19 Essentially, if you have received  
20 the Basic STAR for 2013, you must register  
21 anew to keep receiving it in 2014 and  
22 subsequent years. Registration can only be  
23 made through the New York State Department  
24 of Tax and Finance. It can only be made  
25 through one of two methods; either on line

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 or by phone through the call center.

3 This program is going to affect  
4 about 2.6 million recipients of Basic STAR  
5 statewide and, in Nassau County, there are  
6 over 260,000 recipients of Basic STAR. So,  
7 again, this affects a lot of people and we  
8 want to make sure that everyone who should  
9 be receiving Basic STAR continues to receive  
10 it.

11 The reason this program has been  
12 implemented, STAR has been around since the  
13 late '90s and, at this point, there is a  
14 concern that there may be a fair number of  
15 people out there who are either receiving  
16 the exemption inappropriately, or perhaps  
17 are double dipping. There has not been a  
18 comprehensive way to ensure that someone who  
19 is registered and one assessing you is also  
20 not registered elsewhere.

21 So this program is intended to  
22 deal with that circumstances and ensure that  
23 everybody who should be receiving it  
24 continues to get it.

25 Everyone who is receiving Basic

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 STAR in 2013 will receive a letter from the  
3 tax department. Folks in Nassau County,  
4 your letters went out this past Thursday and  
5 Friday. I was just speaking with a  
6 gentleman who got it on Saturday, so,  
7 certainly, by the end of this week you  
8 should receive that letter. Even, for some  
9 reason, you do not receive that letter, that  
10 is not an impediment to registration. I  
11 will explain how that works briefly.

12 Effectively, the letter is going  
13 to provide information on how you register  
14 which, again, is through the department's  
15 website. The application is prominently  
16 displayed on the department's home page or  
17 by calling the department's call center,  
18 which can be reached at 518-457-2036.

19 The letter contains a seven  
20 character STAR code which is made up of a  
21 series of numbers and letter. When you go  
22 to the department's website, you will be  
23 asked to enter a series of numbers that are  
24 displayed on the screen as a security check.  
25 This is simply to ensure that this isn't a

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 piece of spam software trying to access the  
3 application.

4 Once you get through that, you  
5 will enter your STAR code, which will bring  
6 up your property's location. You will, of  
7 course, want to verify that that is indeed  
8 your property. Then it will move directly  
9 into the application itself, the  
10 registration application itself.

11 You will be asked a series of  
12 questions and this will be brief. You will  
13 be asked to enter information for each owner  
14 of record and each spouse residing at the  
15 property even if the spouse is not an owner.  
16 For each of those individuals, you will be  
17 asked, is this property that individual's  
18 primary residence; yes or no.

19 Additionally, for each of those  
20 individuals, you will be asked, does that  
21 individual own a piece of property outside  
22 of New York State that is receiving a  
23 residency-based exemption.

24 The best example of that would  
25 be, there are folks who own property in the

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 State of Florida that receives a Homestead  
3 exemption. That would be an issue because  
4 the Homestead exemption in Florida is also  
5 contingent on that property being that  
6 individual's primary residence, and you can  
7 only have one primary residence.

8 Beyond that, you will also be  
9 asked to enter the social security numbers  
10 for each individual that owns the property  
11 and each spouse.

12 In the event that someone does  
13 answer affirmatively to the question about  
14 owning property out of state that gets a  
15 residency-based exemption, you will be asked  
16 to enter the property address of that  
17 property.

18 Also, Basic STAR, about three  
19 years ago was amended to include an income  
20 threshold. So for the owners and spouses  
21 residing on that property, you will be asked  
22 a question, "does the income based on 2012,  
23 is this adjusted federal gross income more  
24 than \$500,000?"

25 Because if the cumulative income

1                   Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2    is more than half a million dollars, you are  
3    ineligible for Basic STAR. You will be  
4    asked that question yes or no. You will be  
5    asked to provide contact information, a  
6    phone number and email address in the off  
7    chance that the department needs to contact  
8    you for clarification and then you will  
9    submit. That certifies that the information  
10   you input is correct. That will bring up a  
11   certification number which we urge everyone  
12   to print out or copy down because that is  
13   your documentation that you have completed  
14   the registration effort.

15                   As I mentioned, folks in Nassau  
16   County just received these letters. They  
17   were just mailed this past Thursday and  
18   Friday. The mailing statewide began in mid  
19   August and will conclude the end of this  
20   month.

21                   Around December 1st, the  
22   department will send a follow-up  
23   communication to folks who, as of a certain  
24   date, have still not registered. Just a  
25   little reminder that, look, you need to do

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 this by the end of the year. Please don't  
3 forget.

4 The deadline for doing this,  
5 which I want to emphasize, is December 31st  
6 of this year. It's simple. It really takes  
7 no more than five minutes. We urge every  
8 one to do it as soon as you get the letter  
9 so you don't forget.

10 Finally, in January, folks who  
11 will receive the exemption will receive a  
12 letter indicating they are denied. However,  
13 those folks will have a two step appeal  
14 process if they feel they should be  
15 receiving it. The first appeal goes  
16 directly through the Department of Tax and  
17 Finance.

18 The second, if the first is  
19 denied, goes through an entity called the  
20 State Board of Real Property Tax Services.  
21 Finally, sometime after March 1st,  
22 assessor's offices will be notified of the  
23 properties for which Basic STAR should be  
24 removed for the upcoming 2014 roll.

25 This is simply a repeat about

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 what I said about the appeal process. I  
3 just want to stress that in the same manner  
4 that recipients of Basic STAR for 2013  
5 cannot apply through their local assessor's  
6 office, this can only be done through the  
7 Department of Tax and Finance. So, any  
8 appeal of denial cannot go through a local  
9 board of assessment review or, in this case,  
10 the Nassau Assessment Review Commission. It  
11 can only go through the department.

12 In the event that anyone does not  
13 receive the letter or the letter gets  
14 misplaced, the department's website also has  
15 an application to look up your STAR code.  
16 Essentially, you will enter your county,  
17 Nassau. You will enter the township or city  
18 in which you reside. You will go to another  
19 screen where you will enter your first name,  
20 last name, street number, street name, and  
21 zip code, and that will bring up the STAR  
22 code associated with your property.

23 Again, you will want to confirm  
24 that it is your property. Once you do that,  
25 it will bring up your STAR code and you can



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Full Legislature/9-23-13

move directly into the web application.

Communication. The department is in the process of doing a pretty aggressive outreach and, again, part of my appearance here today is for that reason and, once again, thank you very much for allowing this. It's very important. We want to make sure that all Nassau residents get the exemption. The only thing that I would add to this is that there are only two limited circumstances in which residents of Nassau County can apply to the Department of Assessment to receive Basic STAR or Enhanced STAR.

If you are applying for a property brand new, let's say it's a property that you just bought, you never had Basic STAR on that property, that is the only instance for 2014 you can fill out the paper application and make an application to the Nassau County Department of Assessment.

Again, if you already have it you can only go through the Department of Tax and Finance.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 As I mentioned a little earlier,  
3 anyone who is receiving the Enhanced STAR  
4 exemption is not affected by this program,  
5 because the recipients of the Enhanced STAR  
6 exemption automatically have a requirement  
7 to renew each year through their local  
8 assessor's office, in this case, the  
9 Department of Assessment, or by  
10 participating in Tax and Finances Income  
11 Verification Program. An application for  
12 that can be made through the Nassau County  
13 Department of Assessment.

14 So, with that, that really wraps  
15 up my presentation. Again, I want to thank  
16 Presiding Officer Gonsalves and the entire  
17 legislature for allowing this today. We  
18 very much appreciate it and, if local  
19 officials know of public meetings at which a  
20 presentation of this nature would be  
21 beneficial, please feel free to let me know.  
22 You have my contact information. We will do  
23 our best to work that out. So, again, thank  
24 you very much.

25 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 very much. You kept to your word. You said  
3 you would be brief.

4 I have two legislators who would  
5 like to ask a question but, before they do,  
6 I believe all of us on this dais are going  
7 to do the best we can to disseminate this  
8 information to our constituents. We all  
9 have websites. So I believe we certainly  
10 can utilize our websites to get the word  
11 out. Legislator Jacobs.

12 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Thank you  
13 very much. I agree with the presiding  
14 officer. This was very helpful to have you  
15 here.

16 It just so happens that I was  
17 inundated yesterday because I happened to  
18 have been someplace where I saw a couple of  
19 hundred people and some people received the  
20 letter, some people didn't.

21 Now, you're saying they first  
22 started being mailed out on Thursday?

23 MR. WOLHAM: That's correct. My  
24 understanding is that all the letters for  
25 Nassau County went out on Thursday and

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 Friday, the 19th and 20th.

3 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: So that will  
4 explain why I had half yelling, "how do I  
5 fill it out," and the other half saying, "I  
6 never got it," what does that mean?

7 And there are no forms to hand  
8 them, right, they have do this through the  
9 state?

10 MR. WOLHAM: That is correct.  
11 It can only be done through the department's  
12 website or by calling 518-457-2036. There  
13 is no paper applications simply because, by  
14 doing it on line, either directly or through  
15 the call center, there are certain checks  
16 built into the data entry to ensure, for  
17 instance, you have entered 9 numbers for a  
18 social security number. So it's really to  
19 try to secure the information is entered as  
20 accurately as possible.

21 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: I fully  
22 understand and now it will be easier to  
23 answer people. I thank you very much.

24 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator  
25 Ford.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 LEGISLATOR FORD: Good afternoon.  
3 I thank you very much for your presentation.  
4 I understand why the state is doing it and I  
5 commend that you are doing this undertaking  
6 because of the amount of fraud.

7 How is it that you are going to  
8 cut down on the fraud if the people can  
9 still lie on the applications?

10 MR. WOLHAM: That's a great  
11 question. First of all, the creation of  
12 this -- this registration program will  
13 create a database that will reside in tax  
14 and finance. That will have social security  
15 numbers. So, right then and there, just  
16 having that information which previously was  
17 not available, will allow the department to  
18 cross check applicants statewide.

19 Additionally, and while I am not  
20 privy to the specifics, there will be  
21 efforts made to compare this database or  
22 cross reference it, if you will, against  
23 other databases of information to ensure  
24 that people who should not be receiving the  
25 exemption don't.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 The other point is that the  
3 legislature this year also increased the  
4 penalties for what formally would be known  
5 as material misstatements on the  
6 applications. So there will be -- the  
7 consequences of someone doing that will be,  
8 they will be felt more keenly in terms of  
9 the monetary penalties and the years in  
10 which back taxes will be paid.

11 LEGISLATOR FORD: If a resident  
12 misplaced or doesn't receive the letter,  
13 obviously there is a pin number associated,  
14 if they call up, what information will they  
15 be required to give to be able to then file  
16 for the STAR if they don't have the pin?

17 MR. WOLHAM: If they don't have  
18 the STAR code, they can go to what is known  
19 as the look-up application or the website,  
20 or call that phone number. They will be  
21 asked the county in which their property  
22 resides, the town or city, then the first  
23 name and last name of one of the owners.  
24 The street number and street name and zip  
25 code. That should recover a property

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 address which they'll confirm. If they  
3 confirm it, it will bring up a STAR code.

4 LEGISLATOR FORD: My last  
5 question will then be, only because we will  
6 have one of our meetings, and these will be  
7 questions that I know my residents will ask.  
8 When you talk about your spouse, what  
9 happens if you have a couple that's recently  
10 separated and only one spouse right now is  
11 living in the house and maybe they are going  
12 to go for a divorce. What happens at that  
13 point?

14 MR. WOLHAM: If the person is  
15 still an owner of record, my recommendation  
16 would be to list them. But, at that point,  
17 you would note that that individual is no  
18 longer a primary resident. Certainly where  
19 couples are legally separated, that's the  
20 only instance where a couple that's married  
21 could potentially get Basic STAR on  
22 different properties.

23 LEGISLATOR FORD: Okay, make sure  
24 they go through the courts. Thank you very  
25 much, sir.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 MR. WOLHAM: Thank you.

3 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator  
4 Wink.

5 LEGISLATOR WINK: Thank you very  
6 much for being here. First of all, I wanted  
7 to tell you, while you were doing your  
8 presentation, I applied. It's a very simple  
9 process because if I was having any trouble,  
10 you would know about it. It's a very simple  
11 and straightforward process.

12 My one question is, for older  
13 residents who may not be as savvy and who  
14 may have a predeceased spouse who is still  
15 in title. Do they need to list the  
16 predeceased spouse for the purposes of STAR  
17 or can they file, perhaps, without listing  
18 the predeceased spouse?

19 MR. WOLHAM: That's a great  
20 question, and, no, if a spouse or an owner  
21 of record has predeceased but still remains  
22 on the deed, they do not have to enter  
23 information for that individual.

24 LEGISLATOR WINK: Is taxation and  
25 finance going to reach out to them and



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 question why the name is not listed as an  
3 owner?

4 MR. WOLHAM: My understanding is  
5 that based on the cross-referencing they  
6 will do with this information once it's  
7 input, I believe they will have a way of  
8 determining that an individual who still may  
9 be listed on the property may be  
10 predeceased.

11 LEGISLATOR WINK: I would imagine  
12 social security numbers mean if there hasn't  
13 been a tax return filed for someone who is  
14 deceased, it would raise a red flag.

15 MR. WOLHAM: I would tend to  
16 agree with you.

17 LEGISLATOR WINK: Thank you very  
18 much.

19 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator  
20 Bosworth.

21 LEGISLATOR BOSWORTH: Thank you  
22 and thank you for a very informative  
23 presentation.

24 You know, many of the legislators  
25 here working with the Department of

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 Assessment have tax exemption meetings and  
3 sometimes, one of the most frequently sought  
4 exemptions is Enhanced STAR, and the people  
5 from the Department of Assessment are able  
6 right there and then to input it for them.  
7 Will they still have the ability to do that?

8 MR. WOLHAM: If what we're  
9 talking about is folks from the Department  
10 of Assessment having a computer available by  
11 which residents can access the web  
12 application, sure.

13 The one clarification I would  
14 make is, a resident could not submit a paper  
15 application to the Department of Assessment  
16 unless it's a brand new property for which  
17 they have not received STAR. But if they  
18 have gotten STAR in 2013, they couldn't fill  
19 out the traditional paper application and  
20 give that to the department and say, hey,  
21 look, this is what I'm doing to register for  
22 '14. That wouldn't work.

23 LEGISLATOR BOSWORTH: They do  
24 come with their computers and they have  
25 direct access and they do the application

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 with help and, especially, there are seniors  
3 who are not computer savvy, don't have the  
4 ability to go on line. So this would be  
5 actually a great vehicle for them to do  
6 that.

7 MR. WOLHAM: Absolutely. We do  
8 know of some assessor offices -- I work in  
9 the southern region, I do know of some in  
10 our region that have put up an extra  
11 terminal where they keep the department's  
12 website on display and, if someone wants to  
13 do it right there in their presence, they  
14 help them. That's going the extra mile and  
15 I think it's wonderful.

16 LEGISLATOR BOSWORTH: I know also  
17 in the towns we have our receiver of taxes  
18 from the Town of North Hempstead here with  
19 us today, Charley Burman, he does a lot of  
20 reach out to do these kinds of seminars.  
21 Would he be able to provide that same  
22 service?

23 MR. WOLHAM: Sure. There is  
24 nothing to preclude anyone from helping  
25 someone register. That's wonderful. And,

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 yes, Charley has done a tremendous job  
3 reaching out to folks.

4 LEGISLATOR BOSWORTH: Great,  
5 thank you.

6 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator  
7 Dunne and then Legislator Denenberg.

8 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: Just real  
9 quick. I received my letter Saturday  
10 morning in the mail. This morning, I woke  
11 up, dialed that phone number, they said you  
12 have a 19 minute wait so I put my phone on  
13 speaker and went about my business.

14 When the guy came on, he asked  
15 the same question twice, your address, the  
16 number, and bingo, it was done in less than  
17 five minutes, bing, bang, it's done. My  
18 Internet was down so I used the phone and it  
19 was very, very simple.

20 MR. WOLHAM: That's great. Thank  
21 you. Sorry you had such a long wait.

22 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator  
23 Denenberg.

24 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Now I see,  
25 and this is important, and I see it right up

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 front, at the meetings that I've had  
3 regarding tax exemptions, seniors are being  
4 told they've gotten backwards or two  
5 conflicting pieces of information. If they  
6 are on Enhanced STAR already, then they  
7 don't need to reapply for STAR?

8 MR. WOLHAM: They don't need to  
9 reapply through the department. Folks that  
10 are receiving the Enhanced STAR have always  
11 had an annual requirement to reapply through  
12 their assessor's office, in this case the  
13 Nassau County Department of Assessment. The  
14 Enhanced STAR has a much lower income  
15 threshold and that has to be verified  
16 annually.

17 What seniors can do, folks that  
18 are receiving the Enhanced STAR, can opt  
19 into a program known as income verification  
20 through the tax department. It's completely  
21 voluntary but, if they do that, it avoids  
22 their having to submit annual paper  
23 applications to the Department of  
24 Assessment. In their initial application,  
25 by virtue of being approved, they already

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 demonstrated they own the property, it's  
3 their primary residence, so if they sign up  
4 for income verification, which, that  
5 application goes through the Nassau County  
6 Department of Assessment, and that  
7 information is then transferred to tax and  
8 finance, tax and finance annually will  
9 verify their income and provide that  
10 information back to the department in the  
11 form of, yes, they qualify or, no, they  
12 don't.

13 So the nice thing about that is,  
14 it avoids them having to do these annual  
15 paper filings.

16 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Let me get  
17 back to my question and make -- I'm trying  
18 to make what you just said short. If you  
19 apply for Enhanced STAR and you check off  
20 income verification so that your tax return  
21 can be checked, to make sure you can qualify  
22 for Enhanced STAR every year, does that  
23 mean, does that senior, who has checked off  
24 the income verification, need to reapply  
25 this year for STAR, for Basic STAR?

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 MR. WOLHAM: Basic STAR, no,  
3 because you can't get both. If they're  
4 getting Enhanced, they can not get Basic.  
5 You can't get both STARS at the same time.

6 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: I always  
7 thought that Enhanced STAR was STAR plus an  
8 enhancement.

9 MR. WOLHAM: It is in that --

10 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: In my  
11 area, if STAR is 1,200, Enhanced STAR is  
12 usually 2,400.

13 MR. WOLHAM: Exactly so. The tax  
14 benefit of Enhanced STAR is typically about  
15 double the tax benefit of Basic, but they  
16 are separate and distinct exemptions. You  
17 can't have them both at the same time.

18 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: So if you  
19 are Enhanced STAR and check off the income  
20 verification, you don't need to apply?

21 MR. WOLHAM: That's correct. If  
22 you are participating in income  
23 verification, that will be checked by the  
24 tax department. The thing here is, you just  
25 want to make sure you're in that program.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: But if  
3 your income somehow went above that  
4 threshold for Enhanced STAR, then, to cover  
5 yourself, you should probably apply for STAR  
6 as well, Basic STAR?

7 MR. WOLHAM: What will happen is,  
8 if your income goes over the threshold in  
9 one particular year, you will automatically  
10 receive the Basic STAR. As long as the  
11 Department of Assessment leaves you in the  
12 income verification program, the tax  
13 department will continue to check the income  
14 in subsequent years so that if you fall back  
15 under the threshold in the following year,  
16 you will get Enhanced STAR again.

17 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: So if  
18 anyone, before they got this package in the  
19 mail, I know people that have tried to or  
20 have applied for STAR this year previously,  
21 earlier, maybe April, May, June, is that  
22 application good or do they have to apply  
23 again?

24 MR. WOLHAM: I'm sorry, they have  
25 applied for the Enhanced?



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: No. I'm  
3 just talking Basic STAR now. Some people  
4 were told in meetings throughout the summer  
5 that you're going to have to reapply for  
6 Basic STAR and they have done it already.  
7 Before they got your mailing.

8 MR. WOLHAM: So if they've done  
9 it before they got the mailing, I have to  
10 assume that they did it by filling out a  
11 paper application and giving it to the  
12 department. No, that's not going to be  
13 valid. They are going to have to use the  
14 letter or call the call center and register  
15 through that website or by phone.

16 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: So the  
17 website that we just heard about or by  
18 phone?

19 MR. WOLHAM: Right.

20 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: So the old  
21 fashion mail-in application we are not  
22 using?

23 MR. WOLHAM: Right. The only way  
24 they would be using the old fashioned  
25 application is if somebody is applying who

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 never received Basic STAR before. They just  
3 bought the property, never had it on that  
4 property, so in that case they would still  
5 use the paper application. But, otherwise,  
6 no, the paper application won't work for  
7 them.

8 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: If they  
9 did it online a month ago --

10 MR. WOLHAM: It's possible if  
11 they did it on line a month ago then they  
12 should be covered. Again, they would want  
13 to make sure they retain that certification  
14 number that comes out at the end because  
15 that's their proof that they have actually  
16 reregistered. If they have any questions  
17 about it they can call the call center and  
18 the call center reps can verify that they've  
19 completed it.

20 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Thank you.

21 MR. WOLHAM: Thank you.

22 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you,  
23 Mr. Wolham. You're presentation generated  
24 some very good questions and we can be more  
25 informed when we hear from our constituents.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 MR. WOLHAM: Thank you very much  
3 for allowing me.

4 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Now, I  
5 believe at this point Legislator Venditto  
6 has a point of personal privilege.

7 LEGISLATOR VENDITTO: Thank you  
8 very much, Presiding Officer. As you heard  
9 the Presiding Officer say, ladies and  
10 gentlemen, we do have a very busy schedule  
11 today.

12 However, we can never be too busy  
13 to take a moment to reflect on the great job  
14 that our Nassau County Police Officers are  
15 doing for us to keep us safe each and every  
16 day.

17 To that end I'm joined by  
18 Inspector Steven Palmer of the First  
19 Precinct and Officer Andrew Huckslig of the  
20 First Precinct today.

21 People say regularly that there  
22 are heros living among us in this county.  
23 Heroes who don't necessarily look for  
24 recognition, not the kind of people who want  
25 to see their name in the paper or receive

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 any accolades. It's just helping others  
3 because it's the right thing to do.

4 Next to me, Officer Huckslig of  
5 the First Precinct, like all of our officers  
6 in Nassau County, he and the inspector are  
7 putting their lives on the line each and  
8 every day so that we as Nassau residents can  
9 enjoy our lives in a comfortable way.

10 A great example of this dates  
11 back to July 4th of this year when Officer  
12 Huckslig was driving to work, not on the  
13 clock, just on the way to the precinct on  
14 Merrick Road in Bellmore. Officer saw a  
15 vehicle that had clearly been in a  
16 devastating accident with a driver inside.  
17 The car was inflamed and it was a very  
18 ominous scene. He had a choice to make. He  
19 could have passed it on, passed the baton to  
20 somebody who was on the clock, or he could  
21 have been the officer who he is and stop to  
22 take action. He chose the latter.

23 He got out of his car, charged  
24 into the flames and was able to successfully  
25 revive the man in the car and make sure that

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 he was transported to Nassau University  
3 Medical Center.

4 You beat me to the punch because  
5 I was going to turn to the officer who I  
6 have known now for the past few months and  
7 has become a good friend and say to him,  
8 although he doesn't need to hear it, just  
9 how thankful we all are for the job that he  
10 and the men and women who are our Nassau  
11 County Police Department are doing on a  
12 daily basis.

13 Officer, to you, and, to you,  
14 inspector, we do want to extend the thank  
15 you not only for the deed that you did that  
16 day but for everything that you continue to  
17 do to keep us safe. You make us very proud  
18 to be residents of this great county.

19 May God continue to bless you as  
20 you do his work each and every day.

21 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: I believe  
22 Legislator Scannell would like to introduce  
23 us to three very special people.

24 LEGISLATOR SCANNELL: We have  
25 three people involved in scouting. Scouting

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 is just an unbelievable organization, as you  
3 might know. It's one of the best groups. I  
4 was involved in scouting as a kid. I became  
5 an Eagle Scout. We're all involved in so  
6 many different organizations throughout,  
7 being a legislator and as legislators, but  
8 scouting really was the one that taught me  
9 everything that I know today and things that  
10 I continue to learn today.

11 I'm just so proud of first Bob  
12 Statler who is our scout master of Troop 230  
13 in Oceanside. He's in the second row.  
14 Thank you, Bob. Like I said, he's the scout  
15 master of Troop 230 in Oceanside. It's a  
16 volunteer organization as most people might  
17 not know. They put in so many hours. It's  
18 amazing how much time and effort they put  
19 in, away from their families, with their  
20 families, so, Bob, to you, a very special  
21 extra thankful for all the extra work that  
22 you do as scout master of Troop 230.

23 Also, we have with us today Bob's  
24 son Bobby, Junior. He's also joined by my  
25 son, Brian Scannell who is here today too.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 I am so so proud of those two boys. They  
3 are close friends. They have known each  
4 other since cub scouts. Such a long time.  
5 They're incredible boys. They're here today  
6 because they're earning their citizenship in  
7 the community badge.

8 So, as part of that badge, they  
9 have to come in and meet the legislators.  
10 They have to come in and watch a session.  
11 They also have to come in and talk to the  
12 legislators. So today my son and Bobby and  
13 Bob came into the back. We spoke about what  
14 happens in the legislators. We've talked  
15 about that many times, of course, as well at  
16 meetings as well.

17 But I'm just so so so proud of  
18 you, guys. All three of you. Bobby, Bob  
19 and Brian for coming today and earning part  
20 of your badge and for also dedicating your  
21 time to make your town, not only Baldwin and  
22 Oceanside, but Nassau County, just a great  
23 place. Thank you, guys.

24 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Bobby and  
25 Brian, let me say to you that I'm hoping

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 that you are on the trail to Eagle.  
3 Yesterday I happen to be at an Eagle Court  
4 Of Honor. I believe that troop had 86  
5 Eagles during the course of its 30 years of  
6 existence.

7 So, Bobby and Brian, guess what?  
8 You are going to be on that trail to Eagle,  
9 right? They shook their heads. And, dad,  
10 you are going to lead them on that trail,  
11 correct? Thank you very much. Thank you  
12 for being here.

13 Now, we usually have and we still  
14 will have a half hour of public  
15 participation, hopefully those of you who  
16 listened to the presentation by Mr. Wolham  
17 gained some insight as to what the new Basic  
18 STAR program is all about. We will go, it's  
19 now I believe 1:40. We will go to 2:10 with  
20 public participation and then we will go to  
21 the calendar of today.

22 Without any further ado, our  
23 first speaker is Karen Montalbano. Karen,  
24 are you here?

25 MS. MONTALBANO: Thank you for



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 letting me speak. I'm a resident of Baldwin  
3 and I want to talk about the First Precinct.  
4 It's been a long journey, decades long.

5 We now have a plan in front of us  
6 that works for everyone. It works for the  
7 police department, it works for Baldwin and  
8 works for Nassau County. I'm here to ask  
9 you to forget any divisions and let's see if  
10 we can get this thing going and get this  
11 First Precinct built. Thank you.

12 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: You're  
13 welcome. Thank you for coming, Karen. The  
14 next speaker is Joanne Borden.

15 Karen, we did approve the  
16 contract at the last meeting, the committee  
17 meeting for the First Precinct. I think you  
18 would like to know that.

19 Go ahead, Joanne. Sorry for  
20 interrupting you.

21 MS. BORDEN: In defiance of  
22 American principle, you refuse to protect  
23 transgender people from discrimination. I  
24 tried to analyze why and took the Bible  
25 first. Many biblical laws are ignored and

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 only some are observed. Are the obeyed laws  
3 the ones God really really meant?

4 Many people feel God didn't  
5 really mean divorce, adultery,  
6 non-procreative sex, love thy neighbor, and  
7 many many others. The most hypocritically  
8 law is women shall not wear clothes that  
9 pertaineth unto a man. Nearly all girls and  
10 women dress in pants, that seems to be okay.  
11 But when a transgender man wears similar  
12 pants and violates the same commandment, you  
13 condemn them by allowing discrimination  
14 against them.

15 Do you believe God really really  
16 meant some laws only apply to some people?  
17 Ignoring laws and deciding who must obey  
18 other laws makes no sense. Your reason for  
19 not protecting transgender people from  
20 discrimination must be something other than  
21 the Bible. I don't think it's jealousy  
22 because over 20 percent of the transgender  
23 people have incomes below \$10,000 a year.  
24 One third are or have been homeless. Over  
25 28 percent have been victims of a serious

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 assault. Motivated by transphobic hate. No  
3 way can it be jealousy. It is group think?  
4 The phenomenon that people blindly follow  
5 the group.

6 In this state most groups favor  
7 transgender equal rights including 78  
8 percent of the voting public, over 2 million  
9 union members, 547 clergy and many police  
10 chiefs. All groups support transgender  
11 equal rights. It isn't group think. It's  
12 not the Bible. It can't be jealously. What  
13 is left?

14 Although opposition to equal  
15 protection under the law manifested in  
16 politics in this chamber, the root reason  
17 for transgenderism is the maintenance of  
18 white male heterosexual dominance sexism,  
19 but the reason is not important.

20 In America, there is no valid  
21 reason for allowing discrimination of  
22 anyone. Muster your patriotism and pass the  
23 gender definition amendment. Thank you for  
24 listening.

25 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you,

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 Joanne.

3 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: The next  
4 speaker is Pat Boyle.

5 MR. BOYLE: Let me give a little  
6 prelude first.

7 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: First let  
8 me say that my visit to Gateway Youth was  
9 something I will not forget. It was -- I  
10 had a great day, so thank you for the  
11 invitation.

12 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: The kids  
13 enjoyed having you.

14 MR. BOYLE: And I enjoyed being  
15 with them. Thank you. That was a fun day.  
16 We want to keep those fun days going.

17 I hope everybody had a great  
18 summer. I know we did. Norma touched on it  
19 that she was over to our programs as well  
20 too. We did have a very, very good summer  
21 mostly because we got our funding back and  
22 we were able to have a good summer and that  
23 was a very very good thing to be able to do.

24 Just what happened recently is,  
25 we've registered 720 young people for our

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 after school programs which are starting  
3 today. It's a crazy day, first day of  
4 school kind of deal, and I'm looking forward  
5 to getting back and getting that done. So  
6 thanks for getting me on early.

7 One of the things that I did with  
8 the parents though this year, when we did  
9 register them, we gave them all school  
10 supplies. We did the best we could to be  
11 able to help them to get their year off on  
12 the right foot.

13 I would say probably about 30  
14 percent of the people that came to the  
15 program told me that they had financial  
16 difficulties with regard to the program so  
17 their fees were waived and we did everything  
18 that we thought we could do to make it  
19 absolutely right to make this program work.

20 One of the things I did was I  
21 promised them, I promised them that we would  
22 have this program running for the total of  
23 the school year. That we would do it from  
24 the time today, all the way through to the  
25 last day of school.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 Now the possibility of doing that  
3 is there because I know that in the budget  
4 so far that's been submitted to the  
5 legislature from the county executive, the  
6 youth services is funded at the levels that  
7 it was at before any of the cuts. We are  
8 very, very thankful to the administration  
9 obviously for getting that in there.

10 And now, what I'm asking you is,  
11 can you please, you know how great our  
12 programs are. I'm not just talking about  
13 Gateway, I'm talking about all of the  
14 programs within the youth services system.

15 There are some really great  
16 programs in there. I know you know it. I  
17 know you never really wanted to make any  
18 kind of cuts or anything like that because  
19 you do appreciate the programs and you do  
20 appreciate what they do.

21 Please, just leave us in the  
22 budget. Although my colleagues would kill  
23 me, I'm not here asking for more. I'm not  
24 here asking for future considerations for  
25 more. That's not what I'm doing right now.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 Just make it so that our parents can know  
3 that their children are going to be safe  
4 after school and that we won't have the kind  
5 of problems that we did have last year when  
6 we didn't have programs in place. Please  
7 work with us all to be able to make that  
8 happen through 2014 and we will be back  
9 again to say thank you when you do, and we  
10 will also be here in 2015 to make sure you  
11 do it again. Thanks very much.

12 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you,  
13 Pat. Next speaker is Beverly Visconte.

14 MS. VISCONTE: Good afternoon.  
15 My name is Beverly Visconte and I'm here to  
16 speak on the issue of funding for Bay Park  
17 Sewage Treatment Plant. I'm a member of  
18 Operation Splash, an organization dedicated  
19 to keeping the south shore waters clean.  
20 I'm also a member of Sludge Stoppers, a  
21 group formed several years ago when the  
22 videos of the Bay Park Sewage Treatment  
23 Plant spilled into Reynolds Channel and  
24 appeared on You Tube.

25 Since then, the Sludge Stoppers

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 have worked diligently to influence county  
3 officials to make plans for the necessary  
4 upgrades and repairs without privatizing or  
5 selling, offer the plant, to some extent, we  
6 met with some success.

7 Then came Hurricane Sandy which  
8 swamped the Bay Park Sewage Treatment Plant  
9 and even temporarily took it off line  
10 causing dangerous backups in various  
11 communities and damaging and/or destroying  
12 vital equipment in the plant itself.

13 It is now virtually being held  
14 together with bobby pins and rubber bands  
15 and it is still a cause of spills, sewage  
16 spills just one last week. It is clearly in  
17 need of immediate and radical repairs and  
18 upgrades.

19 In addition, recent studies have  
20 shown, studies of the western bays, have  
21 shown that the Bay Park sludge effluent does  
22 not get washed out to sea, as we had hoped.  
23 Even if it's not a spill, it's a regular  
24 effluent, but instead continues to  
25 contaminate, pollute, and kill the marine



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 life in the western bays.

3 In fact, people are unwittingly  
4 still swimming and fishing in these waters  
5 not knowing the contamination that's going  
6 on. The study shows that the only thing  
7 that will deal with this problem is an  
8 outfall pipe extended three miles out in the  
9 Atlantic Ocean where it can more safely be  
10 disbursed.

11 So three things are necessary:  
12 Immediate repairs to dispense with the  
13 trailers and the generators and the bobby  
14 pins and rubber bands that are keeping  
15 things going there. Upgrades to more  
16 effectively deal with the sewage influent  
17 outfall pipe to bypass the bay waters and  
18 bring it out into the ocean.

19 Clearly, this is a public health  
20 issue. In fact, right now, it's a public  
21 health crisis.

22 The funding that was finally  
23 approved earlier this summer, less than one  
24 third of the proposed funding is in no way  
25 sufficient to accomplish these necessary

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 ends.

3 The plant is in critical  
4 condition --

5 CLERK MULLER: Your three minutes  
6 have expired.

7 MS. VISCONTE: The plant is in  
8 critical condition. There is no time to  
9 waste on party politics, no time at all.  
10 Please recognize your next vote as your  
11 opportunity to correct the wrong. It's a no  
12 brainer to put people over politics. Vote  
13 to allocate the adequate and proper funding  
14 to reach these ends. Thank you.

15 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you,  
16 Ms. Visconte.

17 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: Patricia  
18 Kearney from the Bay Park Civic Association.

19 MS. KEARNEY: Hi. I'm Patricia  
20 Kearney from the Bay Park Civic Association  
21 and a member of Sludge Stoppers as well.

22 I'm here today to ask that  
23 politics be set aside to help my neighbors.  
24 Funding for critical electrical  
25 infrastructure at the Bay Park plant must

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 proceed immediately. These communities were  
3 hit hard by Sandy and are still reeling.  
4 Every day you delay this project is another  
5 day of noxious odor, incessant noise and  
6 truck traffic to be endured by the residents  
7 of East Rockaway, Angle Sea, Bay Park and  
8 Oceanside. Every day you delay is another  
9 bad day, another potential opportunity for  
10 this ticking time bomb to fail and once  
11 again spew sewage into our streets and  
12 waterways.

13 Every day you delay is another  
14 day for our communities to not recover from  
15 Sandy. We can rebuild our homes after Sandy  
16 but only this body can rebuild that plant.  
17 Only this body can bring security to our  
18 communities, get it done, fix it,  
19 appropriate the \$326 million. Get it done.  
20 Fix it, please. Thank you.

21 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: Peter  
22 Shields.

23 MR. SHIELDS: The previous  
24 speaker sounded very nice about the whole  
25 thing and I'm happy to see the Boy Scouts

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 here because I happen to be a communications  
3 merit badge counselor for the Boy Scouts.  
4 And they also have to attend a public  
5 hearing where two opposing points of view  
6 are discussed.

7 I don't even know the ladies that  
8 spoke before me, but I'm the next door  
9 neighbor of the sewage treatment plant. I'm  
10 here today because I've had faith, foolishly  
11 had faith for the past year that something  
12 would be done.

13 I realized after the hurricane  
14 what a disaster it was and what had happened  
15 and I read the papers and I have been silent  
16 up till now being the next door neighbor.

17 200 feet outside of my bedroom  
18 windows are a number of generators that go  
19 24 hours, seven days a week. For anybody to  
20 stand in my yard and talk to me or stand on  
21 my front lawn and talk to me, they have to  
22 be yelling at me.

23 I wake up each morning to  
24 headaches. I have never been prone to  
25 headaches before because of the odors. I

1                   Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2     can't open the windows to my house because  
3     of the odors that come off of that sewage  
4     treatment plant.

5                   I wrote you all an e-mail last  
6     week. That was the first time I have ever  
7     spoken about this, sending a video after the  
8     oil leak with the vacuum trucks that were  
9     outside of my house at 6:00 a.m., and I  
10    understand the need to deal with a spill  
11    like that, but there wouldn't be any need to  
12    deal with that spill if the generators  
13    weren't there and this thing wasn't fixed,  
14    if hammers weren't swinging.

15                  In fact, I deal with the noise  
16    and deal with the smells if I knew the  
17    hammers would be swinging and this thing  
18    would who be fixed. The only people that  
19    reached back out to me after that e-mail  
20    last week were Republicans and the  
21    Republicans seem to put this squarely on the  
22    Democrats with holding things up.

23                  I understand the need for  
24    oversight and making sure that we spend the  
25    money appropriately and all that stuff but

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 you're killing me. You're killing my  
3 community.

4 We can't go down in our area  
5 without knowing exactly where we are,  
6 without a GPS, you can take me down  
7 blindfold and I know I'm home because of the  
8 smell. I know by the sound, I can't talk in  
9 my front yard.

10 Legislator Venditto talked about  
11 the busy schedule today. I don't know what  
12 else you have to do. There is no other  
13 business. I know you each go home to houses  
14 where you are able to flush the toilets and  
15 it goes away from you and you don't care.  
16 And I know each of you go home and it may  
17 not smell, maybe it smells like dinner  
18 cooking. It doesn't smell like that at my  
19 house and it doesn't smell like that in my  
20 community.

21 I'm on the front lines. If you  
22 go anywhere around that sewage treatment  
23 plant, it is three or four trees deep  
24 covered immensely. On my side of the house,  
25 two sides of my house face that sewage

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 treatment plant. I'm right on the edge,  
3 right next door to the front gate. There's  
4 nothing planted there. I'm looking at full  
5 view at those generators. There are very  
6 cheap ways to deal with the view. You have  
7 Boy Scouts here. I know a lot of you guys  
8 go to the Courts of Honor. Get them to do  
9 some Eagle project and plant some freaking  
10 trees. It's cheap enough to make that stuff  
11 happen. Aside from that, get those hammers  
12 swinging.

13 There is nothing else you have to  
14 do. Clear your agenda. Fix this problem.  
15 Sooner or later you'll flush the toilets and  
16 it won't go away from you and you will have  
17 a disaster.

18 Sooner or later you're going to  
19 kill this community. You're going to have a  
20 lynch mob on your hands.

21 CLERK MULLER: Your three minutes  
22 have expired.

23 MR. SHIELDS: You've had a couple  
24 of people come and talk about it, but please  
25 get it done. You're killing me. Thank you.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: Legislator  
3 Kopel.

4 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Peter, come  
5 back.

6 MR. SHIELDS: Hi.

7 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Hi. You and I  
8 spoke a little bit earlier today?

9 MR. SHIELDS: Yes, we did.

10 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: I just want to  
11 go over some of those things that we spoke  
12 about.

13 I live near a plant as well. I  
14 live very, very close to a smaller plant but  
15 a plant, nonetheless, and I have lived there  
16 for many years, lived there since 1987. I  
17 will tell you not once have I experienced  
18 the problems that you're experiencing.

19 I know it's a smaller plant but  
20 if it can be done in one plant it can be  
21 done in the other plant. It can be done.  
22 And if it can be done, it has to be done.  
23 No human being should have to experience the  
24 kinds of smells and noise that the people of  
25 Bay Park and beyond the other communities in



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 the areas are experiencing. It's not right.  
3 It's absolutely not right.

4 Of course, we had this problem  
5 with Sandy, but it's time to fix it. We've  
6 gotten experts, as you know, expert  
7 recommendations and we've gotten an  
8 opportunity to rebuild this plant and  
9 rebuild it in a way that it ought to be  
10 built. So it doesn't hurt you. So it  
11 doesn't hurt your family. It doesn't expose  
12 your family and neighbors to disease and to  
13 smells and to the feeling that you can't  
14 stay in your own home. I think you were  
15 very eloquent.

16 MR. SHIELDS: Thank you. I  
17 appreciate it. Even a year before this  
18 hurricane we had what we call the Sunday  
19 smell. Something or another has been  
20 happening there outside with digester tanks,  
21 whatever, I don't know all the technical  
22 terms, but it stunk there on Sundays. It  
23 went away the summer before. After the  
24 hurricane it's all back. It services  
25 500,000 of your constituents. It costs

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 \$700,000 a month to fill those generators.  
3 \$700,000 a month.

4 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: It is an  
5 absolute waste of money. Going beyond that,  
6 those generators, they're a Band-Aid.

7 We've heard from the experts. We  
8 have had a lot of discussion over here on  
9 this panel from experts. And they have told  
10 us in no uncertain terms that this  
11 electrical system is being held together by  
12 scotch tape and baling wire. It could fail  
13 at any time. I'm talking not only about the  
14 generators but the entire electrical  
15 distribution system.

16 So the fact that we are replacing  
17 the small part, relatively speaking, certain  
18 portions of the plant and some of the  
19 equipment, if we haven't got the electricity  
20 to run it, it's not going to do much good.

21 I'm sorry to be telling you these  
22 things because I'm not trying to get you  
23 more upset, any of the people out here. I'm  
24 just trying to appeal to my colleagues to  
25 not delay any more because fixing this plant

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 is just not optional.

3 As you so aptly put it before,  
4 it's a real health hazard. It's got to be  
5 done now. We've heard the reasons that it's  
6 not being done, that's because the  
7 legislature is charged with the  
8 responsibility for supervision.

9 Now, that's true, an oversight,  
10 and that's true, but we're not charged with  
11 the responsibility for micromanaging the  
12 entire reconstruction of this plant.

13 And, by the way, none of us up  
14 here are engineers except for one. We've  
15 got one engineer on this panel and that  
16 engineer, just for the record, has voted for  
17 it because I guess he understands, he gets  
18 it, that this is a problem.

19 Now, you know what, I don't agree  
20 with too many things that Legislator  
21 Denenberg does, but over here he's on the  
22 side of the angels, he's got it right.

23 We've got to get this done.

24 MR. SHIELDS: This is not a party  
25 issue. If you flush your toilet, you are

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 involved. If you went for election to fight  
3 for your constituents, put my face on it,  
4 fight for me, please. You're killing me out  
5 of my house.

6 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Well, you've  
7 got children, have you?

8 MR. SHIELDS: Yes, I have three.

9 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: How old are  
10 they?

11 MR. SHIELDS: 18 and 15 and 13.  
12 They are all embarrassed to have their  
13 friends over.

14 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: They're all  
15 embarrassed, and how's about coming home in  
16 the afternoon after school, it's not too  
17 much fun?

18 MR. SHIELDS: No. We get  
19 headaches.

20 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: How are your  
21 cookouts lately?

22 MR. SHIELDS: I will invite every  
23 one of you over for a barbecue on Sunday. I  
24 cook very well but I challenge you to choke  
25 down the food.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: How is the  
3 resale value on your house doing?

4 MR. SHIELDS: We talked about  
5 that before. I recently went for a  
6 refinance and, the day I went for a  
7 refinance, I had the clean and seed people  
8 come so I was very happy to see a group in  
9 front of my house.

10 Again, I have been silent up to  
11 this point, and there have been protests in  
12 front of my house in promptu every now and  
13 then, people seem to be more organized than  
14 me.

15 So the lady coming for my  
16 refinance took a whole bunch of pictures of  
17 the people protesting in front of my house  
18 and asked all kinds of questions about the  
19 plant. I got turned down.

20 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: That is really  
21 just awful.

22 MR. SHIELDS: I'm not here about  
23 money. Fix the smell. Fix the noise.

24 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: It's not  
25 optional. I also want to point out that

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 we're potentially risking the federal funds.  
3 That we are supposed to get a 90 percent  
4 reimbursement. And, if they don't see us  
5 doing it, and they don't see us doing it  
6 right, we may be risking a good deal of  
7 money over here and we may not be able to do  
8 it after all. That is wonderful opportunity  
9 to get this thing fixed and brought up to  
10 world class standards that we may be  
11 frittering away.

12 If we, God forbid, have another  
13 storm and it hasn't been fixed and we  
14 haven't constructed the facilities that  
15 would allow the rest of the plant to survive  
16 a storm, and we haven't done it because we  
17 are just wasting our time, we may not -- we  
18 definitely won't get the money to rebuild  
19 that again. We may not get the money this  
20 time.

21 I'm sorry to tell that to you,  
22 but it's the truth and you need to hear it.

23 MR. SHIELDS: I appreciate your  
24 time and I appreciate you extending my time,  
25 and I appreciate you speaking up.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 I really wish some of you who had  
3 an opposing point of view would tell me  
4 something that made a little bit of sense.  
5 You all have my phone number. You all have  
6 my email address. Feel free to reach out to  
7 me. I know I've spoken a little bit  
8 passionately here tonight. I'm not trying  
9 to be ridiculous. But I have to hear  
10 something that makes sense to me of why I'm  
11 dealing with this.

12 LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Thank you.

13 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: I just  
14 want to remind my colleagues on both sides  
15 of the aisle that at 2:10 we're ending  
16 public comment.

17 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I  
18 understand. What I was going to say, I'm  
19 not going to engage in any partisanship,  
20 what I'm going to ask is, Mr. Shield, I  
21 apologize for being in and out. There are  
22 multiple things. As you can see, there are  
23 folks here from the Coliseum, there are  
24 multiple things on the calendar today. So  
25 my attention has been back and forth. It

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 doesn't mean that I have given this issue  
3 any less concern.

4 MR. SHIELDS: I understand.

5 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: And I just  
6 wanted to express to you that if you are  
7 willing to hang out, I am more than welcome  
8 to talk to you a little bit about what our  
9 perspective is. I would be glad to talk to  
10 the group that's here. I would be happy to  
11 do this right now because I think it's  
12 important. I wanted to express that to you.

13 Look, I don't want to get bogged  
14 down in the agenda and partisanship. I can  
15 say a lot of things that are contrary to  
16 what Mr. Kopel just said but I'm not going  
17 to do that because that's going to waste  
18 your time and the folk's people's time in  
19 this audience and I don't want to be engaged  
20 in that.

21 MR. SHIELDS: With all due  
22 respect, and I appreciate Legislator Kopel  
23 reaching out to me and, like I said, the  
24 Republicans are the ones reaching out to me  
25 so far, I'm an independent. I don't care



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 what party you're with. I have no agenda  
3 here to get anybody elected or not elected.  
4 I just want to fix my freaking house.

5 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Okay.  
6 Let's talk right after this item. I will  
7 walk down to you and we'll go out to the  
8 back and we'll have a conversation.

9 MR. SHIELDS: Thank you. I  
10 appreciate it.

11 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Norma, may  
12 I have 30 seconds, please? Everyone else  
13 had --

14 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Should I  
15 time you?

16 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Yes. Sir,  
17 I'm Legislator Denenberg. I voted for the  
18 funding. I'll vote for the funding again.

19 MR. SHIELDS: I appreciate it.

20 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: But it's  
21 not just a matter of funding. It's a matter  
22 of getting the projects done, enhanced odor  
23 control, pumps, effluent pumps. All of  
24 those projects have been on capital plans  
25 since 2009. And you, I saw it, you have the

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 back up generators sitting on a parking lot.  
3 They are supposed to be in a bermed area.  
4 That spill could have been avoided but, the  
5 bottom line is, every one up here needs to  
6 work together with the county executive to  
7 not just fund projects but make sure they  
8 get done.

9 If that means quarterly oversight  
10 by the people up here, which I think the  
11 county executive would welcome, we should do  
12 it, because there are projects which are  
13 already funded that would get those  
14 generators out of a parking lot.

15 That doesn't mean that the  
16 electrical work in the dewatering facility  
17 doesn't need to be done. That's why I'm  
18 voting for it, but, you know what, all of us  
19 need to put it aside, get the projects, not  
20 just funded, but done, period.

21 MR. SHIELDS: If hammers were  
22 swinging, and I was dealing with the smell  
23 and the noise, I wouldn't be here today.

24 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Thanks.

25 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: I just

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 want to make a comment. You opened the  
3 door, Legislator Denenberg.

4 In 2009, those plants were in  
5 terrible terrible condition. And, before we  
6 could even go forward, do other repairs, we  
7 had to fix what was already broken. So I  
8 will tell you --

9 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: It was  
10 \$450 million worth of projects.

11 LEGISLATOR GONSALVES: I did not  
12 interrupt you.

13 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: \$450  
14 million worth of projects.

15 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Don't  
16 interrupt Norma.

17 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: David, I  
18 want to pursue, and there were other people  
19 that wanted to speak during public comment,  
20 but, you know what, we empathize with you.  
21 We have been at the plant several times. We  
22 know the noise from the generator. We were  
23 there. We heard it. There was so much that  
24 we saw since Sandy.

25 In fact, we were there two weeks

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 after Sandy and recently I would say a  
3 little bit more than a month we are back  
4 again.

5 So, we are well aware of what  
6 needs to be done and hopefully we will get  
7 our act together and do it.

8 MR. SHIELDS: Thank you.

9 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: It is now  
10 2:10 and I'm suspending public comment  
11 primarily because we have a presentation by  
12 the Ratner Group that must be made.

13 MR. WEITZMAN: I was the first  
14 one here according to your the clerk.  
15 Mr. Kopel shut me down when I was here two  
16 weeks ago. Wouldn't allow me to speak, now  
17 you are not allowing me to speak again.

18 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: No, no,  
19 no. Your name is here. It has nothing to  
20 do with not allowing you to speak. I did  
21 say 2:10 and 2:10 it is. So we need to move  
22 on. We will get to you, Mr. Weitzman, trust  
23 me. You may want to take an opportunity  
24 after the presentation.

25 At this time the item on the

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 calendar that we shall call I believe is,  
3 number one on the calendar is Item 374-13.

4 It's an ordinance making certain  
5 determinations pursuant to the State  
6 Environmental Quality Review Act and  
7 authorizing the county executive of the  
8 County of Nassau to execute a lease by and  
9 between the County of Nassau as landlord and  
10 Nassau Events Center, L.L.C., as tenant, in  
11 connection with the lease and certain  
12 premises located in Uniondale, town of  
13 Hempstead, said property known as Section  
14 44, Block F, Lots 403 and 351 on the land  
15 and tax map of the County of Nassau, and  
16 authorizing the county executive to execute  
17 a lease and all pertinent documents in  
18 connection therewith to consummate the  
19 lease.

20 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.

21 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Second.

22 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by  
23 Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator  
24 Walker. Before we can go on with the  
25 presentation, Mr. May, I believe we have an

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 amendment in the nature of a substitution,  
3 correct?

4 MR. MAY: That's correct.

5 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: The  
6 amendment was filed September 16, 2013, at  
7 11:23 a.m. A motion, please.

8 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.

9 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Second.

10 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by  
11 Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator  
12 Walker. I guess at this point, all those in  
13 favor of the amendment in the nature of a  
14 substitution signify by saying aye.

15 (Aye.)

16 Any opposed?

17 (No verbal response.)

18 The contract passes unanimously.

19 Any opposed? The amendment passes. It's  
20 now before us. Are you ready?

21 MR. MAY: I am ready.

22 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: I'm sure  
23 lots of people are ready.

24 MR. MAY: I think we're all  
25 ready. It is my pleasure to introduce

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 Nassau County Executive Edward Mangano.

3 COUNTY EXECUTIVE MANGANO: Thank  
4 you, Madam Presiding Officer, Minority  
5 Leader. It's great to be back here at the  
6 legislature to spend some time with you.

7 But, today, we have a great day.  
8 We have the opportunity to turn a vision  
9 into a reality for our new Nassau Veterans  
10 Memorial Coliseum and sports and  
11 entertainment and destination.

12 As you know, the hub and  
13 redeveloping the hub has been the subject of  
14 many failed votes over the last decade.

15 But, one common bond and one  
16 common theme has always been to renovate and  
17 create a world class arena. Today you have  
18 the opportunity to do just that. It gives  
19 you the opportunity to create a world class  
20 arena, a new entertainment district, to add  
21 to development in the hub that we have  
22 achieved over the few years where we now  
23 have the home of the New York Cosmos  
24 practice facility, twin ice skating rinks  
25 under construction, and, of course, the

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 public private partnership with Jet Blue at  
3 Museum Row.

4 We all know the tail of  
5 developing this property but, today, comes  
6 to a very good beginning, if you will. Back  
7 in March of 2013 we issued an RFP. From  
8 March through August of 2013, we entertained  
9 negotiations and best and final offers.

10 In August 2013, upon  
11 recommendation, an RFP committee, under  
12 advice and counsel from my business advisory  
13 committee and, after reviewing the two  
14 finalized proposals, Nassau Events was  
15 selected as the most responsive responder.

16 From August through September, we  
17 are right in that process now, where we have  
18 held hearings at the legislature and, today,  
19 the decision to create and build a new  
20 coliseum and entertainment district, and set  
21 the foundation for exciting phrase three  
22 development is within your hands.

23 Should you approve it today,  
24 pre-construction activities including design  
25 planning, site plan, and other approvals



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 will take place between 2013 and 2015, so  
3 that on August 1st, 2015 when NEC takes  
4 over, and the present lease expires, we are  
5 best suited to begin the renovation and  
6 allow us to open a new world class arena in  
7 2016.

8 There is a significant difference  
9 between the present lease and the new  
10 proposed lease that clearly benefits our  
11 taxpayers and our county.

12 For instance, today, Nassau  
13 County residents pay all of the utility  
14 costs at the present arena. Somewhere  
15 around \$2 million a year. The county pays  
16 for the insurance. We pay for many of the  
17 repairs. We pay for all of the capital  
18 improvements, seats, parking lots, score  
19 boards, all paid through Nassau County  
20 residents, and there are zero real property  
21 tax revenue generated from the property at  
22 its present state.

23 The NEC lease, Nassau County  
24 taxpayer sheds all those costs. NEC will  
25 pay for all the utility costs. They'll be

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 responsible for the insurance, pay for all  
3 repairs, all capital improvements and, with  
4 respect to the entertainment district on the  
5 plaza, will be subject to real property  
6 taxes or a pilot, in essence, that will pay  
7 real property taxes to the school, to the  
8 county, the town.

9 The existing coliseum we all  
10 really know that tale, so I will condense it  
11 in the interest of time. But, clearly, it's  
12 not in a good state. With the present  
13 lease, we would be obligated to spend  
14 significant taxpayer dollars pursuant to the  
15 present lease.

16 Today's public private  
17 partnership creates a 100 percent privately  
18 financed renovation. A \$229 million  
19 investment creating a world class coliseum  
20 in the entertainment district which is  
21 really just Phase One and Phase Two and sets  
22 us up with a solid foundation to maximize  
23 our potential for development in a Phase  
24 Three.

25 Nassau County will receive eight

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 percent of the gross revenue or \$4.4 million  
3 minimum rent each and every year. For us in  
4 the county, it's an even greater spread  
5 because we will shed about \$4 million of  
6 expenses and we pick up about \$4.4 million  
7 of income minimum, so that's an \$8 million  
8 improvement to the finances here in Nassau  
9 County.

10 In addition, NEC will pay rent on  
11 the first day it takes possession of the  
12 property on August 1st, 2015. They will pay  
13 an approval period rent and construction  
14 period rent as soon as the Coliseum is open  
15 and the entertainment district is underway,  
16 they will pay the minimum \$4.4 million a  
17 year or eight percent of the gross.

18 The public private partnership on  
19 August 1st, 2015, as I said, assumes all  
20 costs and expenses relieving the county of  
21 those costly expenses. NEC has full  
22 responsibility for the capital expenditures.  
23 The county retains control of future  
24 development and certainly today you have an  
25 opportunity not only to make a mark on this

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 generation, but to provide sport and  
3 entertainment options for future residents,  
4 for future generations.

5 Today is perhaps one of the most  
6 important decisions that you make that will  
7 affect future generations. You have the  
8 opportunity to create a world class sports  
9 and entertainment destination. An  
10 attractive downtown destination and set us  
11 up to maximize our potential for Phase  
12 Three.

13 So, with that, I ask you for your  
14 vote today so that Nassau has a very much  
15 brighter tomorrow at the hub.

16 Thank you very much for your kind  
17 consideration.

18 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you  
19 very much, County Executive.

20 COUNTY EXECUTIVE MANGANO: Now,  
21 it's my pleasure to introduce Bruce Ratner  
22 from NEC, Forest City Ratner.

23 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Welcome,  
24 Mr. Ratner.

25 MR. RATNER: Thank you very much.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 Thank you all for having me here. It's a  
3 very special day. It's been a long road to  
4 get here and I know you have all spent a lot  
5 of time working on this, examining it, and  
6 we thank you for the huge amount of time I  
7 know you've spent on it. You've asked us a  
8 lot of questions and we're here today to  
9 present to you our program again in short  
10 order and also to answer all kinds of  
11 questions.

12 First, the county executive I  
13 think has been wonderful throughout. He  
14 guided a process which has been open and  
15 transparent along with this legislative  
16 body, you have been transparent and open,  
17 and I think among the RFPs that our company  
18 has done, I have to say, this is the best in  
19 terms of speed, accuracy, and so on. So I  
20 just want to thank the entire county for all  
21 their help and so on.

22 So, let me start. The vision.  
23 The first and really important thing with  
24 any project and the way we kind of start a  
25 project is with a vision.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 What do I mean by a vision? What  
3 I really mean by a vision is reinventing the  
4 Nassau County Veterans Memorial Coliseum. I  
5 emphasize that word veterans. We really  
6 reinvent it in the kind of way in which we  
7 want to create a huge amount of excitement.  
8 We want this to become iconic, we want it to  
9 become world famous, want people to go  
10 there, want people to feel proud of their  
11 county and proud of this place.

12 So there are really four elements  
13 to making that happen. The first is the  
14 team. We put together a dynamic team. Our  
15 company along with the Blumenfeld  
16 Development Company will be the developers.

17 Second, we have an iconic design,  
18 which we will show you in a bit. You've  
19 seen a lot of it. We'll show you a little  
20 bit more.

21 Third is economics have to be  
22 compelling and, last and foremost, it has to  
23 generate a lot of income for this county and  
24 that's done by programing.

25 Those are the four quick areas we

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 are to cover so let me start a little bit  
3 with the team. Dynamic team, our company is  
4 the Forest City Ratner Company, and the  
5 Blumenfelds, I mentioned them.

6 Who is Forest City Ratner  
7 Companies was founded by me in 1985, 28  
8 years ago. It was formed really as a  
9 development company and all we really do is  
10 development. We are probably the largest  
11 developer in this region area, maybe one of  
12 the largest in the country.

13 We are subsidiary of a larger  
14 company called Forest City Enterprises, and  
15 that company is a \$13 billion value in  
16 enterprise value. It's been around for  
17 almost 100 years. It was started by members  
18 of my family in 1921, immigrants who came to  
19 this country, much like so many stories that  
20 every one of us have.

21 The company prides itself on a  
22 lot of different things. Among them, it  
23 prides itself locally. We developed over 42  
24 projects in the region since I started  
25 Forest City Ratner Company in 1985. We have

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 expertise in public private development, and  
3 we have issued over a billion and a half  
4 dollars of debt, refinance or financed a  
5 billion and a half dollars of debt every  
6 single year that we have been in business  
7 for the last ten years.

8 Next, this is very important.  
9 From day one, I always said, our company  
10 will always be an all union developer and  
11 operator. I'll say it again, our company  
12 has been, from day one, an all union  
13 operator and developer.

14 I'm probably one of the few  
15 developers in the country who is proud to  
16 say that. I'm proud to say that because I'm  
17 one who believes it is the unions that have  
18 created the middle class in this country and  
19 I want to continue that and you can be  
20 assured that not only will this be all  
21 union, but you will hear me cheering for the  
22 unions. I strongly believe in them and I'm  
23 always proud to say it, and people are  
24 surprised to hear a developer say that but  
25 that's how I feel.



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 Second, we have in-house  
3 construction ability and that's very  
4 important. We have extensive experience on  
5 PLAs. We've done them for all of our major  
6 projects. The next thing is MWBE's  
7 participation. Believe it or not, the very  
8 first building I built was in 1985. There  
9 were no requirements for MWBE. Coming from  
10 the background that I came from, it was  
11 terribly important that we had a program and  
12 so we invented a program. That was 1985.  
13 Ever since then every project that we've  
14 done voluntarily we have an MWBE program, we  
15 have advocacy ideas. We know how to do it.  
16 And it takes a lot of experience to do this  
17 right. You can write up anything you want,  
18 but what's required at the end the day it's  
19 a lot of experience and I'm happy to answer  
20 that with questions on what I mean by that  
21 kind of experience.

22 The other thing is, track record  
23 for local hiring. Local hiring is very,  
24 very important. In the case of the Barclays  
25 Center, 80 percent of the people who work

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 there are from Brooklyn. Most live in the  
3 neighborhood and that creates a lot of pride  
4 in the way a place is operated.

5 As a matter of fact, when you  
6 actually walk, I think the single compliment  
7 we get in our new arena in Brooklyn is, is  
8 the quality of the people and how wonderful  
9 they are. They were trained by Disney but  
10 local hiring is extremely important, not  
11 only because it's important for the  
12 community, it's important for us. It makes  
13 for good business, makes for the very best  
14 kind of employees. They're proud of where  
15 they work.

16 Now I would like to turn it over  
17 for a few minutes to the Blumenfelds. The  
18 Blumenfelds are a terrific company. They're  
19 probably number one in Long Island  
20 development over the years. They've been  
21 our partners on a project that we worked on  
22 for 12 or so years, I'll tell you exactly  
23 how many years. And it's been a wonderful  
24 partnership. They're a great group to work  
25 with and we are very happy to work with

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 them. Go ahead, David and Eddie Blumenfeld.  
3 MR. BLUMENFELD: Thank you all  
4 for having us here. Just a quick brief  
5 summary on Blumenfeld Development Group.  
6 It's a family business, my father, myself  
7 and my brother. We've been on Long Island  
8 for 40 years. We are Long Island and we all  
9 live on Long Island. We pride in our  
10 community relationships and our community  
11 outreach when we develop a project, when we  
12 start a project. We have created  
13 destination locations on Long Island. The  
14 two biggest I can give you an example of is  
15 the Arches, which wasn't in Nassau County,  
16 but was in Suffolk in Deer Park.  
17 We had an outreach of community  
18 meetings un-sponsored by the town, we did it  
19 on our own, 14 or 15 of them. We went out,  
20 got feedback, created an environment and  
21 created a downtown which Deer Park or the  
22 western end of Suffolk County didn't have.  
23 We also recently here in Nassau  
24 County opened up Lifetime Fitness. It's the  
25 first one of its kind on Long Island. It's

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 a country club, sort of gymnasium family  
3 oriented. We had opposition to a project we  
4 were going to build there. We went to the  
5 community, reached out, and found out  
6 something that they liked, brought it back  
7 and got it approved very quickly and opened  
8 it and it's very successful today.

9 We are familiar with Long  
10 Islander's needs. We are familiar with Long  
11 Island development. We know what we can  
12 help bring to this project and make it very  
13 successful in the future. Back to you.

14 MR. RATNER: So I mentioned to  
15 you about team and partnership and, as I  
16 said, at the end of the day that's what  
17 really gets it done.

18 So another team member is Onexim,  
19 our partner in Barclays. That is the  
20 Russian company owned by Mikhail Prokhorov.  
21 I'm sure you've read or heard about Mr.  
22 Prokhorov and they've been wonderful  
23 partners. Obviously they're very  
24 financially strong. They have brought a lot  
25 to our partnership. They're very

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 experienced in business and obviously  
3 economically they're also very important.

4 A second is Disney. Disney  
5 trained our employees and, as I said, that's  
6 very important. They come back every six  
7 months to retrain and train. I give a lot  
8 of success, credit, to Disney and, of  
9 course, the employees who have worked so  
10 hard and well to create a wonderful arena  
11 which we will do the same here.

12 Next is the shop architects. Our  
13 company has worked with shop architects for  
14 a number of years. In '13 they were the  
15 number one architectural firm in the state.  
16 They are a local, in New York State. Many  
17 of the principles come right from here in  
18 Long Island. They know the Coliseum very  
19 well. They went here as kids and they  
20 designed something, which, when I show you  
21 again, you have seen it many time, you will  
22 agree it's quite iconic.

23 Live Nation. A company probably  
24 many of you never heard of, but believe it  
25 or not they are the company that programs

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 Jones Beach and the Westbury Music Festival.  
3 They are the number one programing company  
4 in the world. 80 percent of the programing  
5 that gets done, gets done by them. They  
6 represent a lot of companies. They are  
7 experts at it and they are our team partner  
8 here and have been from the very beginning  
9 and they do a wonderful job.

10 Rock Nation headed by Jay-Z.  
11 People know what a spectacular performer he  
12 is. A lot of people really don't know that  
13 he is a great business person and he started  
14 a company which represents a lot of the  
15 greatest artists today. And a lot of our  
16 success at Barclays has been because being  
17 partners with him has been very helpful in  
18 getting the very best artists that there are  
19 to be gotten.

20 Legends. Legends is another  
21 company maybe you never heard of. It's  
22 relatively new. It's the Yankees and Dallas  
23 Cowboys Food Service Company. They will be  
24 doing the food here. They just won the  
25 World Trade Center food offering and it's

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 always good to partner with the Yankees.  
3 They're a great iconic brand. We're close  
4 to them in many ways. Yes, networks  
5 actually broadcast our basketball games, so  
6 having them around is terrific.

7 Guggenheim and Goldman Saks are  
8 our financing partners who I think both,  
9 Guggenheim is the company that recently  
10 bought the Dodgers, but they're one of the  
11 largest companies for financing, managing  
12 money, and so on, billions and billions of  
13 dollars.

14 Now let me turn to something I  
15 keep saying and saying and sometimes I'm not  
16 sure that everybody fully understands how  
17 incredibly important this is, iconic design.

18 So I've stressed all along the  
19 importance of iconic design and I think that  
20 this distinguishes our company from a lot of  
21 other companies. Design is extremely  
22 important particularly for something like  
23 the Coliseum which has a certain kind of  
24 reputation which has to be reinvented. 30  
25 million cars pass by the Coliseum every

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 single year. The county is in large part  
3 known by what this is going to look like.  
4 So, we spent a lot of time on doing  
5 something that is really iconic. It is -- I  
6 predict that this arena will be known world  
7 wide because of the way it looks inside and  
8 outside and because of the programming.  
9 Those three elements. Inside/outside  
10 programing. I want to emphasis the exterior  
11 design is very, very important.

12 Interesting enough, if you look  
13 back at our company over the years, what you  
14 will find is that, what you see is what you  
15 get. Meaning that, if you look at stuff we  
16 put up in terms of pictures and diagrams and  
17 so on, that's what we wind up building,  
18 whether it be up in Westchester or the  
19 Barclays Center, it will look like this. We  
20 have already priced out and engineered the  
21 facade and interior.

22 Let me go to the second thing  
23 which is the interior. The interior is also  
24 very important. You want this place to feel  
25 like your living room, like you're at home.



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 That's very important. When I'm in the  
3 Barclays Center and I'm at a concert there,  
4 I feel like I'm in a theater. I feel like  
5 it's quiet and it's beautiful and that makes  
6 a huge difference.

7 The number one thing after really  
8 that we get about our employees is about  
9 really about the way the place looks and  
10 whether it be a team that plays there or an  
11 artist that plays there, it is very  
12 important. Obviously for the customer it's  
13 even more important. It's got to look  
14 really really excellent. So everything from  
15 the box office to the concourse clubs to the  
16 concourse view to the amphitheater outside  
17 will be very very beautiful.

18 Now, let me talk a little bit  
19 about the outside and the so-called  
20 amphitheater outside and retail.

21 We will have 150,000 feet of  
22 retail and entertainment. They'll be about  
23 50,000 feet of restaurants. They'll be  
24 bowling, new movie theatres, a Fillmore Club  
25 or something equivalent to the Fillmore

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 Club.

3 In addition there is something  
4 that I'm very happy to talk about, let's  
5 call it a performance lawn. It's kind of  
6 like Bryant Park. It's a relaxed  
7 environment. It doesn't have to have music,  
8 it could have music. It could have digital  
9 opera outside. It's kind of a relaxed  
10 place. You get your meal at one of the  
11 restaurants. You sit out on the lawn. You  
12 come just to relax, read a book and so on.  
13 It's not an amphitheater in the sense of a  
14 giant place where you're hearing music day  
15 in and day out.

16 Along with that, in the winter  
17 there will be a skating rink. It's not  
18 going to be the kind of skating rink that  
19 competes with other skating rinks around  
20 here. It's not going to be for hockey but  
21 more like Rockefeller Center. Kind of not  
22 the place to skate around for two or three  
23 hours and get there and skate, it's kind of  
24 just a place where you go in the wintertime,  
25 you take your kids, it's kind of festive and

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 nice, and it's just sort of an amenity  
3 element.

4 Next is economics. I mentioned  
5 the economics. The county executive  
6 mentioned economics. Economics here are  
7 very, very strong in so many different ways.  
8 The county executive I think laid it out  
9 beautifully, so I'll just repeat a couple of  
10 important points.

11 The first was very important, the  
12 county, and, again, I give all of you credit  
13 for so stressing both in so many things that  
14 legislators said in the past and the  
15 executive said in the past, which was the  
16 county does not want to have obligations,  
17 does not want to put money into this. We  
18 understand that. We are accustomed to  
19 dealing with governments, we've dealt with  
20 obviously the city and many other  
21 governments, so we understand that. So  
22 there are no operating maintenance or  
23 capital expense obligations in the lease.

24 Next, our company does a lot of  
25 economic development. When I went into

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 business from day one, I said that's what I  
3 want to do, and that's what we do. We  
4 create jobs. We retain jobs.

5 So having \$11 billion in economic  
6 activity, I'm created to the state 9.6  
7 billion 11 billion state, \$9.6 billion for  
8 the county is very, very strong. There will  
9 be \$500 million in projected rent and sales  
10 tax that will come to the county over 30  
11 years. That's a very good number.

12 More than 2,700 jobs will be  
13 generated in the county from the permanent  
14 operations of this arena and retail.

15 Sponsorship and programing are  
16 the main drivers for the economics. That's  
17 a very important part. It will be done in  
18 taste and well. If you look at what we did  
19 in Brooklyn, you will see how important and  
20 how well done that is.

21 I've said that what drives all  
22 this is programing and, I'm a developer, but  
23 at the end of the day it requires great  
24 programing. So I would like to introduce  
25 the person who I think in a lot of ways is

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 responsible for the greatness of our arena  
3 in Brooklyn and a lot of what we have done  
4 as a sports and entertainment company and  
5 here's our CEO, Brett Yormark. Brett.

6 MR. YORMARK: Good afternoon.  
7 Programming content, as we like to refer to  
8 it, will really be the fuel for the engine.  
9 We've had had a great first year at  
10 Barclays. We have deep-rooted relationships  
11 in all areas of the content business,  
12 ranging from sports to concerts to family  
13 shows and we want to bring all of that here  
14 to Nassau and we are very excited about  
15 doing that.

16 You've seen it probably before,  
17 you've read a little bit about our  
18 programing goals, but we will have over 300  
19 events a year which we think will truly keep  
20 the venue very busy attracting 1.2 million  
21 people on an annual basis.

22 To date, we have 200 events  
23 committed to, letters of commitment from  
24 programers from around the country ranging  
25 from Live Nation to Rock Nation to WWE

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 Wrestling, to Golden Boy Promotions on the  
3 boxing front, to some of the greatest  
4 colleges and universities across the country  
5 that want to come here to Nassau County to  
6 showcase their entertainment, their  
7 athletes, and we are very excited about that  
8 and that 200 number is growing.

9 Again, the content that we have  
10 planned will certainly drive the value, not  
11 only in the people that are attracted to the  
12 new venue but also from a sponsorship  
13 perspective. Because the sponsors are going  
14 to want to know that it's a busy venue and  
15 its got robust programming, and that  
16 certainly will be the case.

17 As you can see here with the  
18 graph, I have broken down the 309 projected  
19 events just to kind of give you a flavor for  
20 the volume and variety of programming, from  
21 concerts which, to date, we have already 35  
22 committed to between Rock Nation and Live  
23 Nation, to our Nets preseason game, to minor  
24 league hockey, AHL specifically, to other  
25 sporting events like college basketball,

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 college hockey, boxing, wrestling, family  
3 shows, obviously working with Feld  
4 Entertainment, Big Apple Circus, all of  
5 which continue to call Nassau home. In the  
6 case of the Big Apple Circus, they want to  
7 come out here for the first time.

8 Parking lot events will be a big  
9 part of the programming mix, from life-style  
10 programing to festivals and then we'll have  
11 a circus run on the exterior of the building  
12 during the spring and summer as well.

13 Club Nassau programming that we  
14 will do curating for. More appointment  
15 viewing, money night, Motown, EDM Music,  
16 Country Nights, all of which will take place  
17 primarily on the floor of the arena, smaller  
18 in nature but will get people to frequent  
19 the venue often, rentals and trade shows.  
20 Some of the programming that the current  
21 venue enjoys will continue and grow as will  
22 the activation of the exhibition hall.

23 Just to kind of give you a little  
24 flavor for the kind of booking ideas we have  
25 and why we think and we are so bullish on

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 Nassau. Currently, if you just think about  
3 some of the numbers from Nassau County and  
4 Suffolk County going out to Barclays,  
5 there's not many. We have learned like  
6 Brooklyn, Nassau and Suffolk County, it's a  
7 different market, a totally different  
8 market.

9 Currently, we only have eight  
10 percent of our universe of buyers for Nets  
11 games coming from Long Island. 13 percent  
12 are for non-Nets events, concerts, family  
13 shows and things of that nature. We  
14 realized that the people here in Long Island  
15 want to stay here. They deserve the best  
16 forms of sports and entertainment and our  
17 goal is to bring it right here in their  
18 backyard.

19 Other programing mixes that are  
20 also underdeveloped and lag behind the 13  
21 and 8 percent are family events, college  
22 basketball and boxing, obviously we are  
23 going to bring a lot of that here to the  
24 county. And cross booking, we think that  
25 the Barclays Center and the new Nassau truly



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 provide an opportunity to compliment each  
3 other.

4 Like we did recently with Jay-Z  
5 and we're currently helping in booking of  
6 the building currently, Jay-Z is playing  
7 Brooklyn and he's now coming to Nassau  
8 County for the first time in years and there  
9 will be other announcements in the coming  
10 weeks where we are going to cross book and  
11 bring content, not only that's at Barclays,  
12 but here to the county. So we think it's  
13 very complimentary and they work very, very  
14 well together.

15 Now what we would like to do is,  
16 you know, Bruce talked about a vision we  
17 share and we're very bullish on this vision.

18 We've put together what that  
19 first year recap video might look like.  
20 It's not what it might look like, it's what  
21 it will look like.

22 So, if I may, I would like to  
23 play that video.

24 (Whereupon, the video was  
25 played.)

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Mr.  
3 Ratner, is that the end of the presentation?

4 MR. RATNER: Yes, that's the end.

5 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Now it's  
6 open to questions from this body. I will  
7 begin with whomever would like to ask  
8 questions. I believe some of the questions  
9 may have stemmed from the last presentation  
10 that we had.

11 Is there anyone who would like to  
12 ask Mr. Ratner questions regarding this  
13 proposal? Legislator Jacobs.

14 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Good  
15 afternoon, everybody. I appreciate you  
16 being here and I appreciate the  
17 presentation.

18 I have one question that keeps  
19 popping up in my mind and that is the losing  
20 of seats at the Coliseum. It's the fact  
21 that there's 3,000 less seats than at  
22 present. I have spoken about this before,  
23 my concern, number one, would be, with 3,000  
24 less seats, I'm not an expert on this,  
25 except I have been a season ticket holder of

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 the Islanders for a long time, so I don't  
3 know if that gives me a foot in the door,  
4 but the truth of the matter is, and I have  
5 read that NHL seems to look favorably on a  
6 15,000 plus arena for world class teams to  
7 be involved. Considering that we have  
8 seemed to have lost the Islanders, I know  
9 they will be here for six games, but we  
10 don't have them.

11 The fact of going down 3,000  
12 seats can't help but have a question mark in  
13 my mind.

14 MR. RATNER: One of the really  
15 important things to realize is that there  
16 are very very few concerts or events that  
17 are more than 13,000. There are a few, but  
18 they're minimal.

19 In fact, most of the concerts in  
20 anything from gyms, not gyms, but arenas at  
21 universities to small middle sized towns.  
22 And the reason why you don't want to have  
23 16,000 is because when you have 12,000 or  
24 8,000 for a concert, you don't want it to  
25 look empty.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 One of the great feelings about  
3 an arena is that sense of -- and I will  
4 answer the second part of questions, but  
5 first the reason why 13,000. It's  
6 critically important for that place to be  
7 comfortable. It can be curtained down to 3  
8 or 4,000 in a beautiful kind of way. You  
9 want it to feel intimate, and you want to  
10 also feel like you can walk in the aisles  
11 and so on.

12 What was done at the Coliseum a  
13 number of years ago, as most of you know,  
14 they added a number of seats in aisles all  
15 over the place and it made it a bit  
16 uncomfortable. So that's the reason for  
17 13,000.

18 Now I will get to second part of  
19 your question which is the Islanders.  
20 Honestly, for a team to play here 44 games,  
21 you would probably have to build this  
22 Coliseum from scratch. The concourses are  
23 adequate for five or six games. The  
24 concessions are fine enough for five or six  
25 games, but you just don't have suites there,

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 you don't have boxes. You probably need 100  
3 suites there. They've got to be perfectly  
4 done.

5 So, the truth of it is, if you  
6 want a professional team back here, you're  
7 really going to have to spend a lot of money  
8 and build a new arena.

9 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Let me,  
10 please, ask you this.

11 MR. RATNER: You can ask me  
12 anything.

13 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: I don't know  
14 anything about building arenas. But let me  
15 ask you, in the future going forward,  
16 wouldn't it be to everyone's advantage to  
17 have a facility that may require a different  
18 approach towards building the new Coliseum  
19 but one that would leave it open to having  
20 the ability to attract a team. We're not  
21 talking about anything before 2015.

22 In my layman's type of mind, I  
23 feel that the main thing the Coliseum always  
24 had was the Islanders. Obviously I'm not  
25 dwelling on the Islanders, that's the past,

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 but I'm thinking to myself, what happens if  
3 this particular way of using the arena to  
4 attract, not to attract smaller amounts,  
5 I'm sure you would love to fill 13,000 seats  
6 every time you have someone, but if you  
7 don't at least it won't look empty. Where  
8 does that put us in the future when we are  
9 trying to attract --

10 MR. RATNER: I'm going to answer  
11 it the simple way, you can always put the  
12 seats back in. We are taking them out of  
13 aisle. They were added on. We can always  
14 put them back, but, that being said, you are  
15 not going to get a professional sports team  
16 to go into that arena without brand new  
17 suites perfectly situated and so on.

18 But if you want to make it  
19 exactly like it was before, that wouldn't be  
20 terribly expensive. You're going to have  
21 the seats in. You're not going to get  
22 something that I think obviously isn't great  
23 for concerts and all kinds of other things,  
24 but you're not going to get something that  
25 any professional sports team would accept

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 because there are no suites and all the  
3 reasons I described. But certainly they can  
4 be put back in and you'll wind up with the  
5 same place.

6 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: I'm repeating  
7 certain questions that have come to me from  
8 others too. Can you please confirm, I don't  
9 know if you can do this or the  
10 administration can do this, that there is to  
11 intention of putting video lottery terminals  
12 in this facility?

13 MR. RATNER: I can certainly  
14 speak for us, the lease calls for retail and  
15 you know what it calls for in fixing up the  
16 Coliseum, what I call reinventing it. So  
17 there is no intention of doing gaming. In  
18 fact, the retail is on the plaza and there  
19 wouldn't be room for it. We don't control  
20 the extra development rights, that's a  
21 county thing. I think the county would say  
22 that they don't have the intention either,  
23 but I don't want to speak to Rob.

24 CHIEF DEPUTY COUNTY EXEC WALKER:  
25 There is no intention at all whatsoever, in

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 fact, OTB is currently putting out proposals  
3 for VLTs probably at locations with the race  
4 pals. But there is no intention at all.  
5 There will be no VLTs here at the Nassau  
6 Coliseum whatsoever.

7 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: So let's  
8 bounce for a second because that was one of  
9 my next questions. Is the Race Palace what  
10 is being considered?

11 CHIEF DEPUTY COUNTY EXEC WALKER:  
12 I think OTB, and I really shouldn't speak  
13 for them, but they are putting out an RFP to  
14 look at that location as a potential site.

15 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: That I know  
16 enough about, the weight of the VLT machines  
17 and the upper floor. Because I really don't  
18 believe and, being the rep of Plainview, and  
19 I know I'm going off track here, but being  
20 the rep of Plainview, I think we should look  
21 at that very carefully.

22 CHIEF DEPUTY COUNTY EXEC WALKER:  
23 Like I said, all the due diligence has to be  
24 done by them, obviously meeting all the  
25 requirements, and there's also state



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 requirements that have been put into the law  
3 when it was signed by the governor. So  
4 they're going to have to do all their due  
5 diligence as is Suffolk, you know, through  
6 the process and see where it may end.

7 But there is no intent at all for  
8 this site.

9 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: I assume from  
10 what you're saying then -- I shouldn't  
11 assume anything.

12 Is the administration supportive  
13 of VLTs if there is a site suited for it?

14 CHIEF DEPUTY COUNTY EXEC WALKER:  
15 Yes, the revenue to the county is valuable.  
16 But, again, I think we are getting a little  
17 bit ahead of ourselves until OTB comes back  
18 with the requirements, with a location, what  
19 needs to be done and not done. It's hard to  
20 speak hypothetically on anything until that  
21 report is concluded.

22 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Well, I  
23 appreciate your honesty about it.

24 Mr. Ratner, I thank you very,  
25 very much for your comments. I just wanted

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 to express my concerns because I think  
3 they're real and I think it's great, by the  
4 way. I don't think an empty building that's  
5 not being used -- I do have one more  
6 question for you though. Is there an  
7 amphitheater being planned?

8 MR. RATNER: Amphitheater as we  
9 know it, no. There's going to be a lawn.  
10 The retail will surround a lawn, much like a  
11 Bryant Park. It will actually be lovely.  
12 There's something in Florida, Miami Beach,  
13 called Soundscape. It's just right outside  
14 one of the concert halls there. People sit.  
15 They listen to music. It's not an  
16 amphitheater in terms of band shell with  
17 loud music and so on.

18 And, if it turns out that we do  
19 have a concert there or we have a digital  
20 opera or whatever, and it's overly noisy, we  
21 don't have to use it for that. It's really  
22 an amenity. It's not something we're  
23 charging for and so on. We're thinking of  
24 it as a beautiful lawned area.

25 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: I would just

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 make a suggestion. I mean, I happen to live  
3 in an area that has some buildings around it  
4 that are usually you'd say not very  
5 adaptable to living near homes, but through  
6 working together we have been able to make  
7 it work.

8 I would say that, to keep in  
9 mind, where ever this land is going to be,  
10 with no matter what happens on it, it would  
11 probably be very helpful for it not to be on  
12 the side of the Coliseum where the homes  
13 exist.

14 MR. RATNER: Gotcha. Thank you.

15 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Thank you.

16 MR. RATNER: I think the other  
17 thing is, it's going to be surrounded by the  
18 retail to block any noise.

19 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: That's true,  
20 but I mean I know homeowners, and rightfully  
21 so, are very sensitive to noise.

22 MR. RATNER: Absolutely.

23 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Especially on  
24 the outside and there are ways to block it  
25 that are still effective for your uses and,

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 yet, not an annoyance to the homeowners.

3 MR. RATNER: My wife grew up in  
4 Woodmere and she said she would have to put  
5 the phone down when the planes came over  
6 head, so --

7 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: That's very  
8 true.

9 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Of course I  
10 live near fields with lights and cheering  
11 which you love to hear. I mean, I never  
12 complain, but I'm telling you that  
13 communities, when anything interferes with  
14 your normal enjoyment of your home, it  
15 becomes an issue. So I would appreciate you  
16 keeping that in mind.

17 MR. RATNER: And it's fine to  
18 keep mentioning it and reminding us because  
19 it is very important, people's peace and  
20 quiet.

21 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: Thank you  
22 very much.

23 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator  
24 Nicolello.

25 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: Thank you,

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 Presiding Officer. And, thank you, Mr.  
3 Ratner, for the presentation today.

4 I believe in response to  
5 Legislator Jacobs' questions, I think what  
6 you are really telling us and something  
7 that's been told to us over and over again  
8 is that building the Coliseum as it was or  
9 rebuilding is simply not economically viable  
10 for that property, that's really what it  
11 comes down to, does it not?

12 MR. RATNER: That's correct. You  
13 cannot economically make it work for  
14 professional sports team, whether it be  
15 suites or various other things.

16 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: So without  
17 that economic viability, we can't build the  
18 arena to the standards that the NHL requires  
19 and we can't host a major sports franchise  
20 at that location currently?

21 MR. RATNER: That's correct.

22 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: Again,  
23 factoring in also as well the zoning laws of  
24 the town of Hempstead which limits the  
25 development of the property, et cetera.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 However, your proposal is the  
3 only proposal that keeps the connection to  
4 the Islanders, that brings the Islanders  
5 back for at least part of the year?

6 MR. RATNER: Yes, that was very  
7 important to us. There is a tremendous fan  
8 base, plus a huge history, and a huge  
9 history actually for the Nets also. So  
10 we're kind of glad they're close by.

11 But the history is very  
12 important. Legacy and the sense of history  
13 and nostalgia is important. And Brooklyn is  
14 on the same island, only 20 or so miles  
15 away, but, nevertheless, I think it's  
16 important to have the team play here.

17 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: Do you  
18 have a commitment from Charles Wang to play  
19 four regular season games and two preseason  
20 games?

21 MR. RATNER: Yes, he's all for  
22 it. He wants it. He's a good Long Island  
23 citizen and he wants that to happen too, of  
24 course.

25 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: A major

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 component of the plan is having an anchor  
3 tenant which is a minor league hockey team.  
4 Can you just address that briefly and how do  
5 you foresee that working its way out?

6 MR. RATNER: Again, it is a major  
7 part of it to have a minor league hockey  
8 team, in this case an AHL team. The Sound  
9 Tigers which Charles Wang owns. He would  
10 move them from the current location in  
11 Bridgeport to here and Charles is really  
12 into some sense a partner of ours in the  
13 Barclays in having him coming to Barclays,  
14 so he's a friend, and I don't think it's an  
15 issue.

16 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: But with  
17 respect to the Sound Tigers, aren't they  
18 under contract to the current arena that  
19 they're in?

20 MR. RATNER: Yes. Well, I  
21 shouldn't say that. But he can backfill  
22 them legally with something else and he's  
23 going to do that.

24 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO:  
25 Interesting. One of my colleagues,

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 Legislator Wink, had expressed some concern  
3 in the committees that there will be  
4 something of a conflict of interest in terms  
5 of the programming because Barclays would  
6 want to get certain acts there as opposed to  
7 the Coliseum, but I read in Newsday and I  
8 think this is a very good point. The  
9 Barclays can actually leverage their  
10 strength and weight in the entertainment  
11 industry to bring acts to Nassau County; is  
12 that correct?

13 MR. RATNER: It's correct. And  
14 if you think about it, look, our goal is to  
15 make this economically work. Obviously we  
16 have a minimum payment that we've got to  
17 make happen. So the goal is to make this as  
18 economically viable and give the strongest  
19 possible economics.

20 So, no matter what, we will do  
21 everything to get the very best shows here  
22 possible. On top of that, as Brett Yormark  
23 indicated, this is a very different  
24 demographic. This demographic, it turns  
25 out, doesn't come very much to Brooklyn for



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 concerts and so on. Those are two major  
3 things.

4 A good example of what we're  
5 capable of doing is, Jay-Z has not appeared  
6 here for years. My guess is, if one were to  
7 ask him, and I haven't asked him, but my  
8 guess is, he would say, look, I don't like  
9 the place feels and looks and so on.

10 We already gotten a commitment  
11 this year to come back and will continue to  
12 do that until in fact the Islanders leave.  
13 We are able to leverage it in a kind of very  
14 important way. Many of you may not know  
15 this, but we were number one in the number  
16 of shows for all arenas in the United States  
17 and number one terms of revenues for shows  
18 in the United States, number two in the  
19 world.

20 So our ability to leverage it is  
21 enormous and, obviously, if you think about  
22 an artist, an artist wants to play as close  
23 to the next possible gig as possible. So  
24 they're going to way to play Barclays and  
25 want to play Nassau.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 As you know, I don't have to tell  
3 you, this is a very strong county,  
4 economically, in terms of people who live  
5 here. This is a great place. For example,  
6 interestingly enough, what you'll hear  
7 circus, this county along with New York  
8 City, are the number one counties for people  
9 who want to attend circuses in the country.  
10 I think it's just a history of circuses and  
11 we kind of all grew up with them, but that's  
12 another example of a group that wants to  
13 play here very very badly.

14 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: Just to  
15 address one last contingency and there's  
16 been some concern here also as well, among  
17 all the legislators, some more so than  
18 others, but in terms of the financial  
19 contingency, the borrowing that has to take  
20 place or be in place before, within a  
21 certain time period before the project  
22 proceeds. Could you address that and allay  
23 some of the concerns that people have that  
24 somehow your corporation, your parent, which  
25 is a \$13 billion company, will somehow have

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 difficulty with financing?

3 MR. RATNER: So we finance about  
4 a billion eight a year for the last ten  
5 years. Our business is financing in a large  
6 part. This is not a particularly large loan  
7 in terms of neither the retailers nor the  
8 arena. We have got letters of interest from  
9 both Guggenheim and from Goldman Saks on the  
10 Coliseum, and different banks, M&T and so on  
11 for the retail. It's just not much of an  
12 issue.

13 We say we will do it and we will  
14 do it. And I think that's in some sense the  
15 best commitment. Because if you think about  
16 it, if I didn't want to do it, why would I  
17 do it in the first place.

18 Second, if someone didn't want to  
19 do it, all they have to do is sit on their  
20 hands for a couple of years until their two  
21 year period is over and they can get out of  
22 it, anybody, whether it be us or anybody  
23 else.

24 So the truth of it is, this is a  
25 large part of the reputation of the company

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 you're dealing with and our reputation for  
3 getting financing done is extraordinary. We  
4 do it day in and day out, even during the  
5 worst economic times, we finance \$600  
6 million of the arena financing in Brooklyn  
7 in '09 just to give you a sense of the  
8 difficulty. So it really is not an issue.

9 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: That's all  
10 I have. I just want to thank you. The  
11 debate over what to do with the Coliseum has  
12 gone on for two decades. This is easily the  
13 most exciting, the most realistic plan that  
14 we've had, and I think it will be a real  
15 tremendous benefit to the taxpayers and  
16 residents and everyone who attends the new  
17 improved Nassau Veterans Memorial Coliseum.

18 MR. RATNER: I appreciate that  
19 too. And you can sort of tell, all of you,  
20 by my excitement, and my enthusiasm, it's  
21 rubbed off on me, I'm really excited to do  
22 this too.

23 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator  
24 Ford.

25 LEGISLATOR FORD: Thank you very

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 much, Presiding Officer. I too want to  
3 express my gratitude for your presentation  
4 and also for your commitment to Nassau  
5 County. Although I have been in Nassau  
6 County now, a resident, for 33 years, I was  
7 born and raised in New York City and I spent  
8 many years working especially in the areas  
9 of Manhattan and Brooklyn.

10 I'm very pleased that once again  
11 you are willing to take what we'd say  
12 politely as a stressed area and want to  
13 convert it into something much more  
14 beautiful and much more revenue producing.

15 I know the transformation of 42nd  
16 Street as well as the downtown area in  
17 Brooklyn where you have your Barclays Center  
18 and of course the Metrotech Center which is  
19 a showcase for businesses.

20 I did have the opportunity of  
21 knowing about Bryant Park. I remember when  
22 it was a mecca for a lot of drug dealing and  
23 a lot of bad elements there. Now it hosts  
24 the fashion show as well as concerts as you  
25 say and they always have the fairs, whatever

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 it is, around the holidays, where they set  
3 booths up, so many people can go shopping  
4 there.

5 So you have brought a lot of live  
6 and a lot of good opportunities and great  
7 experiences to New York City and I'm hoping  
8 that with this renovation of the Coliseum  
9 that we're going to have the same excitement  
10 maybe even a little bit better.

11 I'm thrilled also that you have a  
12 commitment to using union labor and I thank  
13 you very much for the support for our  
14 brothers and sisters in labor.

15 I know I did receive some e-mails  
16 and letters in regard to I guess when you  
17 start building and you are ready to open up.  
18 I know that you're looking for, when you  
19 hire employees, that you are looking first,  
20 I guess, or you're going to pay attention to  
21 the local communities and try to hire many  
22 of the residents in that area who would like  
23 to work at the Coliseum.

24 What about like some of the local  
25 businesses, when you look and you set up? I

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 know you talked about with the Legends but  
3 with other stores, are you going to look to  
4 see if there are any community owned  
5 businesses that may be able to work within  
6 the venue of the Coliseum?

7 MR. RATNER: So let me make a  
8 comment. I have said that we wanted to hire  
9 locally, but the number one is to hire the  
10 existing people that are there. We do not  
11 want people to be out of jobs. I know we  
12 all agree with that but I just wanted to  
13 clarify that.

14 Now, expect local businesses.  
15 This is an amazing fact. When we did  
16 Barclays in terms of food, even though we  
17 use an outside food service company, it  
18 could be Legends or it could be, in this  
19 case, Levy Brothers, we went locally to a  
20 hundred different restaurants and vendors to  
21 basically provide our food, to actually  
22 license the recipes, so we have, believe it  
23 or not when I was at the arena the other  
24 day, we have 70 local Brooklyn businesses  
25 that participate in our arena, 70. No one

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 has ever done anything like that. You come  
3 in and taste the food. The food will be  
4 licensed recipes from everything from  
5 Spumoni Gardens to Nathans to a vendor who  
6 makes nothing but hot dogs and hamburgers  
7 and that supplies large hotels and so on.

8 So we are very conscious of it  
9 and the most important thing is we know how  
10 to do it. We really know how to do that.  
11 It was a real struggle by the way in the  
12 beginning. Imagine starting a couple of  
13 years, talking to local vendors, you've got  
14 to get them up to sanitary standards, you've  
15 got to get them to understand what it is to  
16 license the recipes. Some of the cooking is  
17 done outside at their place and brought in  
18 and so on, so it's a real effort. But,  
19 believe it or not, we got it down. It was  
20 not easy.

21 I will tell you that the company  
22 that actually does the management didn't  
23 think that it could be done, but it's an  
24 incredible record that we are proud of.

25 LEGISLATOR FORD: Thanks. Also,



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 I'm concerned, too, I know that  
3 opportunities for women sometimes I always  
4 feel that it's a little bit harder for women  
5 to get their businesses recognized or to  
6 even excel in the business world.

7 Do you take into consideration  
8 some of the businesses, would you, like,  
9 consider perhaps looking at some women owned  
10 businesses?

11 MR. RATNER: I don't know the  
12 numbers and I couldn't exactly say, but my  
13 sense is that, particularly local vendors,  
14 restaurants, and so on, and I can get you  
15 the percentage of women, but at least in  
16 Brooklyn it's pretty easy to do, we got a  
17 lot of women-owned businesses, particularly  
18 in the food service business and so on. So  
19 obviously that's very, very important. We  
20 are very conscious of it. A CO much of  
21 company is a woman, so that helps too.

22 LEGISLATOR FORD: I thank you  
23 very much, because, to me, and I commend you  
24 then for the women-owned businesses in your  
25 corporation now and over in the Barclays

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 Center as well.

3 I'll just end with this. Thank  
4 you very much for everything that you are  
5 doing and when you talk about the great lawn  
6 I guess, I'm sort of looking forward to it  
7 but I do echo Legislator Jacobs' concerns  
8 that perhaps you could set it so that it's  
9 more looking -- the sound goes more towards  
10 Charles Lindbergh which goes -- you really  
11 won't bother too many people, but you sort  
12 of bring me back then to, and you probably  
13 remember this after the New York State  
14 World's Fair, they used to have outdoor  
15 concerts outside the New York State  
16 Pavilion, and it was really a beautiful  
17 event where people could just sit around and  
18 hang out with friends and family and stuff.

19 So I'm looking forward to this  
20 and thank you.

21 MR. RATNER: Thank you much.

22 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator  
23 Venditto.

24 LEGISLATOR VENDITTO: Thank you,  
25 Ms. Presiding Officer. How are you? I just

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 want to echo the sentiment. We all really  
3 appreciate the time today.

4 We've been talking about retail  
5 and there's been some good discussion about  
6 that. Maybe a question more for the  
7 Blumenfeld Group to answer. Just curious  
8 about the type of retail that we envision  
9 seeing in the area.

10 MR. RATNER: I'll open it and  
11 then have Eddie or David describe it. First  
12 of all, restaurants, and entertainment  
13 oriented restaurants, both local  
14 restaurants, restaurants that will be fun  
15 and so on, along with a bowling alley, movie  
16 theatre and Fillmore. But Eddie or David?

17 MR. BLUMENFELD: Hi. Ed  
18 Blumenfeld. We're speaking to local  
19 restaurants. We've already started the  
20 process. We're looking at a multiplex movie  
21 theatre along with the Fillmore that Brett  
22 mentioned which would be a live  
23 entertainment type of facility and ancillary  
24 businesses that can survive in this  
25 environment. It's not a retail complex as

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 we know, typical Long Island mall, it's not  
3 Green Acres or Roosevelt Field or a strip  
4 center. This is going to be an  
5 entertainment-based facility where we hope  
6 to attract bowling alley -- a themed bowling  
7 alley, something that will bring people  
8 there, and incorporate the Hofstra  
9 life-style and community life-style along  
10 with this new Coliseum that we're looking to  
11 build.

12 The thing that I want to go back  
13 that I heard mentioned a couple of times is  
14 this great lawn concept and noise pollution.

15 This site is 80 acres. We're  
16 talking about a football field worth of  
17 plaza area where you might have a concert.  
18 You are faced to the east by Meadowbrook, to  
19 the south by Hempstead Turnpike, and then  
20 whatever it is today, it was EAB Plaza in my  
21 generation, to the north we have all of the  
22 campus of Nassau County and all of the  
23 museums. And to the west Hofstra and it's  
24 dorms. I don't think that we are going to  
25 pollute all the way into Hempstead with

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 noise and I think what we're contemplating  
3 if we can achieve and we will achieve will  
4 be a definite benefit to Nassau.

5 I have been a resident here all  
6 my life and I remain one and continue to add  
7 to the lifestyle of our residents. Thank  
8 you.

9 LEGISLATOR VENDITTO: Thank you.

10 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: I have,  
11 Mr. Ratner, I believe a couple of questions,  
12 and then I'm going to turn it over to  
13 Minority Leader Abrahams.

14 First of all, jobs is the major  
15 component, economic component of this  
16 development. It's something that's well  
17 needed here in Nassau County in spite of the  
18 fact that we have made so many inroads into  
19 creating jobs here.

20 My concern is, how many  
21 construction jobs will be created, and how  
22 many full time, after construction is  
23 completed, full-time positions will --

24 MR. RATNER: I'm going to turn  
25 to, Jim, what are the total amount of

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 construction jobs? So 1,500. What does  
3 1,500 mean? The way they describe that it  
4 means, 1,500 person years of construction.  
5 The answer is 1,500 on that. And then the  
6 permanent number is, as I mentioned, there  
7 is 2,700 jobs for permanent operations.  
8 Most of those jobs are part time because  
9 obviously the issue is that you don't have  
10 shows 24-7. That's good and bad.

11 What we found at Barclays is, in  
12 a lot of ways it's positive because first of  
13 all we pay a good wage. At Barclays I  
14 believe we'll pay a good wage. I believe in  
15 that strange as that mean seem for a  
16 developer. But, importantly, it allows them  
17 to have a good paying part-time job and a  
18 good paying full-time job. Or two part time  
19 jobs. Plus they can pick their hours. They  
20 can be weekends, they can be evenings.

21 So it's actually a great way to  
22 either supplement their income or in fact if  
23 someone only currently works a part time  
24 job, then they are going to be able to have  
25 another part time job. But that's the

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 nature of this business. We just don't have  
3 the total number of permanent jobs. My  
4 guess would be in 30s, 40s, 50s, I don't  
5 know.

6 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: The other  
7 factor regarding the economic benefits, the  
8 East Meadow community, which abuts the  
9 community property, there are many  
10 women-owned businesses. How do we attract  
11 those into the Coliseum?

12 MR. RATNER: We go visit them.

13 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: I'll give  
14 you a list.

15 MR. RATNER: Perfect. We're  
16 ready. Both in our food area and in our  
17 community group, we're used to it. That's  
18 what we do. We live in a dense urban area  
19 and we welcome it, it would be great.

20 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Another  
21 issue that was I think a road block in  
22 developing the property was transportation.  
23 I know that guidelines have been set by the  
24 Town of Hempstead as far as transportation  
25 is concerned, correct?

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 MR. RATNER: Rob can answer that.

3 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: But I  
4 believe during the September 9th committee  
5 presentation and asked about Veolia and  
6 whether or not they're going to be able to  
7 have a play into the transportation aspect  
8 of the Coliseum property, anybody?

9 CHIEF DEPUTY COUNTY EXEC WALKER:  
10 We've already started those conversations in  
11 conjunction with the overall transportation  
12 study that has taken place. We discussed  
13 bus rapid transit that we believe is  
14 something that can be done right away,  
15 working in conjunction with them and  
16 obviously with the folks at the Coliseum.  
17 So, yes, conversations have started and will  
18 continue.

19 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you  
20 very much. One more question. Maybe  
21 Mr. Blumenfeld will answer this one.

22 I'm very curious about the  
23 bowling aspect of the development. The  
24 reason why I'm asking is that --

25 MR. BLUMENFELD: You're a bowler?



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: I used to  
3 be a great bowler. Not anymore. That's  
4 right, you're absolutely correct, Mr.  
5 Denenberg.

6 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Can I get  
7 a copy of that portion of the transcript?

8 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: We have a  
9 huge bowling facility in East Meadow. I  
10 want to know exactly what the nature of this  
11 bowling aspect of the Coliseum would be.

12 MR. BLUMENFELD: Right now it's  
13 our thought process. We're looking at the  
14 new theme bowling alleys that are  
15 restaurants and entertainment centers, that  
16 it could be a Dave & Busters type of  
17 facility and Uncle Bucks, I don't know if  
18 you are familiar with that.

19 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Yes.

20 MR. BLUMENFELD: They're not here  
21 in New York but we're trying to get them  
22 here where it's a full night's entertainment  
23 for families.

24 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: My  
25 concern, of course, any impact that it could

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 have on the neighboring.

3 MR. BLUMENFELD: We're not Home  
4 Depot. We're not looking to put out the  
5 private guy. I bowl for Valley Stream High.  
6 I still have my bowling ball. I'll come  
7 bowl with you.

8 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: I believe  
9 that's the only questions I have.  
10 Legislator Becker and then turning it over  
11 to the minority leader.

12 LEGISLATOR BECKER: I don't have  
13 any questions, just a quick statement, Mr.  
14 Ratner, you don't have to get up.

15 If it's at all possible, you've  
16 been great as far as union labor here and it  
17 appears you are trying to reach out for  
18 restaurants that are local and other  
19 businesses, but I also appreciate, and I  
20 know you have your own people but maybe also  
21 consider in some of engineering services and  
22 other services, architects, whatever it may  
23 be, you're a big company, I know you have  
24 relationships. We have companies like  
25 Cameron Engineering and other great

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 engineering firms right here on Long Island.  
3 If you could consider using them in your  
4 work it would just be wonderful. Thank you.

5 MR. BLUMENFELD: I'll take this  
6 one. I think most of you know us and Bruce  
7 and I have been partners for 12 or 13 years.  
8 I saw Jack here from the Building Trades  
9 Council. We built the Arches which was the  
10 single largest project on Long Island in  
11 2007, 2008. It was all union. We used  
12 local engineers, local architects. We do a  
13 lot of inhouse, civil engineering, public  
14 engineering, whether it's Cameron or RMS, we  
15 know them all, and we will take into  
16 consideration. We have to negotiate, like  
17 Bruce said, we have to deliver a product  
18 that's economic.

19 Yes, we will talk to everyone,  
20 yes, we will consider local hiring, and the  
21 numbers he gave you on jobs does not include  
22 the retail. So we are going to estimate  
23 another thousand jobs for the retail  
24 development.

25 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Minority

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 Leader Abrahams.

3 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Thank you,  
4 Madam Presiding Officer.

5 How are you, Mr. Ratner?

6 MR. RATNER: Fine. Thank you.

7 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I wish  
8 there was a way for you to sit at the table.  
9 I apologize for you having to stand through  
10 this because I think some of my colleagues  
11 have questions.

12 But I want to actually start with  
13 the project labor agreement. And I know my  
14 colleagues have asked you about it already  
15 but I think I want to get a little bit more  
16 in depth.

17 I know there has been a lot of  
18 commentary in Newsday and I want to make  
19 sure that I'm completely understanding.

20 When the communities, not just in  
21 the immediate area, but the communities at  
22 large that are looking for this project as a  
23 bounce in our economy to put people, many of  
24 our folks are labor people, to put them to  
25 work, when can they anticipate an actual

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 shovel put into the ground?

3 MR. RATNER: As soon as the  
4 Islanders move out which is July 31st, 2015  
5 so August 1st, '15.

6 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: That would  
7 be the earliest in terms of construction  
8 work, yes.

9 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: One of the  
10 things that we had specified and I thank you  
11 for getting back to us with responses and we  
12 had specified in one of our letters in  
13 regards to the PLA was a commitment to use  
14 unionized labor. You committed that in this  
15 letter and one of the things that we were  
16 concerned about that was tied into concern  
17 was any loopholes in the agreement that can  
18 deviate from that.

19 But, you talked about your track  
20 record. Have you ever had a project that  
21 you worked on where you have not used  
22 unionized labor?

23 MR. RATNER: No.

24 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: That's good  
25 to hear. And you do not plan to?

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 MR. RATNER: Do not plan to.

3 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: So we  
4 should anticipate, not to try give away all  
5 your leverage, but we should anticipate a  
6 project that has union in mind and a PLA in  
7 place?

8 MR. RATNER: Yes. Absolutely.  
9 And we've negotiated a lot of PLAs. Dick  
10 O'Kane, who is head of the trades council  
11 here, worked on our Barclays Center. Worked  
12 extremely well with him. He was head of the  
13 ironworkers, now taken over the head of the  
14 trades council here. And we will be able to  
15 work out a PLA agreement that's both  
16 favorable to unions and favorable to us and  
17 most importantly favorable to local labor.

18 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Thank you.

19 Just before I move on to my next  
20 questions, I want to make sure, I don't know  
21 if all my colleagues had the opportunity to  
22 see this letter with your responses, so I  
23 will ask if we can clock this in as part of  
24 the record so everybody can have an  
25 opportunity -- and this was a letter that

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 was from Forest City Ratner which was  
3 answering the questions that I specified.

4 The next topic I wanted to go  
5 into was, I know there was a Q and A back  
6 and forth with Deputy Presiding Officer  
7 Nicolello in regards to the minor league  
8 hockey. I was able to see the letter that  
9 you've given to us from September 19th  
10 indicating Mr. Wang's intent to bring a  
11 minor league hockey team to the Coliseum.

12 However, as you probably know,  
13 the minor league hockey team that's in  
14 Bridgeport signed an extension going to 2021  
15 which I guess that's why Mr. Wang made it  
16 his intent to write this letter.

17 But my only concern is then, if  
18 there is an agreement here and he has to  
19 backfill the team in Bridgeport, that would  
20 be with another entity and another owner,  
21 correct?

22 MR. RATNER: Yes.

23 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: So he would  
24 have to engage in somebody who is a separate  
25 owner to backfill that team.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 MR. RATNER: Yes, correct.

3 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: And he  
4 still -- and I'm asking you the question, he  
5 still feels confident that he would be able  
6 to negotiate a deal with another owner?

7 MR. RATNER: In fact I happened  
8 to see him Saturday night and he reiterated  
9 that to me. I don't think that's an issue.  
10 I think he can do that.

11 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: In the  
12 event he's not able to do that, and it looks  
13 like to me that this team wouldn't be there  
14 until 2016, 2017, which falls in line with  
15 the construction of the facility so that  
16 shouldn't be a problem, but in the event he  
17 wasn't able to do that, you had specified or  
18 the county specified that there's going to  
19 be 309 nine events at the facility; am I  
20 correct by saying that?

21 MR. RATNER: Correct. Yes,  
22 approximately.

23 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: So  
24 approximating the 309 events, I believe 40  
25 something that's going to be associated with



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 minor league hockey. I'm trying to pull it  
3 up here in the presentation.

4 MR. RATNER: 38.

5 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I was  
6 rounding up. Maybe they'll make the  
7 playoffs and I'm optimistic.

8 That being said, if they were not  
9 able to come, how would you envision  
10 backfilling or is that something that's a  
11 deal breaker if they weren't able to come,  
12 would you still go forward with the project  
13 if they weren't able to be here?

14 MR. RATNER: We absolutely will  
15 go forward with the project. First of all,  
16 we try and buy another team, another minor  
17 league team, from somewhere and try and  
18 bring them in. If not, we try to replace  
19 them with another sport. It's not critical  
20 to the economics. It's more that we really  
21 want to serve what people want here and this  
22 is a hockey town.

23 The economics, whether they come  
24 or not, is not the end of the world but it's  
25 important for us because this is where

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 hockey has had a tremendous history. So  
3 we'd try and buy one or bring one -- Brett,  
4 can you comment?

5 MR. YORMARK: Yes. Just to the  
6 point made, it's really not the amount of  
7 events, it's how many people you get into  
8 the venue. We're estimating 1.2 million.  
9 So if for some reason we couldn't get an NHL  
10 team, we couldn't buy one, we backfill it,  
11 give us more flexibility with concerts which  
12 are more profitable, so it gives us the  
13 latitude to do a lot of different things,  
14 one of which is to buy an AHL but that's not  
15 necessarily going to be ultimately the best  
16 solution. We would look at it and examine  
17 where we might be able to monetize some  
18 other programming, concerts being one.

19 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Before I  
20 move on from the event summary type which  
21 you have specified on this page, is there  
22 anything that this body, this legislative  
23 body should be concerned about that would  
24 prevent you from going forward, that didn't  
25 come to fruition?

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 Because a lot of this stuff is  
3 bulked in together and, I apologize, maybe  
4 the public got a chance to see it, but other  
5 sporting events, 29 family shows, 54, if  
6 something were to change and you weren't  
7 able to do these projects, would that impact  
8 your project from you going forward?

9 MR. YORMARK: No. We feel very  
10 comfortable about the programming mix and  
11 obviously it might change a bit, but, like I  
12 said earlier, we have over 200 letters of  
13 commitment for 200 events, family shows,  
14 college basketball, boxing, hockey, we are  
15 very confident that we are going to program  
16 this building and make it best in class.

17 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Before I  
18 relinquish my time I just have a quick  
19 question. I know you probably got this this  
20 morning, Mr. Ratner, and my office was able  
21 to forward it to you today. I'm not sure if  
22 you are familiar with the coalition GUAAC,  
23 Greater Uniondale Area Action Coalition,  
24 probably not?

25 MR. RATNER: No.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: They were  
3 trying to put together a meeting with your  
4 office. They represent dozens of interested  
5 parties in the Greater Uniondale area in  
6 general. As you know, I'm also the  
7 legislator for that area. I share that area  
8 with Legislator Troiano.

9 But one of the things I wanted to  
10 put on the letter is the letter that I  
11 received from Ashley Cotton indicating that  
12 you will reach out to them as quickly as  
13 possible and I urge you to do that so you  
14 can have as much community support in what  
15 you're trying to do, but, in fairness to  
16 what they're trying to do, I understand you  
17 may have received their letter a little bit  
18 late, I just want to highlight some of the  
19 points that they've made and hear your  
20 commentary regarding it.

21 One of the things that I believe  
22 they specified was pertaining to the Living  
23 Wage Law Compliance. One of the concerns in  
24 I guess Section 58.1 on page 87, and we  
25 talked about it before with the PLAs, but

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 obviously going forward with the permanent  
3 jobs it would be -- would you envision those  
4 jobs being paid at a living wage as well, or  
5 how does that --

6 MR. RATNER: I'm not familiar  
7 with the Living Wage Law out here, if there  
8 is one, is there a living wage specific law  
9 here, or is -- is there a specific living  
10 wage law are you referring to generally a  
11 living wage?

12 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Specific.

13 MR. RATNER: I'm very familiar  
14 with living wage generally, very familiar.  
15 Generally I believe in living wage, support  
16 the living wage. I believe it's a very  
17 important thing. I don't believe in \$7 an  
18 hour jobs.

19 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Good.

20 Well, I think their greater point is, they  
21 would like to know that the young person  
22 that's working in a movie theater or  
23 restaurant or anywhere, that they would be  
24 paid a wage that commensurate with being  
25 able to live in Nassau County.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 MR. RATNER: Well, one of the  
3 problems is, we can not control what our  
4 retailers do. So, for example, I can't  
5 control really what the movie theater will  
6 do. Obviously we are sway on them, we can  
7 push and shove, so on and so forth, but, at  
8 the end of the day, we can only control the  
9 employees that in direct control of ours.

10 So one of the difficulties we  
11 have as a developer, we'll develop a  
12 shopping center, might be a Target, I don't  
13 want to say a specific name, and they may or  
14 may not pay what I think they ought to pay.  
15 But what we can do is simply control our own  
16 people.

17 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Is it  
18 possible to put into their leases or  
19 anything like that?

20 MR. RATNER: It's very difficult  
21 to do that. We have tried that in the past  
22 and there's a lot of different issues  
23 involved. First of all, they usually won't  
24 make a commitment, for one thing, and,  
25 second, there's other legal issues involved.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I guess  
3 what their point is --

4 MR. RATNER: I don't disagree  
5 with the point.

6 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: No, No. I  
7 understand and I appreciate your honesty. I  
8 think what their greater point is, we have  
9 this property, it's 77 acres in size and  
10 they would like to know that of the 2,700  
11 jobs --

12 MR. RATNER: 2,700 jobs. 2,000  
13 are operations arena related. 700 to 1000  
14 are --

15 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: They would  
16 like to know that there's going to be jobs  
17 that support people's ability to live here.  
18 I mean, what's the essence of announcing and  
19 having these jobs and then they go to other  
20 areas that basically may be can afford to  
21 travel in and get paid a lesser salary. I  
22 think that's the greater point.

23 I think, ultimately, if you sit  
24 down and meet with them, which I'm  
25 encouraging you to do, when you do sit down

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 and meet with them, I think that's an issue  
3 that, if we could work through it, I would  
4 love to be able to see that get done because  
5 the last thing we need is to be able have  
6 jobs and people can't support their  
7 families.

8 MR. RATNER: I agree  
9 wholeheartedly. You have a developer that  
10 will do whatever we can to try to effectuate  
11 that. Obviously 2000 jobs will be living  
12 wage, I know approximately what living wage  
13 means in dollars, depending on who decides  
14 the difference between 9 and \$11 the jobs  
15 operationally will pay in excess of that.

16 Not worried about the 2000, I  
17 share the same concern on the retail jobs  
18 and we're happy to sit down with the group  
19 and see what we can do with the retailers  
20 when they come. Some will be more difficult  
21 than others.

22 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: The next  
23 question I guess might be more appropriate  
24 for Mr. Blumenfeld. Is there a commitment  
25 for -- obviously one of the concerns that



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 they brought out was the fact there is a ton  
3 of fast food in that area. I'm not  
4 proposing that you bring in fast food, but  
5 they want to make sure that folks in that  
6 immediate area have options to healthy food  
7 choices. The restaurants that we're talking  
8 about bring it in, even though I know there  
9 are a lot of restaurants in that vicinity  
10 already, the restaurants we're committing to  
11 bringing in are respectable restaurants that  
12 would have healthy food choices on their  
13 menus and so on and so forth?

14 MR. RATNER: The answer is yes.  
15 As you know, pretty much every restaurant  
16 that one deals has healthy choices. The  
17 problem we all have, collectively, is  
18 getting people to do them. I'm all for  
19 healthy choices, but you send me to a ball  
20 game and I'll have a few hot dogs and french  
21 fries. So I'm all for healthy, all the  
22 restaurants, both the Barclays Center, we  
23 have a tremendous healthy part of our menu.  
24 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: That's good  
25 to hear.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 MR. RATNER: So we are all for it  
3 and I'm sure all the restaurants will try  
4 and share that but getting people to do it  
5 is another matter.

6 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: The next  
7 line of questioning feeds into aesthetics.  
8 I know when we met I gave you kind of the  
9 layout, that property faces the Uniondale  
10 area directly, right across Hempstead  
11 Turnpike in Legislative District One.

12 One of the concerns that has been  
13 brought out by the community is the fact  
14 that -- the way the facade is done, that  
15 there's images on top of, I guess for  
16 advertising purposes, is aesthetically not  
17 presentable and attractive to the community.

18 Do you foresee continuing that  
19 kind of advertising or not, and how would  
20 you perceive --

21 MR. RATNER: That's an  
22 interesting and really good question. We  
23 struggle with that in a lot of different  
24 things that we do. If we use the Barclays  
25 Center as an example, both inside and

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 outside, that was a major concern of ours.  
3 Because, honestly, it really hurts the whole  
4 look of the place. And what I said to you,  
5 we're committed to good architecture,  
6 whether it be having built the New York  
7 Times building or the Geary building in  
8 downtown Brooklyn or a lot of our other  
9 projects, our firm is known for good  
10 architecture with a capital A.

11 So what do you do about those  
12 kind of signs? What you try to do is  
13 integrate in a way in which they are not  
14 offensive. The way we dealt with it in  
15 Barclays, we had them in facing. There's a  
16 giant canopy and all of the advertising is  
17 the inside so it doesn't go out to the  
18 community.

19 If we walk into the Barclays  
20 Center arena, you won't even notice that  
21 it's got more sponsors than any arena in the  
22 country. They blend in, both, whether it be  
23 the color or whether it be the type-face  
24 throughout the arena, and, yet, they don't  
25 stick out at you.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 We are highly conscious of that  
3 in really every thing we do. Unless it's an  
4 area like 42nd Street. You don't want to  
5 have signs all over the place. You don't  
6 want them disorderly, you don't want to have  
7 them bright, you want them to -- you can  
8 have signs that look absolutely beautiful.

9 Brett, if you want to make  
10 another comment about that because Brett  
11 really does it.

12 MR. YORMARK: I think Bruce  
13 really said it. We are going to take less  
14 is more approach, no different than we did  
15 at the Barclays Center. Much of the sponsor  
16 activation will be part of the architecture.  
17 We like to call it subtle reinforcement. So  
18 it will be very tastefully done. Our goal  
19 is to have fewer partners than more. That  
20 right now is how we're building our pro  
21 forma.

22 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: All right.  
23 That's good to hear.

24 One of the concerns, it was  
25 specified I guess in Section 53, you do know

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 the impact that Super Storm Sandy had on or  
3 particular area. Right now the college,  
4 Nassau County Community College is a  
5 designated shelter, but there was language  
6 in here that this section that they had  
7 brought about which would give I guess, you,  
8 the tenant, the ability to remove or not  
9 allow the Coliseum to be a shelter. Is that  
10 something that you are familiar with?

11 MR. RATNER: I'm not actually.  
12 Jim Lester or Rob.

13 CHIEF DEPUTY COUNTY EXEC WALKER:  
14 The one thing we learned from Hurricane  
15 Katrina and Rita with the damage -- the used  
16 the New Orleans Super Dome I believe, or I  
17 believe it's called the Super Dome, they  
18 have some naming rights now, is that we  
19 would not be utilizing or nor would want to  
20 utilize the Coliseum as an indoor shelter.  
21 We do not believe it's the right place. A  
22 lot of incidents occurred, and all you have  
23 to do is look at them, from crimes to --  
24 crimes against not only property but  
25 individuals and things of that nature, we

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 would not want to use the Coliseum, the  
3 internal part of the Coliseum.

4 What we would use is the parking  
5 lot for staging and things of that nature,  
6 but we do not think it is appropriate from  
7 the exercises that we learned in other  
8 places, by having such big big facilities,  
9 you can't manage it public safety-wise, and  
10 it brings about some major issues.

11 We have plenty of sheltering in  
12 lines with last year's storm. We only  
13 utilized five of roughly 30 facilities that  
14 we have memorandum of understandings with,  
15 and we would continue to use it more.

16 So it does not hamper any type of  
17 emergency management operation at all and,  
18 again, we wouldn't be utilizing it anyway.

19 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Rob, as  
20 long as you feel comfortable that the  
21 shelters that we have are going to be  
22 adequate. I mean, God forbid we have  
23 another Super Storm Sandy, and I hope to God  
24 we don't --

25 CHIEF DEPUTY COUNTY EXEC WALKER:

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 You and me both.

3 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: In the  
4 event we do, we just want to make sure that  
5 every facility, everything the county can do  
6 to make sure that our residents are  
7 protected is there.

8 CHIEF DEPUTY COUNTY EXEC WALKER:  
9 We agree.

10 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: A facility  
11 such as that just seems to be obvious but if  
12 you feel we don't need to do it, maybe just  
13 the parking lot for staging purposes, we'll  
14 accept that.

15 I just want to also say, I just  
16 want to incorporate the GUAAC letter into  
17 the record. That's what Presiding Officer  
18 Gonsalves wanted to do as well just to make  
19 sure, which stands for Greater Uniondale  
20 Area Action Coalition is incorporated into  
21 the record.

22 CHIEF DEPUTY COUNTY EXEC WALKER:  
23 We received that letter too. We're going to  
24 meet with them and feel free to join us and  
25 Legislator Troiano at the same time if you

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 want to have a joint meeting with us, the  
3 both of you, and obviously Forest City, NEC  
4 would meet at the same time.

5 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I look  
6 forward to meeting with you with them. I  
7 think it's imperative. They did say that  
8 obviously when the county went and did the  
9 rounds when it came to referendum as well as  
10 the Coliseum, they had an opportunity to  
11 meet with them and would love to meet with  
12 NEC also in addition.

13 The last point that I want to  
14 bring up, and this is for Mr. Ratner, and  
15 then I will pass my time over to the next  
16 person, is tied into -- one of the things  
17 that the Greater Uniondale Area Action  
18 Coalition is looking to try to do is a  
19 community benefit that's specified for the  
20 Uniondale, East Meadow and the greater area  
21 of that particular area.

22 They received commitments from I  
23 guess the hub developer in Mr. Monti and  
24 they wanted to know if that's something that  
25 you would take a look into and possibly



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 consider. One of the things they are  
3 stressing is that obviously there is a  
4 benefit -- or there should be a community  
5 benefit that's drafted so that the groups in  
6 that particular area have an opportunity to  
7 access not just the restaurants and the  
8 movie theaters, but the entire development  
9 on what's going on.

10 Quite frankly, that should give  
11 priority to the immediate areas obviously  
12 but then it should be extended to the entire  
13 county, so that Boy Scout groups and other  
14 groups are not being -- and have an  
15 opportunity to access a county facility and  
16 they just want to make sure -- I'm not doing  
17 their statement enough justice because they  
18 specified a lot of things in their community  
19 benefit agreement but I think that should  
20 come out when you get a chance to meet with  
21 them, or I can give it to you now, but is  
22 that something that you would be --

23 MR. RATNER: Yes, we have done  
24 community benefit agreements before, access  
25 to community is very important. We have a

1                   Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2       certain number of tickets set aside for many  
3       of the events at Barclays. As a matter of  
4       fact, I just went to the equivalent of  
5       almost a GUAAC in which they gave our  
6       company an award for basically giving  
7       thousands of tickets equal by a lottery to  
8       community groups and it was wonderful.  
9       Because what it wound up doing is, it brings  
10      community groups close together because they  
11      all work together. It's done by a lottery  
12      system, the tickets, so you don't get  
13      favoritism, one way or the other, and it  
14      wound up having a lot of benefits. It was a  
15      wonderful event that kind of celebrates  
16      having local community groups be able to  
17      give tickets to their members or just to  
18      young people. Young people seeing the  
19      circus for the first time. What could be  
20      greater?

21                   LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: The two big  
22      things that I can gather from what they're  
23      talking about, and, one, Legislator Troiano  
24      is going to dive into, which is in the  
25      minority business and women enterprise, but

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 the two bigs that I can gather from what  
3 they're talking about is obviously the job  
4 training and business referral center,  
5 something that the community can get a  
6 benefit from.

7 Also, one of the other big items  
8 is tied into educational programs which I  
9 think you talked about before. Those are  
10 the types of things that they are looking to  
11 try to do and, hopefully, they received  
12 commitments in the past from Mr. Wang and  
13 others that have provided commitments that  
14 they are going to try to do these things.

15 The community area has also been  
16 trying to get a community center for a long  
17 time. I have been working with them to try  
18 to do that. These are the types of things  
19 and -- they need funding. They need  
20 support. A project of this magnitude which  
21 is going to be hundreds of millions of  
22 dollars, from our standpoint, there should  
23 be some type of community benefit agreement  
24 that if Forest City is going to be able to  
25 be with us for 30 some odd years in this

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 lease, that they are going to be a  
3 responsible and good community partner,  
4 which I know you have demonstrated in other  
5 areas that you have been in. So we look  
6 forward to that same demonstration.

7 MR. RATNER: We do too.

8 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Thank you,  
9 Mr. Ratner.

10 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator  
11 DeRiggi-Whitton.

12 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: Hi,  
13 Mr. Ratner. It's a pleasure to meet you and  
14 I have to say that I was impressed with your  
15 presentation, not only today, but also I  
16 attended the one at the country club where  
17 there were four of you at that point. I'm  
18 happy that you're here and we do hold a lot  
19 of hope.

20 I'm a Hofstra graduate and a  
21 resident of Tower C and our whole room was  
22 orange because I do believe she chose  
23 Hofstra because of the Islanders and I know  
24 how much team spirit is such an important  
25 part of our community. And the Coliseum is

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 such a great representative of that, plus I  
3 really believe that the Islanders are really  
4 our hometown team.

5 But I just wanted to ask you a  
6 couple of questions about that to start  
7 with. There's a letter that I have a copy  
8 of from Mr. Wang which is dated June 6th  
9 which just states that he is ready to commit  
10 to the six Islander games annually at the  
11 Coliseum subject to the NHL approval.

12 Do you know if we were able to  
13 obtain that approval?

14 MR. RATNER: We won't be able to  
15 attain it until we actually propose it to  
16 them -- Brett, you've spoken to the NHL?

17 MR. YORMARK: Yes. The NHL  
18 hasn't addressed it yet because obviously  
19 these proceedings have been ongoing.

20 We feel very confident that the  
21 Dolans are going to want hockey back here.  
22 They're good citizens from Long Island and  
23 we've got to give them more credit than  
24 thinking that they won't allow it to happen.  
25 So, between the NHL and the Dolans, we think

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 we'll get that done for sure.

3 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: But  
4 as of right now we don't have a firm  
5 commitment on the six games yet?

6 MR. YORMARK: We don't and we  
7 didn't expect to have it now. We expected  
8 it to be an ongoing process over the next  
9 couple of months.

10 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON:  
11 We've been trying to get a definitive  
12 answer. I know Legislator Judy Jacobs  
13 addressed this. Do you know if there's an  
14 exact number that's required by the NHL  
15 regarding seats?

16 MR. YORMARK: There is no  
17 requirement whatsoever.

18 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: So  
19 that's a rumor?

20 MR. YORMARK: There's nothing in  
21 there that requires a certain amount of  
22 seats. As a matter of fact, Ottawa, where  
23 the NHL is calling home now, has a little  
24 north of 14,000 seats, currently the  
25 smallest in the NHL. No problems there. We

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 don't anticipate any problems here or for  
3 that matter at Barclays.

4 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON:

5 Because ours will be less than that, ours  
6 will be about 13,000; is that right?

7 MR. YORMARK: Well, you know, as  
8 Bruce has said earlier, this is not going to  
9 be the permanent home. It's only going to  
10 be the home for four regular season games  
11 and two preseason games, so it will be more  
12 than adequate.

13 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON:

14 That's what I'm questioning. Because since  
15 we don't have the NHL approval yet, I just  
16 want to make sure we're not doing anything  
17 that would jeopardize that, even just for  
18 the six games, by lowering the number of  
19 seats?

20 MR. YORMARK: No. It shouldn't  
21 be an issue at all.

22 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: I  
23 guess while you're still standing there, I  
24 was just looking at some of the letters we  
25 received. I know that they are classified

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 as commitment letters, but many of them  
3 really don't come out and commit entirely.  
4 They're sort of vague a lot of them.

5 Do you have like an actual number  
6 of how many have been booked?

7 MR. YORMARK: Well, obviously  
8 it's tough to book two or three years in  
9 advance, so you want the intent of the  
10 promoters to want to come to the marketplace  
11 which all of them have expressed pretty  
12 clearly in all the letters. There are  
13 partners that we currently work with at  
14 Barclays and they want to extend the  
15 relationship here with us in Nassau County.

16 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: But  
17 it's fair to say that as far as actual  
18 commitments, we really haven't received too  
19 many yet, right, you just have the interest?

20 MR. YORMARK: Well, I wouldn't  
21 necessarily say that's the case. When you  
22 look at the Live Nation letter, the leading  
23 promoter in the country, the letter states  
24 20 to 30 shows, Rock Nation, another great  
25 content provider, states between five and



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 ten shows. So to the extent that they can  
3 give us the content guarantee, they have  
4 done that. Obviously it's two or three  
5 years out, so it's tough to determine who is  
6 going to be touring but given the fact that  
7 they have a lot of scale with respect to the  
8 artists, they have a good sense for who will  
9 be out there. So we feel very confident.

10 This is no different than what we  
11 did when we opened Barclays. We had gotten  
12 quite a few commitment letters, very similar  
13 to what you see in front of you and, as you  
14 heard from Bruce, we are the number one  
15 venue first six months of this year as well  
16 as ticket sales and revenue in the United  
17 States.

18 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: All  
19 right. Because it does, as someone who is  
20 just looking at it as our interest for the  
21 county, it does kind of just raise a few  
22 questions, like the Big Apple Circus, as  
23 there are willing to discuss further and  
24 further explore any development of mutual  
25 beneficial plan.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 MR. YORMARK: Well, I think in  
3 that particular case, again, timing, the  
4 seasonality of when they want to come in  
5 based on whether it's in the winter and  
6 whether we have conflicts or not.

7 Again, it's open ended to some  
8 degree, but we feel very confident. These  
9 are all relationships we have, and we do  
10 have leverage coming out of Barclays given  
11 our stature right now with respect to venues  
12 to bring that content right here.

13 MR. RATNER: Just one comment.  
14 For example, you picked one, Big Apple  
15 Circus. So Big Apple Circus is run by a  
16 woman that I've worked with for 15 years.  
17 She's actually a tenant in our building and  
18 we've talked her along -- she would love to  
19 come out here, but it's a nonprofit  
20 organization, they're not going to commit  
21 themselves in writing without their own --  
22 with their own board approval, they would  
23 love to come out here and I'm sure we can  
24 work it out and it's a great circus.

25 So it's more -- it's a lot of

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 Brett's personal relationships and my  
3 personal relationships to make sure these  
4 things happen along with the leverage of  
5 having Barclays.

6 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: And  
7 I understand that, and you have to  
8 understand for us, you do have a very good  
9 reputation, but we are kind of doing a leap  
10 of faith with you and, the history of this  
11 project, I have had other histories as the  
12 city councilwoman in Glen Cove for projects  
13 where we were all excited about and they  
14 never came to fruition. So we are really  
15 are trusting you and I guess that's part of  
16 my point today.

17 I just have one other quick  
18 question regarding the events. Parking lot  
19 events, so that's not going to be inside the  
20 Coliseum?

21 MR. YORMARK: No. Those are  
22 going to be outside.

23 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: So  
24 that consists of about a third of -- it's 83  
25 out of the 309?

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 MR. YORMARK: Yes, exactly  
3 correct. 45 for the most part will be  
4 circus related in our build up. We've got  
5 lifestyle programming, like car shows and  
6 things of that nature. We also have music  
7 festivals which have become very, very  
8 popular across the country.

9 One particular festival can  
10 attract upwards of 60,000 people over the  
11 course of a weekend. They just had one in  
12 Philadelphia two weeks ago and it's become  
13 very very popular across the country right  
14 now. We plan on doing similar types of  
15 programming here in Nassau; country  
16 festivals, EDM festivals, things of that  
17 nature.

18 MR. RATNER: Brett said  
19 something, which is 60,000. I'm very  
20 cognizant of this issue of traffic and  
21 noise. So I want to stress it's my job to  
22 talk about that. That is critical. So to  
23 have 60,000 during the weekend it's kind of  
24 a lot to say the lease.

25 Things like circuses that Brett

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 mentioned or, for example, something that  
3 we've done in New York City and a group I'm  
4 involved, a barbecue. We have the best  
5 barbecue chefs from all over the world come.  
6 They come and they do a tasting, attracts  
7 5,000, 10,000 people on a weekend. That  
8 sort of stuff that's kind of both fun and is  
9 not so large and noisy because that is a  
10 major issue.

11 So I would not be for having some  
12 outdoor music festival which creates a lot  
13 of noise.

14 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: I  
15 have one other line of questioning real  
16 quick. I'm on the finance committee here.  
17 There was one word or one sentence that made  
18 a number of us concerned. In the Section  
19 4.1, it says that tenant shall be relieved  
20 of the binding commitment if for some reason  
21 they're not reasonably satisfied basically  
22 with the financing condition.

23 I know I spoke with your group  
24 twice. We tried to get that revamped and I  
25 really wanted you to know why. I don't

1                   Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2     really question the fact that you will  
3     probably be able to get financing. But I  
4     have seen it before where, for instance, a  
5     project, someone discovered there was  
6     actually some type of DEC problem or some  
7     other issue that might interfere with what  
8     plans you have now and the cost might be  
9     beyond what you expect. So something  
10    completely not related.

11                    Could you see that that could  
12    actually give the person who is a tenant,  
13    like take yourself out of it almost, an  
14    excuse at that point to say, well, to get  
15    out of it, I'm not reasonably satisfied with  
16    the finances because I wanted one percent  
17    and I got three percent. That's all you  
18    would really have to do.

19                    I understand you are putting the  
20    money into it and the plan is great and your  
21    intentions are great, but there's nothing  
22    protecting the county for -- even if it's  
23    not financial, for some other reason should  
24    you decide not to go forward with this  
25    project for the next five years.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 MR. YORMARK: So I think in  
3 general in the lease there may be specific  
4 language, I think there is, good faith  
5 efforts and so on, good faith requirements  
6 for everything that we do, don't stop with  
7 due diligence. So I think that really  
8 covers it. We have to do stuff in good  
9 faith, so if we try to get out of it because  
10 we say something is not reasonable when it  
11 really is, that is not good faith.

12 So I think the good faith really  
13 creates a standard which is in almost all  
14 legal documents. Here it is a requirement  
15 that we operate in good faith and we operate  
16 with due diligence, and I think that really  
17 does cover it.

18 I also have to stress, obviously,  
19 as I said, if someone doesn't want to do a  
20 project, as you know, because you've had it  
21 happen here a lot of times, it almost  
22 doesn't make a difference what's written. It  
23 should be written the most positive possible  
24 way and we have done that that we can live  
25 with and abide by. I do have to say at the

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 end of the day, one does have to -- and I  
3 have a level of commitment, and we have a  
4 level of commitment, and, again, this is not  
5 a financing which is gigantic, it's just not  
6 that --

7 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: I'm  
8 not as concerned with the financing. I'm  
9 more concerned with something that we  
10 haven't thought of yet where this could be  
11 an out for pretty much any reason. Because  
12 it doesn't specifically say -- it doesn't  
13 even say good faith. It doesn't say  
14 anything or than the fact that you have to  
15 be reasonably satisfied. That's such a  
16 vague --

17 MR. YORMARK: But the document in  
18 general, the document requires good faith  
19 for everything we do and doing things with  
20 due diligence. So it does apply.

21 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON:  
22 Well, I'm putting you on the spot here. We  
23 really are counting on your good faith  
24 because I'm not happy with that language and  
25 I have expressed that about 15 times. I



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 think it's really vague and I feel a little  
3 bit uncomfortable, as happy as I am with  
4 your other projects, this is really  
5 bothering me. Because I would hate to see  
6 in three or four years you to come back and  
7 use the financing as some excuse to pull out  
8 after we had such faith.

9 MR. YORMARK: I understand.

10 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: And  
11 I just have one other quick question. As  
12 far as financing, how much do you expect to  
13 put into the Coliseum in terms of reno work?

14 MR. YORMARK: Approximately \$100  
15 million.

16 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON:  
17 Because just to be a stickler, which I'm  
18 afraid I am, a number of the letters of  
19 credit that you provided us with have a  
20 limit of about 50 to \$60 million for the  
21 project.

22 I haven't seen anything that says  
23 \$100 million for this project. So, again,  
24 I'm going on record saying I don't see any  
25 letters that say we have \$100 million in

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 financing. This lease in my opinion would  
3 get you out very quickly.

4 MR. RATNER: The answer is that I  
5 wish we could be 100 percent financing but  
6 that's not the way the world works.

7 There's about 50 to \$60 million  
8 in anticipated financing and about 30 to \$50  
9 million of equity from our company and our  
10 partners. So it's part equity and part  
11 financing.

12 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: So  
13 you are going to put cash in for part of it?

14 MR. RATNER: Us and our partners  
15 will put cash in for the remainder.

16 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: For  
17 approximately 50 percent?

18 MR. RATNER: Between 30 percent  
19 and 50 percent depending on how much  
20 financing we get.

21 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: Can  
22 you believe I don't have that in writing?  
23 Can you believe that we're entering into  
24 this 30 year lease and we don't have those  
25 details. So I'm telling you that I'm

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 supporting it but, as a person of integrity  
3 which you appear to have without a question  
4 in my mind, I really hope that you don't let  
5 us down because the residents of Nassau  
6 County are really banking on this.

7 And one last little plug for my  
8 roommate, if you can get more than six  
9 games, I think we can split it like Judy  
10 Jacobs mentioned once, 20/20, or even a  
11 little bit more than six, I think it would  
12 really go a long way, still have that  
13 hometown feel.

14 MR. RATNER: I appreciate that.  
15 I think it's not as economically, as has  
16 been pointed out, I don't think it's  
17 possible for us to come out economically, or  
18 Mr. Wang, rather, to come out economically  
19 and do much more than that because of suites  
20 and all the other kinds of things.

21 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: But  
22 even just for like 10, you think? If we can  
23 get a little more than six.

24 MR. RATNER: I think not.

25 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON:

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 Thank you.

3 MR. RATNER: I'm being honest  
4 with you. You want me to be direct, I'm  
5 being direct.

6 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: I  
7 want you to be honest and forthright.

8 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: That's the  
9 way you should be, Mr. Ratner.

10 Legislator Troiano.

11 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: Welcome to  
12 Nassau.

13 MR. RATNER: Believe it or not  
14 I'm here a lot. I have a lot of relatives  
15 out here, my wife is from here.

16 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: I appreciate  
17 you, yourself, coming before us here today  
18 and spending all this time here and bringing  
19 so much of your talent with you as well to  
20 share in this moment, which really is a  
21 great moment for Nassau County.

22 We are going to get what I think  
23 is going to be a great civic asset in Nassau  
24 County and I'm very pleased by that.

25 I'm especially pleased to hear

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Full Legislature/9-23-13

about some of the features you plan on bringing to the Coliseum which I think will add to the attractiveness of our county for some of our younger people, many of whom find it very expensive to live here and, even when they find a way to do that, there is a vast oasis here of nothingness. So it's great to have you bring some of the attractions that would be attractive to them. Thank you for that.

In addition to it being a great civic asset, and we didn't talk much about this today, it's also going to be a great boom to economic development which we so desperately need in Nassau County.

With that, I appreciate the fact that you have agreed in the lease to make your best effort to use union help. In your statements today, you said you also want to make sure there is a preponderance of local residents hired to work, I guess both in the construction and also, once it's constructed, in the restaurants and stores that opened up afterwards; is that correct?

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 MR. RATNER: Yes, in particular,  
3 and you realize because it's union, they  
4 have rules monitored by the federal  
5 government as to order and where people come  
6 from. So, for example, if someone is on a  
7 particular list for seniority, you can't  
8 jump them locally.

9 What we do is, we work really  
10 hard with the unions for the journeymen and  
11 the entry level jobs, not the journeymen,  
12 but the entry level jobs, particularly, to  
13 be local. We work very hard on it.

14 But there are federal  
15 requirements with respect to the way in  
16 which unions are permitted to take from  
17 lists and jumping lists for obvious reasons.  
18 Subject to that, certainly for the permanent  
19 operations, that's not the case. Permanent  
20 operations is easy to hire locally, we want  
21 to hire locally, we want to in general on  
22 all the areas. In the union case, there are  
23 for good reasons very specific requirements  
24 laid out by the federal government.

25 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: You know, we

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Full Legislature/9-23-13

haven't had very much discussion about this although it did come up in the hearing a couple of weeks ago that we would encourage you also to maybe help facilitate the apprenticeship programs a lot the unions maintain. A lot of those programs actually take place in Suffolk County as opposed to Nassau County. And it's a burden for some of our residents to get to Suffolk County. Maybe theirs is a way that we can help facilitate getting them to the apprenticeship programs.

MR. RATNER: Actually, we're very familiar with that. In the case of New York City, we have a program where the unions have three categories; women, which they attempt to get all apprenticeships with women; with veterans; and with local people. Those are the three areas. It's actually high school. Young people who do not graduate from high school.

They have three specific programs. I don't know what the union has out here. If not, we can certainly help

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 them devise that, but that's where our  
3 apprentices come from. The union feeds us  
4 people from those three groups. They train,  
5 they've had this program not only for us but  
6 for everybody. We encourage that.

7 And, in the case of Barclays, I  
8 think I want to say, if I'm right, I don't  
9 know where Linda is, but we actually  
10 negotiated stronger numbers, correct. In  
11 other words, the union may say we want one  
12 apprentice for every four journeymen or  
13 something. So we negotiated better numbers  
14 than that with the union in the PLA.

15 So one of the reasons to have a  
16 PLA is really for the community. It's not  
17 only for the union, it's really to make sure  
18 to try and get as many that qualify for, in  
19 this case, the union wants those three  
20 programs.

21 So the first question is whether  
22 union have that kind of program, I don't  
23 know if you know locally whether they have  
24 that. But if they have that program, we are  
25 very familiar with how to create a program



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 within the union that deals with what are  
3 the major issues for the community, whether  
4 they want local hiring, whether they're  
5 concerned about high school graduates or  
6 non-graduates, whether they're concerned  
7 about veterans, which, of course, we all  
8 are. So it's veterans, women and people who  
9 did not graduate from high school.

10 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: Even though  
11 you have relatives from Nassau County, you  
12 may not be aware that the Village of  
13 Hempstead is going through a revitalization  
14 project. As part of that, they are  
15 establishing a training program for local  
16 residents. Perhaps we can piggyback  
17 whatever your efforts are with theirs and  
18 get a better effect.

19 MR. RATNER: That would be great.  
20 Really, it's union dependent. The question  
21 is whether they already have something and  
22 whether they want to add to it. But we will  
23 push tremendously for what the interest of  
24 the local community is.

25 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: One of the

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 things that I am concerned with --

3 MR. RATNER: You have to  
4 remember, there is regular local union  
5 members who have be out of jobs in many  
6 cases for a long time, so there is a  
7 delicate balance that the union has to make  
8 in terms of apprentice and journeymen. I'm  
9 not saying one way or the other, but it's  
10 something that there's so many different  
11 stakeholders here and we are aware of it  
12 and, at the end of the day, what's important  
13 to us is both the union and the local  
14 community to try to get as many jobs for  
15 both.

16 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: Again, I  
17 appreciate your commitment to hiring both  
18 union help and employing as much as possible  
19 local residents.

20 But, as you are aware, I have  
21 been disappointed by the fact that the lease  
22 agreement negotiated with the county doesn't  
23 include any provision for contracting with  
24 minority and women-owned business  
25 enterprises in Nassau County or anywhere

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 else for that matter. In fact, it's just  
3 silent with respect to that.

4 Maybe you can't discuss this, and  
5 you're not in a position to know, but I'm  
6 curious and maybe Rob wants to talk to this,  
7 I'm curious as to why that language was not  
8 included in the lease agreement as it is  
9 generally included in most contracts entered  
10 into by the county for the construction of  
11 anything in this county.

12 MR. RATNER: So let me just say  
13 my part and then you can comment, Rob.

14 For our part, we can talk about  
15 after that what we plan to do and we have  
16 this understanding that we will sit in the  
17 next 30 days and work on specifics, but,  
18 Rob, did you want to comment?

19 CHIEF DEPUTY COUNTY EXEC WALKER:  
20 Really, the lease was gone through very  
21 extensively. I think more important than  
22 having any types of goals is having somebody  
23 that actually has done it and it's up to us  
24 really right now to take Bruce, which he has  
25 been nothing but a great person to work with

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 and his team through this process to ensure  
3 that our local residents and we achieve the  
4 highest level of standard that we possible  
5 can. There's really no reason. It wasn't  
6 omitted of any intent.

7 A lot of times you put a goal in  
8 mind or you put a number in the contract and  
9 you can reach it or sometimes you can't  
10 reach it for whatever reason. Even in some  
11 of our contracts today, we work very  
12 aggressively in this county on having more  
13 women and minority owned businesses  
14 registered and then trying to actually get  
15 them to achieve and some of our work has  
16 been very challenging for a lot of different  
17 reasons, but that outreach will continue  
18 and, in this case, as said, there was no  
19 intent of anybody to omit or not include  
20 anything of this and we look forward to  
21 working with them to see as many residents  
22 able to participate.

23 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: I  
24 appreciate, Rob, that Mr. Ratner has a  
25 really great track record, but it just seems

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 prudent on behalf of any governmental entity  
3 to protect all of its citizens by putting in  
4 writing provisions that protect them as is  
5 done in every other contract. It seems to  
6 be a real omission to have excluded from  
7 this contract which is one of the biggest  
8 ones in Nassau County we'll ever enter into.

9 CHIEF DEPUTY COUNTY EXEC WALKER:  
10 I wish I can say it was omitted on purpose,  
11 but it was not.

12 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: Well, I'm  
13 glad you're not going to say that.

14 CHIEF DEPUTY COUNTY EXEC WALKER:  
15 Just a lot of extensive negotiations went  
16 through this. I don't know if Josh Meyer  
17 wanted to comment, but it's an extensive  
18 extensive process that I hope there are  
19 other things that aren't omitted down, or we  
20 have to down the road make some adjustments  
21 to it.

22 MR. MEYER: Thank you for that  
23 question as well. I'm Josh Meyer from  
24 Pannone, Lopes, Devereaux & West.

25 It is part of the standard county

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 contracts, it's not part of the standard  
3 county leases, and, in this case, where the  
4 county was not expending any money on a  
5 construction project, so it was not  
6 included, as you say, it may have been more  
7 prudent to include it, but we were basing it  
8 off of prior leases that the county has  
9 entered into, especially for this sized  
10 project. But it wasn't part of a standard  
11 county lease in the past, so we did not  
12 incorporate it.

13 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: But this  
14 lease, as you call it, provides for the use  
15 of union labor.

16 MR. MEYER: Understood.

17 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: Is that  
18 typical that leases entered into by the  
19 county include provisions for using union  
20 labor?

21 MR. MEYER: For leases, yes,  
22 there are good faith efforts but not  
23 necessary --

24 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: For  
25 construction?

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 MR. MEYER: Yes, for  
3 construction.

4 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: So it's your  
5 testimony, Josh, that leases entered into by  
6 the county, that those leases always include  
7 provisions for hiring union labor but not  
8 for MWBEs?

9 MR. MEYER: I couldn't say that  
10 for sure, it's just that --

11 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: Well, that's  
12 what I'm concerned about.

13 MR. MEYER: Prior standard leases  
14 that we looked at did not incorporate the  
15 MWBE.

16 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: But they did  
17 include union labor but excluded MWBEs --

18 MR. MEYER: I can't say everyone  
19 has, but certain ones --

20 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: Well, if  
21 that is in fact the case, which I'm doubtful  
22 of, then I would suggest that the county,  
23 and, Rob, I would ask you to look at that in  
24 the future and let's establish a process  
25 whereby we always ensure that MWBE programs

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 are provided for.

3 And, by the way, we have a  
4 department whose intent is to do just that.  
5 So we ought to make use of that department's  
6 process.

7 CHIEF DEPUTY COUNTY EXEC WALKER:  
8 I think, obviously you bring up a great  
9 point, without hesitation, I think we look  
10 to mirror more of our construction type  
11 contracts with lease agreements and I think  
12 it's a great idea. With other types of  
13 public private partnerships, especially we  
14 have gone through with a lot of them for a  
15 variety of reasons, it saves the county  
16 money and we rather have privately financed  
17 facilities throughout the county and a  
18 public private partnership, so we definitely  
19 will look at that and include it as our  
20 boiler plate. I think that's a great idea.

21 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: Well, given  
22 that acknowledgement and the importance of  
23 providing language like that in our  
24 contracts going forward, would you consider  
25 opening up this contract to include that



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 language now?

3 CHIEF DEPUTY COUNTY EXEC WALKER:

4 Let me say this, I don't want to negotiate  
5 here, this is a total labor intensive  
6 negotiation, and I wouldn't want to start  
7 negotiating on the floor but it's something  
8 that we could talk about and we'll talk  
9 about with them later on today.

10 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: Well, I'm  
11 not sure how much negotiation is required  
12 because the county already has got such  
13 language in it that requires other  
14 contractors to live by.

15 MR. RATNER: I'm not going to go  
16 through our history, I don't have to explain  
17 that, but I understand what you're saying.

18 We will sit down with you in the  
19 next three days and we will make our  
20 commitment as a goal of 20 percent, we'll  
21 create a monitoring mechanism in a way that  
22 we openly show you what we're doing, and, as  
23 you know, it's not only the numbers of the  
24 monitoring, it's how it's done, and we have  
25 a whole procedure for that. We're more than

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 happy to sit down and we'll give ourselves a  
3 30 day period to try to come up with  
4 something that tracks pretty much what lease  
5 language may or might have done, and give it  
6 to you in a signed letter form. It's very  
7 important and we're happy to do it.

8 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: Mr. Ratner,  
9 I appreciate your commitment to this concept  
10 and, when we met about two weeks ago, you at  
11 that point said to me you are committed to  
12 this, and I saw a look in your eye and I  
13 believe that you are, I've seen that again  
14 today.

15 I have had discussions with some  
16 of your representatives today and some part  
17 of last week and those discussions have been  
18 substantive. So I do believe that it is  
19 your intent to comply with your verbal  
20 commitment, but a great leader, a great  
21 president of ours from the last century, I'm  
22 dating myself now, operated by the  
23 philosophy and the statement, "trust but  
24 verify."

25 MR. RATNER: And that's why I've

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 said very specifically, we're prepared to  
3 sit down if the next 30 days, come up with  
4 language that would track the lease language  
5 is, and commit to it in writing.

6 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: And I  
7 understand that and we've had some give and  
8 take with your staff. I want to point out  
9 though, in my view, that shouldn't be  
10 necessary. This all should have been  
11 negotiated and part of the lease agreement  
12 back when the county was going in one room  
13 and discussing it with you and closing the  
14 door and going back and talking to MSG, that  
15 this all should have been part of the  
16 language at that point.

17 It shouldn't come down to, my  
18 caucus negotiating an agreement with you at  
19 the last minute that really kind of makes --  
20 adds salt to the wound for me.

21 MR. RATNER: I hear you.

22 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: But I do  
23 want to say for the record that you have  
24 been very forthcoming, your staff has been a  
25 pleasure to work with, and I believe we are

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 going to get to closure on this.

3 Unfortunately, we couldn't get to  
4 it today. I had intended when the day  
5 started to vote against the lease if we  
6 couldn't reach an agreement by the time we  
7 started deliberating today but, because of  
8 what I sense as being the sincerity and the  
9 seriousness of your staff and you, I do  
10 intend to go forward and vote today, and  
11 that's strengthened by the letter that I  
12 would like to have entered into the record  
13 today which is going to be signed by you  
14 which indicates your commitment, on a best  
15 efforts basis, and that's standard  
16 commercial language, to award 20 percent of  
17 the contracts to MWBE certified by Nassau  
18 County or by the state.

19 MR. RATNER: Yes, yes, yes.  
20 How's that? The answer is yes.

21 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: And over the  
22 course of the next -- or by the end of the  
23 year, we will both initiate and conclude  
24 discussions around establishing a mechanism  
25 and reporting process for verifying that you

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 live up to your verbal commitments that you  
3 are expressing today.

4 MR. RATNER: Yes, and I honestly  
5 would be unhappy if we didn't have something  
6 like that in writing and a goal to work for.

7 Look, we are the other half of  
8 that lease, so, yes, the county may have  
9 ignored it, so unfortunately we did too and  
10 I apologize for that. We take  
11 responsibility too.

12 But having done that, let's  
13 correct it, and we will correct it.

14 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: And just for  
15 the record, there is probably a list of ten  
16 specific provisions I asked for today, your  
17 group did not say no, but what they did say  
18 was, we are just getting that this morning  
19 and we haven't had the time to really review  
20 it and make sure that we can really sign on  
21 to this and commit to it and I appreciate  
22 that. You need some time to reflect on it  
23 and I appreciate the fact that you're also  
24 taking it very seriously. You could've just  
25 signed on to it and said, we are going to do

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 this and then not have done it.

3 But those ten or so elements that  
4 I would like to see agreed to have to do  
5 with, just to categorize them so everybody  
6 knows, have to do with insuring that MWBEs  
7 are aware that these contract opportunities  
8 exist. You can do that through advertising.  
9 I would also like to see you do that by  
10 sending written notification to everyone  
11 that's been certified by the Nassau County  
12 Minority Affairs Department so that they  
13 know that that opportunity exists.

14 MR. RATNER: So, again, without  
15 specifics, but that having been said, look,  
16 I'm as committed as you are to get this done  
17 right. We have a tremendous amount of  
18 experience, more than anybody in the state  
19 at getting this kind of participation for 28  
20 years, and it is very important, not only to  
21 our company, but to me personally, as you  
22 know.

23 We will do the very best job with  
24 you to get it done. We have all kinds of --  
25 we know which contracts, where there's not a

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 sufficient number of contracts, so we will  
3 make it up in another area. We know how to  
4 split contracts in a kind of way to make  
5 sure to get minorities in. So we are very  
6 experienced and we'll do the very best to  
7 work together.

8 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: I hope you  
9 don't take these comments personally.

10 MR. RATNER: The opposite, glad  
11 for it.

12 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: Very good.  
13 We've talked about your commitment you made  
14 at the Barclays Center and the fact that you  
15 exceeded what your commitment level was.

16 But we haven't had that  
17 experience on Long Island. And I have dealt  
18 with a lot of developers who make  
19 commitments to do certain things in regard  
20 to minority hiring and utilization of women  
21 owned firms, and what we continually get  
22 back is, we couldn't find those firms. We  
23 sent out advertisements and no one  
24 responded. So I just want to make sure  
25 you're proactive in both your advertising

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 and reaching out to those firms. I  
3 understand you know how to do this, but we  
4 need to get that in writing.

5 MR. RATNER: You see my  
6 frustrating face not at what you're saying  
7 but the fact that there is no reason why  
8 companies can't do it. From the day we  
9 started we've seen this, seen pass through  
10 contracts by other companies which means  
11 that there's some not real company behind  
12 there. We've seen all kinds of things.  
13 We've really perfected it to the extent  
14 possible.

15 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: Not only do  
16 I believe you're going to do it because it's  
17 the right thing to do, but it's also good  
18 for your business. Any time you can expand  
19 your universe of suppliers, you get more  
20 expertise --

21 MR. RATNER: Good for my soul.

22 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: -- and you  
23 get more opportunity to drive the price down  
24 and get more competitors providing bids to  
25 you.



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 So just to complete the kind of  
3 thought process about what kinds of things  
4 I'd like to see; awareness, proactive  
5 attempt on your part to identify minority  
6 vendors and women vendors, make them aware  
7 of this project; that they be given due  
8 consideration to bid on these projects,  
9 which means that they get an appropriate  
10 amount of time to respond to the bid  
11 requests, that they are given the  
12 opportunity to look at plans, blueprints  
13 perhaps so they can construct a bid that is  
14 meaningful and meets your needs, and you  
15 agree with that?

16 MR. RATNER: Yes. Actually,  
17 Linda Chiarelli who runs our whole program,  
18 our supervisor, can talk to very specifics,  
19 I don't know if you want to get those  
20 specifics, all those things are already  
21 done, I'm sure. Here's Linda Chiarelli.

22 MS. CHIARELLA: Hi. We have an  
23 outreach program that we've implement on  
24 most -- all of our projects. I have been  
25 working with Bruce and Forest City for 20

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 years now. We reach out to the community.  
3 We include all the documents in the bid  
4 process, to the extent that anyone wants  
5 additional walk-thrus or for us to sit down  
6 with the, we do that.

7 When we sit with our trade  
8 contractors, we have regular meetings that  
9 we help target different scopes within their  
10 trades that can be broken out to make it  
11 more advantageous for MWBE bidding.

12 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: Thank you.  
13 And this is just the last general category  
14 of items I'd like to see agreed to when we  
15 get to the specifics is a reporting process,  
16 so we can understand what efforts you have  
17 taken to identify minority contractors so we  
18 don't have a situation where you come back  
19 and say, we couldn't achieve what's been  
20 committed to. And we just want you to be  
21 able to say why, and if, in fact, there is  
22 good reason, we will understand that. But  
23 we need to have some reporting to show us  
24 that.

25 MR. RATNER: Not a problem.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: And then,  
3 finally, periodic reports monthly or  
4 quarterly that indicate where you are  
5 towards achieving the goals are committing  
6 to. And then a final report that indicates  
7 what you've actually achieved.

8 MR. RATNER: Yes, no problem at  
9 all. How often we do it is every couple of  
10 months. We did it on the arena. We have  
11 done voluntary reporting even when not  
12 required, as in the case of Barclays too,  
13 but we do it voluntary, even if it's not  
14 required, we do reports at the end of every  
15 job.

16 So we will do it on a regular  
17 basis, I don't know whether it will be  
18 quarterly or every other month or whatever,  
19 but we will do that and happy to do it.

20 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: We  
21 appreciate that. And, again, I understand  
22 that I have been told that your track record  
23 in Brooklyn has been outstanding in this  
24 regard, and so we really look forward to  
25 working and partnering with you on this,

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 what I think is a very important initiative.  
3 Although you have not signed it  
4 yet, when it is signed, hopefully today  
5 before you go, I want to put the letter in,  
6 put it into the record that we have agreed  
7 to these things in global concept.

8 MR. RATNER: Great. And I hope  
9 it will be a model for what comes forward  
10 going forth in this county on how it should  
11 be done right.

12 LEGISLATOR TROIANO: Thank you,  
13 Mr. Ratner.

14 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Legislator  
15 Denenberg.

16 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Thank you.  
17 Thank you for being here, Mr. Ratner. I  
18 also wanted to thank the County Executive  
19 and also the Chief Deputy County Executive  
20 for all being here acknowledging how  
21 important this lease is and how important  
22 the hub development, concentrating on the  
23 Nassau Veterans Memorial Coliseum and the  
24 plaza development, as you call it, is to the  
25 future of Nassau County.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 First and foremost, just  
3 something I didn't really hear anyone ask,  
4 so I'm going to ask you.

5 In the new Nassau Veterans  
6 Memorial Coliseum, what is planned or is  
7 there a plan for a convention center? Are  
8 we just utilizing the existing promenade and  
9 exhibition hall? A lot of people  
10 complained. Even though there is always a  
11 lot of exhibits there, that it's really just  
12 a basement. So I don't know what the plan  
13 is with respect to the convention center.

14 MR. RATNER: We honestly didn't  
15 spend probably the amount of time we could  
16 have should have spent on it, and it is  
17 something that I think is a tremendous  
18 asset.

19 I think there's a lot to be done  
20 with it. Right now how many programs do we  
21 have, we only have 13, but we are going to  
22 work on that. We didn't extensively  
23 honestly look at it. Obviously Mr. Wang  
24 owns the hotel, that hotel is an excellent  
25 hotel in terms of it has 600 and some rooms.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 It has some conference space. Maybe we  
3 increase the conference space. The idea is  
4 to try to make that a place that people  
5 really want to come to. That's for our  
6 economics also, us getting more people there  
7 to make that a special place. We will  
8 continue to look at that.

9 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: I have  
10 combed through the agreement and looking at  
11 the number of events, of course, that you  
12 were talking about, up to 300 events, 13 say  
13 exhibition hall, rentals/trade shows say  
14 six, so that's what I'm thinking might be in  
15 the area of what we call the convention  
16 center, exhibition hall now.

17 But in terms of actual  
18 construction and the size -- are you calling  
19 it a convention center or exhibition hall,  
20 and how are we changing the existing  
21 exhibition hall, are we making it bigger?

22 MR. RATNER: We're calling it an  
23 exhibition hall, is that right still, Jim?

24 MR. LESTER: The current plan is  
25 to really update it, to repair it, and

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 operate it in a first class manner as it is  
3 part of the Coliseum which we need to  
4 operate in the first class manner.

5 And then Bruce is right, we need  
6 to go back and look at it further to see  
7 what has to be done beyond upgrading it and  
8 repairing it and making it function better.

9 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Going  
10 become to I guess earlier bids, going way  
11 back even at the time of the Lighthouse  
12 Project, even when we were talking about two  
13 years ago a redone arena, people had come  
14 and actually made statements that to have a  
15 real first class, as the term that was just  
16 used, first class convention center, you  
17 really need 75,000 square feet and high  
18 ceilings. I couldn't find how high the  
19 ceilings needed to be, but I combed back  
20 through the notes and the number that jut  
21 out to me was 75,000 square feet for a first  
22 class exhibition/convention center. Are we  
23 expanding it to that size?

24 MR. RATNER: It's 60 now which my  
25 guess if 75, 60 would probably do. I don't

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Full Legislature/9-23-13

know, honestly, we would have to bring in a partner, and the partners that we've already spoken to are Marriott, and we are very close relationship with Marriott, and Marriott would be the right company if they -- if we talked to them maybe some months ago, and they would be the right company because they already operate the hotel and it's important to have a hotel associated with it because what happens is -- when a convention comes or a show comes, they're going to want to book rooms.

So we have a very close relationship with Marriott in lots of kinds of ways. They're even one of our sponsors of our arena. So my real thinking, it's not in the lease and haven't really discussed it was, over the next six months to a year, talk to Marriott and figure out how to really make that thing something more than it is.

I want to add, the other aspect is, the real movement today is towards conference centers because one of the things



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 that the hotel does, has some conference  
3 space. Part of it the exhibition ought to  
4 also be used for conferences, if that's  
5 possible because that's where there's not  
6 enough conference space in this whole  
7 region. But it's really to be pursued  
8 honestly in the future for us, in the next  
9 six months to a year.

10 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: So a quick  
11 answer is, there will still be an exhibition  
12 hall?

13 MR. RATNER: Yes.

14 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Whether  
15 it's going to be changed from the existing  
16 one right now, the plan is to keep it pretty  
17 much so the same, but it's something that in  
18 the next six months that you might look to  
19 expand for business purposes.

20 MR. RATNER: It's exciting. It's  
21 an exciting opportunity. We would do it,  
22 probably even if you hadn't brought it up  
23 we'd probably come back and say maybe this  
24 is something that we wanted to do. But we  
25 would need to spend more time on it.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: I would  
3 encourage you to really look at the  
4 convention center. You know, it's a little  
5 disappointing that the convention center is  
6 not being expanded, but I do think that  
7 that's one of our goals with Hofstra right  
8 there and the community college, Molloy,  
9 there's a lot of reasons for there to be  
10 exhibitions, conferences, conventions, in a  
11 wide field of academics or other  
12 professional type of networking or  
13 professional shows.

14 There once was a talk of a  
15 semi-conductor show being here instead of in  
16 Boston, but that was a long time ago. So I  
17 would like to see not giving up on the  
18 convention center aspect. Because without  
19 the major league time, even with the minor  
20 league team, I think that we can have 300  
21 events every year that would bring in a lot  
22 more business if they're two, three day  
23 conventions and conferences that would go a  
24 lot more for our economy than even the big  
25 events that are only one night as opposed to

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 two to four days.

3 MR. RATNER: I'm aware of that  
4 and we have worked on some kind of project,  
5 but thank you.

6 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Is there a  
7 big part of the fee that I see, both for --  
8 certainly for NEC with 88 percent going to  
9 you and for the county 12 percent is the  
10 parking fees.

11 Has there been any discussion of  
12 what the parking fees should be, the amount?

13 MR. RATNER: Jim, do you want to  
14 comment on that? This is James Lester, he's  
15 the senior vice president of our company.

16 MR. LESTER: The pricing is I  
17 think dictated, and Brett can speak to this  
18 as well, dictated to some extent by the  
19 ticket price of the event. So obviously you  
20 can't charge \$30 when the ticket price is  
21 \$15. But the range is from 10 to 30  
22 depending on the type of the event. And the  
23 county has held back some spaces at \$20 for  
24 larger events. So we need to have --

25 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Are you

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 saying it's going to be flexible depending  
3 on the ticket price of the event?

4 MR. LESTER: That's right.

5 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: I don't  
6 know if it is right now. When I go to  
7 Islanders or to concerts, I notice it's  
8 always the same set price. And then  
9 sometimes it goes from that set price to  
10 virtually waved for smaller events. So  
11 that's something I was going to suggest that  
12 there should be some middle ground and some  
13 flexibility depending on the event.

14 MR. LESTER: I think that's the  
15 intent.

16 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Let me ask  
17 about timing. I understand it's two to five  
18 years for the Coliseum, the Veterans  
19 Memorial Coliseum redevelopment and, with  
20 respect to the Coliseum plaza improvement,  
21 the other 145,000 square feet of  
22 development, and, to me, it's a little bit  
23 -- I would love to see more, because there  
24 was a time the Lighthouse was 2 million,  
25 what the town of Hempstead approved in its

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 plan that came out late '09 was about 1.2.  
3 So this 145,000 square feet is a something a  
4 little more than ten percent of what you  
5 could do. So I would love to see more.

6 I understand this only commits to  
7 the 145,000 square feet and the Coliseum  
8 itself. What is the timing for the other  
9 development?

10 MR. RATNER: The time of the  
11 development is, as I said, we will start in  
12 August of '15, and it will take 18 months  
13 for the retail, and 15 months for the  
14 Coliseum. So, again, it would start August  
15 15, 2015. You add 15 months and 18 months  
16 to that and you come out by the final day.  
17 By the end of '16.

18 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: For  
19 everything?

20 MR. RATNER: For everything.  
21 Well, 18 months, the very beginning of '17  
22 for the retail.

23 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: So you  
24 don't see it being done in phases, first the  
25 arena, then the retail, then the movie

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 theater, amphitheater. Well, I don't know  
3 what we are looking at for the amphitheater  
4 now, but you explained what it was.

5 MR. RATNER: Yes.

6 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: All  
7 started at the same time?

8 MR. RATNER: Yes. Approximately.

9 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: The  
10 veteran monument as well?

11 MR. RATNER: Correct. Yes. And  
12 when I say the same time, maybe a couple of  
13 months later but within the same few month  
14 time frame.

15 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: And for  
16 parking and traffic, I guess you might be  
17 flexible, but right now we're envisioning  
18 everything going at once?

19 MR. RATNER: That's correct.

20 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: I think  
21 that's very important. Once we have the  
22 financing in place, move forward after the  
23 Islander lease is up, which is not just the  
24 Islander lease, so we're hoping right now we  
25 can start at that two year period?

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 MR. RATNER: Yes.

3 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Thanks.

4 Just for the record, I know at least  
5 Legislator Whitton and Legislator Nicoletto  
6 brought this up, but the language itself I  
7 think is important with respect to the  
8 contingency clause.

9 I understand that good faith  
10 obligations permeate all agreements, but it  
11 isn't so much -- let me just read it:

12 Tenant, meaning NEC, shall have  
13 received binding commitments in form,  
14 reasonably satisfactory to tenant and  
15 landlord for all benefits required by  
16 tenant, and all financing deemed necessary  
17 by tenant in order to perform the work  
18 solely with regard to the Coliseum  
19 improvements, et cetera.

20 My concern is not just that the  
21 financing and commitments be in the form  
22 reasonably satisfactory to tenant, to me, I  
23 guess as an attorney, all financing deemed  
24 necessary by tenant.

25 Now, whatever good faith is in

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 there, all financing deemed necessary is the  
3 financing that you solely, you, as the  
4 tenant, deem necessary.

5 So, just on the record, what is  
6 that?

7 MR. RATNER: It's probably 50 or  
8 60 percent of the project cost as a minimum.

9 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: And I  
10 heard everything else you said, that you're  
11 here to build, not here to tie us up.

12 So you think at least a minimum  
13 of 50 to 60 percent of the project cost,  
14 which is what, in terms of real dollars?

15 MR. RATNER: In the case of the  
16 Coliseum, it's 50 to 60 million. In the  
17 case of the arena, it's a little trickier  
18 because a lot of the work is done by the  
19 tenant. What's it about, Jim?

20 MR. LESTER: The project breaks  
21 down in a couple of different ways, it's  
22 \$100 million. Then there's a retail project  
23 that's about \$70 million, excluding the  
24 Fillmore. The Fillmore is about 30 million.  
25 And then \$30 million is done by the tenants



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 themselves.

3 So I guess you could think of it  
4 as \$100 million for the Coliseum.

5 MR. RATNER: Total cost of which  
6 50 to 60 percent we'd look for financing.

7 MR. LESTER: Another \$100 million  
8 for the retail including the Fillmore and  
9 that would be also 50 to 60 percent  
10 financed. And the rest would be built out  
11 by the tenants. That would be 30 million.

12 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Thank you.  
13 I do have another question that I don't  
14 believe you can answer, but don't go far. I  
15 don't know if this is for Robert or who this  
16 is for.

17 Is there anyone here from the  
18 comptroller's office? Has anyone, whether  
19 it's yourself, anyone up here, anyone from  
20 the administration? I received -- I want to  
21 complement Maurice Chalmers, I received the  
22 OLBR report, but considering this is part of  
23 the -- as the county executive said, one of  
24 the biggest leases, biggest contracts that  
25 we're going to see. I haven't seen anything

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 from the comptroller's office evaluating  
3 this. Has anyone?

4 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Did anyone  
5 request it?

6 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: I know I  
7 mentioned it last time when I was talking to  
8 Mr. Chalmers, I said I would like to see it  
9 from the comptroller.

10 CHIEF DEPUTY COUNTY EXEC WALKER:  
11 As we do with all of our leases, obviously  
12 the comptroller will play a vital role and  
13 it will be forwarded to him as it is in  
14 every other case once it's passed and he  
15 will make a -- I think the numbers speak for  
16 themselves. I think this is a very good  
17 financial arrangement for Nassau County.

18 The office of Legislative Budget  
19 Review and Mr. Chalmers did a great job. I  
20 think it was spelled out very clearly. The  
21 report from KPMG and also the report from  
22 PFM speaks to the numbers and I think the  
23 numbers are a great financial -- and I would  
24 like to say this again, this goes back to  
25 the decision the county executive made early

1                   Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2     on with both negotiating with both MSG and  
3     NEC at the same time, because all we did was  
4     really we took two great, two giants in the  
5     industry and, if you saw where the lease  
6     started from day one, and, obviously,  
7     they're sitting here now realizing they left  
8     a lot of money on the table, but we are  
9     grateful, Bruce, that you did, and so are  
10    the residents of the county, it's a great  
11    financial -- we released the financial  
12    burdens we currently have in terms of cost,  
13    operations, repair, capital improvements,  
14    and also taking the dollars that we are  
15    going to be taking in. So I don't want to  
16    speak on behalf of the comptroller, but I  
17    think -- I look to Comptroller Maragos to  
18    approve the lease and --

19                   LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: I don't  
20    think -- I would say the comptroller doesn't  
21    vote on the lease at all, so getting it  
22    after we voted on it is sort of -- that's  
23    after it's done.

24                   Usually, as one of the items that  
25    we could look at, such as with the OLBR

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 report and everything else you did your due  
3 diligence together, PFM, et cetera, that the  
4 comptroller reviews contracts and leases  
5 before we approve them to opine on them. To  
6 give an opinion after the fact is really not  
7 useful.

8 I'm prepared to vote yes right  
9 now, but to cross all my I's and dot all my  
10 Ts, if there was a comptroller report on  
11 this big lease, you know, in the past we  
12 typically get that.

13 I do have something else for  
14 Mr. Ratner, but, Rob, maybe you can answer  
15 this as well. Mr. Ratner, maybe if you  
16 would come back up?

17 CHIEF DEPUTY COUNTY EXEC WALKER:  
18 Giving him a break, you're making him stand  
19 for so long. Maybe give him some skates.

20 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Can't  
21 blame me. I've only been asking for not  
22 even 10 minutes.

23 Last area of questions. With  
24 respect to the real estate tax exemption  
25 that's in the IDA assistance in Schedule D,

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 how do we provide funding to the local  
3 community, the local fire departments or  
4 schools as an offset?

5 CHIEF DEPUTY COUNTY EXEC WALKER:  
6 So as we do with every IDA project, they --

7 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: They'll be  
8 a pilot?

9 CHIEF DEPUTY COUNTY EXEC WALKER:  
10 They will complete an application for the  
11 IDA. I think in this proposal which was  
12 great, they acknowledge the importance of  
13 paying a pilot that will ramp up over the  
14 years to our local school district and it's  
15 done as every other pilot is performed, that  
16 number will be set by the board of the IDA.  
17 The good thing to note is that people talk  
18 about the unions and the PLAs. There is  
19 three members of our local unions on the IDA  
20 board right now, half of the IDA board is  
21 actually made up of union membership. So  
22 they will go through that process.

23 Once it's determined, that dollar  
24 amount will be sent to all the taxing  
25 jurisdictions, every one of them. So they

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 will actually be receiving dollars that they  
3 have not received before.

4 Thankfully in this case no cost  
5 to the schools as the Coliseum is not going  
6 to be home to the students and things of  
7 that nature that they're going to be  
8 attending schools and the Uniondale  
9 community is not going to, again, have to  
10 expand and we already know the school  
11 district needs every dollar it can get and  
12 deserves.

13 So, in this case, it will go  
14 through as every other pilot did and it will  
15 be real estate takes, again, paid for on the  
16 Coliseum, the plaza improvements.

17 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Thank you.

18 Mr. Ratner, I just wanted to say  
19 one last thing to you. I can't help but do  
20 this. Linda Chiarelli who works for you and  
21 I both went to school together. We  
22 graduated as engineers from Cooper Union  
23 together. I can just say, she's done a lot  
24 better than me. She is working for you and  
25 I'm sitting here.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 MR. RATNER: I want you to know,  
3 you went to a great school, and if you kept  
4 up with her, you're pretty good. You are  
5 both a lawyer, an engineer. An architect.  
6 I think she's all three. Brilliant and  
7 wonderful woman and she's done a great job.

8 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: I did  
9 those three too. Thank you very much.

10 MR. RATNER: Thank you as well.

11 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Last, but  
12 not least, Legislator Bosworth.

13 LEGISLATOR BOSWORTH: Thank you,  
14 Presiding Officer. Well, it's been a long  
15 afternoon and certainly thank the county  
16 executive for coming down and making his  
17 presentation and, Mr. Blumenfeld, we thank  
18 you as well.

19 Mr. Ratner, you have been doing  
20 the yeoman's job of presenting this and I  
21 will tell you it's been so reassuring and  
22 comforting to hear your great commitment to  
23 our county, our communities, and to the  
24 people of Nassau County. It's lovely.

25 I know Legislator Troiano was

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 speaking to you about a number of very  
3 important issues and he at one point said  
4 something that it was good for the  
5 enterprise and bringing in a lot of untapped  
6 resources, and, under your breath I heard  
7 you said, and it's good for my soul.

8 MR. RATNER: Yes.

9 LEGISLATOR BOSWORTH: And what  
10 you're doing is good for our souls. So I  
11 thank you so much for being here and for  
12 your commitment to all of us.

13 I did have one question. Really  
14 is only one. In terms of the choice between  
15 actually tearing the facility down and  
16 making the commitment to renovate it, I know  
17 that has a lot of unforeseen pitfalls, as  
18 Legislator DeRiggi-Whitton had mentioned,  
19 that you might not be able to anticipate.  
20 But one of the things that has been  
21 identified in the standing structure was  
22 some asbestos that was found there.

23 So I've had a lot of dealings  
24 with asbestos and abatement, so I was  
25 wondering if that's figured into your cost



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 and the possibility that you might find a  
3 lot more of that as you uncover different  
4 parts of it during renovation?

5 MR. RATNER: It's in our costs  
6 and we have a contingency for it. We've  
7 done a preliminary analysis based on what  
8 the county gave us, and based on our own  
9 analysis. So it is in our cost and we have  
10 a contingency for it and I think it should  
11 be fine.

12 Obviously we have done a lot of  
13 asbestos work over the years. Frankly, more  
14 complicated situations than this.

15 LEGISLATOR BOSWORTH: Thank you.  
16 Like I said, there was only one.

17 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Judy,  
18 you're a lady of your word.

19 Mr. Ratner, first of all, let me  
20 say thank you to you and your staff, Mr.  
21 Blumenfeld as well, for a very comprehensive  
22 presentation today. I would say most, all  
23 of the concerns were addressed by our  
24 colleagues here and you answered with  
25 frankness, transparency, and of course the

1                   Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 fact that this project is well overdue, and  
3 I have to say that I'm happy it's going to  
4 happen because I know my colleagues here are  
5 going to support it. I just feel it. From  
6 the questions I've heard and the answers  
7 you've given, there is support on this  
8 panel.

9                   The other thing is, this project,  
10 and I think all my colleagues realize this,  
11 this will serve as a catalyst for the  
12 development of the rest of the property.

13                   So thank you for your  
14 presentation today. Thank you, Mr.  
15 Blumenfeld, thank you to all of the staff  
16 for the great job you've done. Thank you,  
17 Mr. Walker and County Executive Mangano for  
18 his presentation. Job well done.

19                   And I think now, guess what, we  
20 will hear now, and you can sit down, the  
21 residents now will be asking questions or  
22 registering their concerns.

23                   I have a few of them and I  
24 apologize for them having to sit here for so  
25 long, but, guess what, you have been

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 educated as well as we have this afternoon  
3 and I think some of your concerns may have  
4 been allayed.

5 MR. RATNER: First, let me thank  
6 you all, and thank all the members, both  
7 sides of the aisle, as they say. It has  
8 been a pleasure working on this and we will  
9 meet our commitments and get it done and get  
10 it down right.

11 I would like to thank all the  
12 people I'm lucky enough to work with, the  
13 Blumenfelds and all the people that are in  
14 my company. I always say, my best days are  
15 when I come in and see everybody I get to  
16 work with. So thank you all.

17 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Mr.  
18 Ratner, I too, I was born and raised in  
19 Brooklyn, and I know the Barclays Center and  
20 I Metrotech, and I know that whole Flatbush  
21 avenue has been rejuvenated because of your  
22 efforts and I see that coming to the Nassau  
23 Coliseum.

24 MR. RATNER: Thank you.

25 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 Now, Sol Weinstein, are you still  
3 here? He's not here. Michael Kola? Neil  
4 Lewis, did you stay? Jean Wood Sestions?  
5 Sorry. Dennis Jones.

6 MR. JONES: Thank you, Presiding  
7 Officer Gonsalves, and all the other  
8 legislators, Mr. Ratner and the group, what  
9 a great presentation that we did here.

10 I just came to offer just a  
11 little bit some of the things that I didn't  
12 really hear too much about, and that's about  
13 any community benefit agreements. We did  
14 have some sort of discussion on it but it  
15 really wasn't as extensive as I would think.

16 I wanted to ask that all of the  
17 legislators kind of reach out to look up,  
18 Albany law school did a legal study on  
19 community benefit agreements just so that  
20 you could familiarize yourself with it. It  
21 just so happens that in the 2010, 2011  
22 study, that the Ratner Group is in it in  
23 regards to the Atlantic yards.

24 Just to sum up what that research  
25 did talk about, it was that CBA, when CBAs

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 are negotiated by a broad base and exclusive  
3 coalitions, that they are truly  
4 representative of community interests, and  
5 such agreements result in community planning  
6 vision that dramatically differs from the  
7 existing traditional comprehensive plan.  
8 And implementing regulations for the area.

9 It indicates that existing  
10 governmental planning process may be  
11 inadequate and that most appropriate action  
12 for a local government is to take -- may be  
13 to reform the way that it plans.

14 It did discuss transparency which  
15 we talked about here today, accountability,  
16 which was mentioned, and meaningful public  
17 participation which is very, very important  
18 here.

19 It did outline seven areas that I  
20 hope that the Ratner Group would listen to,  
21 and that is making planning information  
22 easily accessible on line, and that  
23 designated public facilities provide hearing  
24 notices that are actually designed to reach  
25 impacted community members, hold hearings in

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Full Legislature/9-23-13

locations close to impacted neighborhoods and, at times of the day when community members are likely to be available, hold additional public meetings, workshops and other events in order to reach a diverse cross section of the community members, partner with existing neighborhood associations, civic organizations, and faith based entities. Make clear that planners will be responsive to neighborhood residents' concerns and desires, and express a commitment to ensure that the community based planning is an integral part of the planning process.

I, again, thank Mr. Ratner and his group for attending and giving such a great presentation. Thank you.

CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you, Mr. Jones. Reginald Benjamin? James Sharpe? Good afternoon.

MR. SKLAR: Good afternoon. It's nice to attend this. First time I've been at a hearing here. We had about 1,000 NMBE's and I see now that the Coliseum is

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 gone, or the Islanders are gone, not back  
3 again.

4 David, you brought out a great  
5 point. You started to ask about taxes. And  
6 I think taxes here are a real important  
7 thing and I hope everybody considers that.  
8 Did anybody calculate yet what the school  
9 district is going to end up if this gets  
10 built to its fullest? Talking about  
11 somewhere in the neighborhood, if I'm not  
12 wrong, about 10 to \$15 million, which might  
13 make Uniondale the most elite school  
14 district in the county, to receive \$15  
15 million on top of all their other money, it  
16 would be real nice.

17 I would like to ask the  
18 legislator a question. Did anybody here  
19 ever go see a Jay-Z concert or his wife?  
20 How this man ever did this, I don't know,  
21 but he hooked up with this Jay-Z, with him  
22 and his wife, the hottest people for the  
23 next 25 years. They can outsell the Beatles  
24 and also Elvis Presley. They only made  
25 about \$89 million last year. And Jay-Z

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 happened to do something, which he found a  
3 better way to make money, he was a limited  
4 partner in the Barclays Center and he went  
5 out of it, not because he couldn't make  
6 money, he found a better way to make money.  
7 He's now representing some of the biggest  
8 basketball stars and some of the biggest  
9 entertainers in the country.

10 So I only want to ask the  
11 legislature one thing to put in this thing  
12 here. Just give me 200 tickets for every  
13 concert, and at the end of the year, I'll  
14 bring an extra million dollars of rent back  
15 to the county. That's how hot these people  
16 are. The last concert she did in New Jersey  
17 attracted 15,000 people. The first ticket  
18 sold for 100 to \$200, and the aftermarket  
19 was five to \$700. They have a great great  
20 following.

21 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you,  
22 Mr. Sklar. Now, the last speaker on this  
23 item is James Sharpe. Did he leave? That's  
24 the guy that left. Fine. Guess what?  
25 These are the only speakers on this item and



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 this is the moment we've been waiting for.  
3 I just had a "thank God."

4 It is time now, all of the  
5 legislators please take their seats.

6 MR. O'KANE: Can I make a  
7 comment?

8 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Sure.  
9 Name and address for the record.

10 MR. O'KANE: My name is Dick  
11 O'Kane and I'm with the Nassau Suffolk  
12 Building Trades. Formerly I was with the  
13 ironworkers in New York City and I the  
14 utmost pleasure of working with Mr. Ratner  
15 building the Barclays Center.

16 My only regret when that thing  
17 finished, I wish he had seven more on line  
18 moving forward in my jurisdiction where I  
19 had it. Anything Mr. Ratner tells you,  
20 anybody who has any reservations about him  
21 moving forward with this job, put them away.  
22 This job is going to happen. He is going to  
23 do a great job. You'll be asking him to  
24 come in and do another one. It's just  
25 absolutely -- it's going to be a pleasure

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 for it to happen in this jurisdiction.

3 The membership, I represent  
4 60,000 people. It's all about jobs now  
5 today. That's what this is going to do,  
6 jobs, jobs, jobs, and more jobs.

7 So, Mr. Ratner, thank you. I  
8 look forward to working with you.

9 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Thank you  
10 very much. I'm ready now. I don't believe  
11 we need a roll call at this point, after  
12 what, three hours of deliberating?

13 LEGISLATOR BECKER: I just want  
14 to say that it was a great pleasure,  
15 personally, to meet with Mr. Ratner and his  
16 team, and, again, I would like to compliment  
17 our County Executive Ed Mangano. This is an  
18 amazing moment for Nassau County.

19 I've been here, one of the  
20 original Nassau County legislators. There's  
21 a few of us who are left. The property, the  
22 hub, is something that we all wanted to see  
23 for many years be realized and be an asset  
24 to Nassau County.

25 The loss of the Islanders was

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 devastating, but this is a new day. I'm  
3 just so proud, number one, of our county  
4 executive who is in my opinion the most  
5 engaged county executive we've had since I  
6 have been here, and I'm proud of him and  
7 proud of his leadership and I'm proud of his  
8 team and I think it's a great moment for  
9 Nassau County and I want to compliment the  
10 leadership of our county executive once  
11 more. Thank you so much.

12 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Now, I  
13 believe in fairness. Since Mr. Becker had  
14 his turn, I said to Mr. Wink he can have his  
15 turn, so it's one and one. That's it. Then  
16 we're taking the vote.

17 LEGISLATOR WINK: Thank you,  
18 Madam Presiding Officer. A lot of the  
19 issues I raised in committee have been more  
20 than addressed both since committee meetings  
21 and here today. So I didn't feel the need  
22 to actually raise them again. There are  
23 still questions and there are still concerns  
24 that I have. The Newsday story highlighted  
25 many of the positives and some of the

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 potential pitfalls associated with this  
3 project.

4 I think this is a worthy project  
5 to go forward I think it has the potential  
6 to be a great transitional and  
7 transformational project for Nassau County,  
8 so I'm going to support it.

9 I also would hasten to add that  
10 I'm glad that this is not subject to \$400  
11 million of taxpayer money. I'm glad that  
12 Mr. Ratner and Forest City are in fact  
13 footing the bill for this and it's a far far  
14 better thing than the alternatives that we  
15 have dealt with in the past.

16 So, for that reason, and even  
17 with the concerns I have about the finances  
18 and the contingencies and whatnot, I too  
19 will be supporting this today. Thank you.

20 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Now it's  
21 time for the vote. Mr. Ratner, bear with  
22 us.

23 LEGISLATOR SOLAGES: I will make  
24 my remarks just brief. As the second to  
25 youngest person on this body, next to my

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 colleague, Mr. Venditto, we yearn for more  
3 affordable housing for our young  
4 professionals. We would desire this plan to  
5 include housing for young professionals but  
6 hopefully this will spawn that.

7 Again, my comments, I reserve my  
8 comments that my colleagues have expressed,  
9 but, I too, look forward to voting for this.  
10 Thank you.

11 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: That is  
12 it. Now, all those in favor of Item 374-13  
13 as amended, please signify by saying aye.

14 (Aye.)

15 Any opposed?

16 (No verbal response.)

17 19 nothing. 19 nothing. Good  
18 job. Good job, Mr. Ratner. I knew it was  
19 going to go more than ten.

20 We are having a brief recess.  
21 Hopefully we can be back by five o'clock.  
22 15 minutes or so. We are now in recess.

23 (Whereupon, the Full Legislative  
24 Committee recessed at 4:45 p.m. and  
25 reconvened at 5:45 p.m.)

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: With the  
3 consent of the minority, I'm going to be  
4 calling a number of items and, of course,  
5 we're not going to be reading those items,  
6 just calling the item number. Is that okay?

7 Okay, we're talking about the  
8 consent calendar, Items 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8,  
9 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18,  
10 skipping 19, we go to 20, 21, 22, 24, 35,  
11 37, 38, 39, 40, 41, 43, 44. Do I have to  
12 repeat?

13 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Yes,  
14 please.

15 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Items 2  
16 through 18, 20, 21, 22, 24, 35, 37, 38, 39,  
17 40, 41, 43, 44.

18 Motion, please.

19 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.

20 LEGISLATOR BELESI: Second.

21 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by  
22 Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator  
23 Belesi. Any other comments, any questions?

24 (No verbal response.)

25 Is there any public comment?

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 (No verbal response.)

3 There being none, all those in  
4 favor of these items signify by saying aye.

5 (Aye.)

6 Any opposed?

7 (No verbal response.)

8 The items pass unanimously.

9 We had several appointments and I  
10 have to say that the individuals were here,  
11 however, with the consent of the minority we  
12 said it would be okay.

13 So it's calendar Item 30 which is  
14 Dr. Ranu to the Youth Board. Calendar Item  
15 31, appointment of Ralph Esposito to VEEB,  
16 Calendar Item 32, the appointment of Matthew  
17 Paccione to the Youth Board, Calendar Item  
18 33, Satish Sood to Soil and Water  
19 Conservation District Board, and Calendar  
20 Item 34, the appointment of Timothy P.  
21 Sullivan to the Deferred Compensation Board.

22 A motion, please.

23 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.

24 LEGISLATOR BELESI: Second.

25 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator  
3 Belesi. Any questions or comments regarding  
4 these appointments?

5 (No verbal response.)

6 Is there any public comment?

7 (No verbal response.)

8 There being none, all those in  
9 favor of these appointments signify by  
10 saying aye.

11 (Aye.)

12 Any opposed?

13 (No verbal response.)

14 The appointments pass  
15 unanimously.

16 Now we have Calendar Item 45,  
17 Clerk Item 291-13, Ordinance Number 108-2013  
18 which is the \$30,600,000 bond ordinance for  
19 termination pay.

20 A motion, please.

21 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.

22 LEGISLATOR BELESI: Second.

23 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by  
24 Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator  
25 Belesi. Any questions or comments on this



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 Item 45? It need not be untabled. Was  
3 placed erroneously.

4 (No verbal response.)

5 Deputy Commissioner, would you  
6 like to comment at all? No. Anyone want to  
7 ask him any questions?

8 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: He learns  
9 not to volunteer.

10 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Is there  
11 any public comment?

12 (No verbal response.)

13 There being none, all those in  
14 favor of Item 45, Clerk Item 291-13 signify  
15 by saying aye.

16 (Aye.)

17 Any opposed?

18 (No verbal response.)

19 The item passes unanimously.

20 Now we have a budget transfer,  
21 correct? We need to do an amendment in the  
22 nature of a substitution.

23 Calendar Item 42, Clerk Item  
24 389-13, which is a budget transfer.

25 A motion, please.

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.

3 LEGISLATOR BELESI: Second.

4 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by

5 Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator

6 Belesi. Now, I need an amendment in the

7 nature of a substitution. It was filed

8 September 10th at 12:43. A motion for the

9 amendment in the nature of a substitution.

10 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.

11 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Second.

12 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by

13 Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator

14 Walker. All those in favor of the amendment

15 in the nature of a substitution signify by

16 saying aye.

17 (Aye.)

18 Any opposed?

19 (No verbal response.)

20 The item as amended. Any

21 comments from the legislators?

22 (No verbal response.)

23 Is there any public comment?

24 (No verbal response.)

25 There being none, all those in

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 favor of Clerk Item 389-13 or Calendar Item  
3 42 signify by saying aye.

4 (Aye.)

5 Any opposed?

6 (No verbal response.)

7 The item passes unanimously.

8 Now we have three non-consent  
9 items. Item 19, Resolution 167 which deals  
10 with the First Precinct. A motion, please.

11 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.

12 LEGISLATOR BELESI: Second.

13 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by  
14 Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator  
15 Belesi. Who is here, Mr. Theofan?

16 MR. MAY: Mr. Theofan, myself,  
17 any questions?

18 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Any  
19 questions regarding this item that deals  
20 with the First Precinct?

21 (No verbal response.)

22 Is there any public comment?

23 (No verbal response.)

24 There being none, all those in  
25 favor of Item 19, Resolution 167 signify by

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 saying aye.

3 (Aye.)

4 Any opposed?

5 (No verbal response.)

6 The item passes unanimously.

7 Now we have Item 23, Resolution  
8 171 which deals with the heart monitors and  
9 defibrillators for the South Hempstead Fire  
10 Department.

11 A motion, please.

12 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.

13 LEGISLATOR BELESI: Second.

14 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by  
15 Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator  
16 Belesi. Any questions regarding Item 23?

17 (No verbal response.)

18 Is there any public comment?

19 (No verbal response.)

20 There being none, all those in  
21 favor of Item 23, Resolution 171-2013  
22 signify by saying aye.

23 (Aye.)

24 Any opposed?

25 (No verbal response.)

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 The item passes unanimously.

3 At this point I'm calling Clerk  
4 Item 396-13, a resolution to authorize the  
5 transfer of appropriations heretofore made  
6 within the budget for the year 2013 with the  
7 police department.

8 A motion, please.

9 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.

10 LEGISLATOR BELESI: Second.

11 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by  
12 Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator  
13 Belesi. Any comments regarding this item?

14 (No verbal response.)

15 Is there any public comment?

16 (No verbal response.)

17 There being none, all those in  
18 favor of Clerk Item 396-13 signify by saying  
19 aye.

20 (Aye.)

21 Any opposed?

22 (No verbal response.)

23 The item passes unanimously.

24 We have a number of items that  
25 have to do with Hotel Motel tax grants and,

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 with your permission, Mr. Kevan, 25, 26, 27,  
3 28, 29, 36. Can we call them all together?

4 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: I think  
5 Legislator Denenberg has some questions on  
6 them.

7 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: First I  
8 need a motion. Am I calling them all  
9 together?

10 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Yes.

11 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: A motion,  
12 please.

13 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.

14 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Second.

15 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by  
16 Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator  
17 Walker. Now, Mr. Denenberg.

18 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: Yes, Mr.  
19 May, at the committees I had a question in  
20 terms of how could Hotel Motel tax grant  
21 money be FEMA reimbursable. I think at the  
22 time the commissioner said some of the  
23 salaries were related to Super Storm Sandy  
24 recovery of facilities but I wasn't sure. I  
25 just wanted assurance that this could be

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 FEMA reimbursable.

3 COMMISSIONER FOSKEY: Yes. Good  
4 afternoon. Carnell Foskey, commissioner of  
5 Nassau County Department of Parks,  
6 Recreation and Museums. Those individuals  
7 were being paid by Hotel Motel. And during  
8 the course of the storm, when they went to  
9 work on FEMA related projects, Hotel Motel  
10 was reimbursed by FEMA.

11 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: So you  
12 expect that this would be as well?

13 COMMISSIONER FOSKEY: If they  
14 work on any FEMA projects that we're  
15 reimbursed, we'll reimburse Hotel Motel, ys.

16 LEGISLATOR DENENBERG: This was  
17 already done?

18 COMMISSIONER FOSKEY: Yes, it was  
19 done already.

20 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Minority  
21 Leader Abrahams.

22 LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: How are  
23 you, Mr. Foskey. It's actually not a  
24 question for you, it's just the topic of  
25 FEMA. When I heard FEMA brought up, I just

1                   Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2       wanted to bring up the fact that Legislator  
3       DeRiggi-Whitton also provided a letter. It  
4       was more in conjunction with FEMA and  
5       cleanup of Super Storm Sandy, which I know  
6       is not related to Hotel Motel tax, but I  
7       just wanted to make sure that the  
8       administration got a copy of the letter that  
9       was sent to the presiding officer, but I  
10      wanted to make sure the administration got a  
11      copy of the letter because, obviously, if we  
12      are talking about FEMA reimbursement, we  
13      want to make sure we're getting every dime  
14      from that cleanup as well.

15                   MR. MAY: Sure. I don't recall  
16      seeing a copy of that letter so if you send  
17      it to my office -- the administration may  
18      have received it. May have sent directly to  
19      Chief Deputy County Executive Walker or  
20      County Executive Mangano.

21                   LEGISLATOR ABRAHAMS: Let me  
22      stand to apologize, you are not cc'd on this  
23      letter. So let's make sure you get a copy  
24      of it now.

25                   MR. MAY: Excellent. Thank you.



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON:  
3 Presiding Officer, may I?

4 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Yes.

5 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: I  
6 have a statement. We just requested that  
7 the comptroller come before the Full Leg at  
8 our next meeting just to testify as to where  
9 we are with not only Looks Great Service but  
10 the other reimbursement.

11 The last I heard it's only going  
12 to be around 40 to 50 percent at this point.  
13 That's really the last information I have  
14 really been given. And we just have to  
15 discuss now that we're talking about the  
16 budget, I just want to see how we are going  
17 to make adjustments for that should that be  
18 the amount that we get.

19 MR. MAY: Did you also send a  
20 copy of that letter to the comptroller?

21 LEGISLATOR DERIGGI-WHITTON: It's  
22 been hand delivered and, again, I think it  
23 would be good for him to come in and testify  
24 in front of us. I know we gave him ample  
25 time to do his review and I think, by now,

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 he should be ready to come forth.

3 MR. MAY: As a separately elected  
4 branch, I can't speak for the comptroller's  
5 office, but if they received a letter, I'm  
6 sure they'll respond appropriately.

7 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: I just  
8 want to reiterate the items that we are  
9 speaking about, Items 25, 26, 27, 28, and  
10 29. They are all Hotel Motel tax grants.

11 Any other comments regarding  
12 those items?

13 (No verbal response.)

14 Is there any public comment?

15 (No verbal response.)

16 There being none, all those in  
17 favor of Items 25, 26, 27, 28 and 29 signify  
18 by saying aye.

19 (Aye.)

20 Any opposed?

21 (No verbal response.)

22 The items pass unanimously.

23 The next item which is on the  
24 non-consent calendar is Item 36, Clerk Item  
25 386-13, a resolution authorizing the release

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 of a surety bond and cash escrow monies for  
3 the Map of the Seasons at East Meadow  
4 subdivision. A motion, please.

5 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.

6 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Second.

7 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by  
8 Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator  
9 Walker. Any questions regarding this item?

10 Is there any public comment?

11 (No verbal response.)

12 There being none, all those in  
13 favor of Item 36, Clerk Item 386-13 -- there  
14 were concerns regarding Clerk Item 386, the  
15 Homeowners Association of the Seasons met  
16 with the developer and they had a whole  
17 check list of items that they agreed they  
18 would take care of, and, therefore, we felt  
19 that this was legitimate for us to put it on  
20 the calendar.

21 Since there is an agreement  
22 between the developer and the Homeowner's  
23 Association. Come up, introduce yourself  
24 please.

25 MR. KATZ: Martin Katz, Division

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 of Planning and Department of Public Works.

3 A week ago today there was a  
4 meeting. All the relevant parties met  
5 including the reps from Engel Burman  
6 including the attorney and the reps from HOA  
7 and the chief building inspector for DPW.

8 A ten item punch-list was  
9 generated and it was agreed on that those  
10 ten items would be taken care of and I think  
11 the HOA was satisfied. If you have any  
12 questions, John O'Dougherty from DPW to  
13 answer them with respect to the items on the  
14 punch-list.

15 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Mr. Katz,  
16 it's my understanding as well, because I  
17 have those ten items that were part of the  
18 punch-list and that there was an agreement  
19 between the developer and the homeowners  
20 association.

21 MR. KATZ: As far as I know, a  
22 verbal agreement, the attorney for Engel  
23 Burman, Dominic Minerva, and it's not  
24 written, but --

25 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Do you

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 want to testify to this? Be my guest.

3 MR. MINERVA: Good evening.

4 Dominic Minerva, Minerva & D'Agostino, 107  
5 South Central Avenue, Valley Stream, New  
6 York, attorney for the Engel Burman Group  
7 and Seasons at Mitchell Field, L.L.C., the  
8 applicant for the bond release. Yes, there  
9 was a verbal agreement to repair those ten  
10 punch-list items. We received a draft  
11 written agreement. The items were supposed  
12 to be complete on Thursday. They actually  
13 postponed it. It should be completed next  
14 week. And we have committed to do those ten  
15 items.

16 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Mr. Katz.

17 MR. KATZ: They are maintenance  
18 items not construction items with respect to  
19 the public improvements.

20 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Would you  
21 mind if I submitted these ten items to the  
22 stenographer?

23 MR. MINERVA: I have no  
24 objection.

25 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: We'll make

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 it part of the record. Okay. All those in  
3 favor of Item 36, Clerk Item 386-13 signify  
4 by saying aye.

5 (Aye.)

6 Any opposed?

7 (No verbal response.)

8 Passes unanimously. We have  
9 several emergencies now and I need  
10 Mr. Clerk, and I will ask if we can dispense  
11 with the reading of the emergencies.

12 LEGISLATOR JACOBS: I move to  
13 dispense with the reading.

14 LEGISLATOR NICOLELLO: I second  
15 that.

16 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: And Mr.  
17 Nicolello going to dispense with the  
18 reading. So we can establish the  
19 emergencies, Mr. Clerk.

20 CLERK MULLER: Would like me to  
21 just read the clerk item number and what the  
22 underlying emergency would be? You need to  
23 vote on the emergency and then on the  
24 underlying item, so you want to establish  
25 the emergency first, just numerically? We

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 can even incorporate it through reference.  
3 I will put it with the court reporter as to  
4 the chart.

5 Clerk Item 342-13, emergency  
6 resolution 193A, 343-13, Emergency  
7 Resolution 33-193B, 345-13, Emergency  
8 Resolution 34-193C, 373-13, Emergency Item  
9 35, Resolution 193D, 375-13, Emergency 36,  
10 Resolution 193E, 376-13, Emergency 37,  
11 Resolution 193F, 377-13, Emergency 38,  
12 Resolution 193G, 378-13, Emergency 39,  
13 Resolution 193H, 379-13, Emergency 40,  
14 Resolution 193I, 380-13, Emergency 41,  
15 Resolution 193J, 381-13, Emergency 42,  
16 Resolution 193K, 382-13, Emergency 43,  
17 Resolution 193L, 384-13, Emergency 44,  
18 Resolution 193M, 406-13, Emergency Item 45,  
19 Resolution 193N, 407-13, Emergency 46,  
20 Resolution 193O, 408-13, Emergency 47,  
21 Resolution 193P, 413-13, Emergency 48,  
22 Resolution 193Q, 414-13, Emergency Item 49,  
23 Resolution 193R, 415-13, Emergency 50,  
24 Ordinance 151A, 416-13, Emergency 51,  
25 Resolution 193S, 417-13, Emergency 52,

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 Ordinance 151B, 418-13, Emergency 53,  
3 Ordinance 151C, 419-13, Emergency 54,  
4 Ordinance 151-D, 420-13, Emergency 55,  
5 Resolution 193T, 427-13, Emergency 56,  
6 Resolution 193U, 428-13, Emergency  
7 Resolution 57, Resolution 193V, 429-13,  
8 Emergency 58, Ordinance 151E, 430-13,  
9 Emergency 59, Resolution 193W, 431-13,  
10 Emergency 60, Emergency Resolution 193-X.

11 What I just read I believe was  
12 given to both sides and also to the county  
13 executive's office. So if there's any  
14 holes, I'm sure they'll correct me  
15 immediately.

16 Motion to establish the  
17 emergency.

18 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.

19 LEGISLATOR WALKER: Second.

20 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by  
21 Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator  
22 Walker. We have established the emergency  
23 for each of these items. All those in favor  
24 of establishing the emergencies signify by  
25 saying aye.



1 Full Legislature/9-23-13

2 (Aye.)

3 Any opposed?

4 (No verbal response.)

5 The emergencies have been  
6 established. Now we can call them  
7 separately and take a vote on them  
8 separately or we can, once again, block the.  
9 Can I block them?

10 CLERK MULLER: That's everything  
11 that county executive submitted to me this  
12 afternoon.

13 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Do me a  
14 favor so I don't have to do it, just call  
15 the items all together.

16 CLERK MULLER: Just numerically,  
17 correct?

18 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Yes.

19 CLERK MULLER: Resolution 193A,  
20 Resolution 193B, Resolution 193C, Resolution  
21 193D, Resolution 193E, Resolution 193F,  
22 Resolution 193G, Resolution 193H, Resolution  
23 193I, Resolution 193J, Resolution 193K,  
24 Resolution 193L, Resolution 193M, Resolution  
25 193N, Resolution 193O, Resolution 193P,

1 Full Legislature/9-23-13  
2 Resolution 193Q, Resolution 193R, Ordinance  
3 151A, Resolution 193S, Ordinance 151B,  
4 Ordinance 151C, Ordinance 151-D, Resolution  
5 193T, Resolution 193U, Resolution 193V,  
6 Ordinance 151E, Resolution 193W, Resolution  
7 193-X.

8 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Motion,  
9 please.

10 LEGISLATOR WALKER: So moved.

11 LEGISLATOR DUNNE: Second.

12 CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by  
13 Legislator Walker, seconded by Legislator  
14 Dunne. Are there any questions regarding  
15 these items?

16 (No verbal response.)

17 There being none, all those in  
18 favor of each of these items that were  
19 called by the clerk signify by saying aye.

20 (Aye.)

21 Any opposed?

22 (No verbal response.)

23 The items pass unanimously. I  
24 think that's the end of the calendar.

25 A motion to adjourn.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Full Legislature/9-23-13

LEGISLATOR DUNNE: So moved.

LEGISLATOR KOPEL: Second.

CHAIRWOMAN GONSALVES: Moved by  
Legislator Dunne, seconded by Legislator  
Kopel. All those in favor of adjourning  
signify by saying aye.

(Aye.)

Any opposed?

(No verbal response.)

This was a unanimous day. The  
only ones who have to stay a little longer  
are those who are on the Rules Committee.

(Whereupon, the Full Legislative  
Committee adjourned at 6:12 p.m.)

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, FRANK GRAY, a Shorthand Reporter and Notary Public in and for the State of New York, do hereby stated:

THAT I attended at the time and place above mentioned and took stenographic record of the proceedings in the above-entitled matter;

THAT the foregoing transcript is a true and accurate transcript of the same and the whole thereof, according to the best of my ability and belief.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand this \_\_\_\_\_ day of \_\_\_\_\_, 2013.

-----

FRANK GRAY